



HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION STAFF REPORT

APPLICATION: CA2017-09

AGENDA ITEM: AR-2

PREPARED BY: Teresa Santilena
Assistant Planner

MEETING DATE: October 25, 2017

TITLE: Certificate of Appropriateness CA2017-09; HL-129/MA-122
505 North Alta Vista Avenue

APPLICANT: Laura and Eric Laun
505 North Alta Vista Avenue
Monrovia, CA 91016

REQUEST: Review the exterior restoration of a single-family Spanish Colonial Revival residence which includes the replacement of non-period windows and one non-period sliding door on the north (rear) elevation. The property is located in the RF (Residential Foothill) zone.

ENVIRONMENTAL DETERMINATION: Categorical Exemption (Class 3)

BACKGROUND: The property located at 505 North Alta Vista Avenue was approved by the City Council in November 2013 as a historic landmark with a Mills Act Contract. Condition number 6 of the Mills Act Contract states "Replace all non-original windows and doors with period style ones within 10 years." The property owners are now requesting approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace the existing non-original aluminum windows and sliding door in the rear of the home with wood dual paned windows. The single-family Spanish Colonial Revival home was built in 1926.

ANALYSIS: The property owners are proposing to replace six windows and one sliding door on the north and west elevations of the home. All of the windows and the door that are proposed for replacement are outside of view of the public right-of-way. Photo documentation detailing each window and the sliding door that will be restored is included in Exhibit "A." The proposed windows will be custom made of Douglas fir wood that will match the existing design and appearance of the original windows. All of the new windows will be dual paned, with mullions that are 1 3/8" deep. As is common in Spanish Colonial Revival architecture, the existing original windows are a mix of casement, double-hung, and fixed windows, both with and without divided lites. The replacement windows will replicate the original windows in size, shape, form, and color. A condition has been added requiring the Applicant to submit a window schedule and door schedule to the Planning Division for review and approval prior to the issuance of building permits.

The photograph to the right depicts an original window opening on the west elevation that has been altered. A smaller aluminum sliding window was installed and plywood was used to fill in the remaining window opening. The aluminum window and plywood will be removed and replaced with custom wood frame, divided lite, double paned casement windows.



The aluminum sliding door on the north elevation of the home (pictured below) will be replaced with custom wood French doors with divided lites and a sidelight on each side.



Finally, the aluminum windows on the north elevation in the kitchen and breakfast rooms will be replaced with wood framed, double-hung windows, consistent with the original windows.

The Historic Preservation Ordinance requires that exterior changes or additions to all historic properties be approved by the Historic Preservation Commission through a Certificate of Appropriateness. The Commission can issue a Certificate of Appropriateness if it is determined that the construction is consistent with the following:

- It does not adversely affect any significant feature of the landmark *in that the proposed window and door replacements are fulfilling a condition of the Mills Act Contract and are not visible from the public right-of-way;*
- It is consistent with the architectural period of the house *in that the custom made wood windows and French doors will restore previously replaced non-original windows;* and
- The scale, massing, proportions, materials, colors, textures, fenestration, decorative features and details proposed are consistent with the period *in that the custom made wood windows and French doors are consistent with the Spanish Colonial Revival architecture of the home and will be fitted within the original window and door openings.*

RECOMMENDATION: Staff believes that the proposal meets the findings for a Certificate of Appropriateness and recommends approval. If the Historic Preservation Commission concurs then the appropriate action would be a motion to:

Approve Certificate of Appropriateness CA2017-09 for Historic Landmark HL-129/MA-122 at 505 North Alta Vista Avenue.



HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION CONDITIONS

CA2017-09
HL-129/MA-122
505 North Alta Vista Avenue

1. The applicant shall submit a detailed window and door schedule subject to review and approval by the Planning Division prior to issuance of building permits.
2. Indemnification. As a condition of approval, Applicant agrees to defend, indemnify, protect and hold harmless City, its officers, officials, employees, agents and volunteers from and against any and all claims, actions, or proceeding against the City, its officers, officials, employees, agents and/or volunteers to attack, set aside, void or annul, an approval of the City, Planning Commission or City Council concerning this permit and the project. Such indemnification shall include damages, judgments, settlements, penalties, fines, defensive costs or expenses, including, but not limited to, interest, attorneys' fees and expert witness fees, or liability of any kind related to or arising from such claim, action, or proceeding. The City shall promptly notify the Applicant of any claim, action, or proceeding. Nothing contained herein shall prohibit City from participating in a defense of any claim, action or proceeding. The City shall have the option of coordinating the defense, including, but not limited to, choosing counsel for the defense at Applicant's expense.
3. The Applicant shall, within 30 days after approval by the Historic Preservation Commission and prior to the issuance of building permits, submit to the Community Development Department his/her written acknowledgment of receipt of the decision approving the Certificate of Appropriateness and his/her written consent to all of the conditions of approval contained in Historic Preservation Conditions. This approval shall be void and of no force or effect unless such written acknowledgment and consent is submitted to the City within the 30 day period.





Replace breakfast nook side windows with custom made wood frame, double pane, double hung windows.



Replace side windows with custom wood frame, double pane, double hung windows.

Place center window with double pane.

Enlarge all windows to fit window frame.





Replace bedroom window with wood frame, double pane, casement window.

Removed plywood patch and fill the entire frame with window.