



HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION STAFF REPORT

APPLICATION: Determination of Historic
Significance
(DPR2018-05)

AGENDA ITEM: AR-3

PREPARED BY: Jeffrey Graham,
Contract Planner
Nancy Lee,
Associate Planner

MEETING DATE: April 25, 2018

TITLE: Determination of Historic Significance
842 East Lime Avenue

APPLICANT: Patrick Yslava
842 East Lime Avenue
Monrovia, CA 91016

REQUEST: Determine the historic significance of a residential building built within the historic period (50 years or older) that is proposed for demolition.

BACKGROUND: The City's demolition review standards are set forth in Chapter 17.10 of the Monrovia Municipal Code and apply to main residential buildings in any zone that are fifty (50) years old or older proposing total demolition or significant alteration or removal of exterior building wall area and/or roof area. The demolition application requires the submittal of either documentation from a historic survey that indicates a California Historical Resource Status (CHRS) code for the subject building and other site data, a historic assessment and determination of CHRS code for the property by a qualified historic preservation consultant, or a written request for an exemption due to perceived lack of historic significance.

The evaluation and determination made by the Historic Preservation Commission is in the form of approval of a DPR Form which includes the assignment of a CHRS code. The determination made by the Commission using the CHRS code is the first step in the process and will be part of the overall evaluation of the "project" pursuant to the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA).



The homeowner presented staff with preliminary plans for construction which involves demolition of the existing residential building located at located at 842 East Lime Avenue. Given the age of the home, a determination of historic significance must be made by the Historic Preservation Commission under the demolition review authority of Ordinance 2016-10.

In accordance with the provisions of the code, the homeowner hired a qualified consultant (LSA Associates Inc.) to complete a historic assessment, which is attached to this report as Exhibit "A." Given that the assessment was completed prior to the adoption of the Citywide Historic Context Statement, as well as prior to the City finalizing formal procedures for preparing historical assessments, staff completed a supplemental evaluation of the property to ensure a thorough review. Based on the findings of the historic assessment and staff's review, the property does not meet any of the criteria for local landmark designation.

ANALYSIS: The subject site is situated on the south side of East Lime Avenue, between Shamrock and Mountain Avenues. City building permits and the Los Angeles County Assessor information revealed that the residence was built in 1940. The subject Ranch style home has an irregular in plan and is surmounted by a low-pitched, side gable roof sheathed with composition shingles and has narrow eaves with exposed rafter tails. The exterior walls are clad with stucco siding and modern stone veneer skirting. The front façade that is visible from the street includes: an attached, one-car garage with a modern door; a partial-width porch sheltered beneath the eave supported by square wood posts; and modern vinyl-framed fixed windows. Photographic aerials reveal that there is a small, detached structure at the rear of the property as well as several mature trees.

Although the report prepared by LSA, Affiliates, Inc. indicated that original building permits were not found, the City's building permit book notes that the home was built by D. Malcolm Underdown as owner/builder. Mr. Underdown has not been identified as a notable builder or master architect by the Monrovia Historic Context Statement.

The Ranch home is typical of residential development during the mid-twentieth century. The subject house is small and modest with few distinctive architectural details or examples of craftsmanship. As such, individually it does not convey an association with this significant period in history.

Staff evaluated the integrity of the property under the seven aspects: location, design, setting, materials, workmanship, feeling, and association and found that the location and setting remain unchanged. However, since the building is described as a common type and has been altered through the addition of vinyl windows, modified garage door and stone base frontage, the integrity of design, materials, workmanship, feeling, and association are rendered inapplicable. Lastly, Staff and the historic assessment did not find evidence of the subject property to be associated with any known significant people or events. Based on the findings of the historical assessment and staff's supplemental review, the property does not meet any of the criteria for local landmark designation.

Neighborhood Context

As noted earlier in this report, the historic evaluation conducted by LSA Associates, Inc. was completed prior to the release of both the Monrovia Citywide Historic Context Statement and the City's historic assessment guidelines. Therefore, the information provided by the consultant to determine if the subject property could be a contributor to a potential district was not sufficient. As a result, Staff completed a windshield survey of the surrounding neighborhood to augment this missing district analysis in the consultant's report.

As the Commission is aware, the subject residence is located within a neighborhood that was identified as a recommended potential district (Bliss Potential Historic District) in the Draft Historic Context Statement. Staff assessed the neighborhood and found that there are a number of architectural of Spanish Colonial Revival, Tudor Revival, Minimal Traditional, and

Ranch styled homes that give a sense of historical association. However, it is staff's assessment that the subject Ranch styled home is a modest example that has been significantly altered and therefore would not be a contributor if this neighborhood were to ever be formally identified as a potential district.

RECOMMENDATION: Staff and applicant's consultant determined that the property at 842 East Lime Avenue does not have architectural or known historic value that meets the criteria for local landmark status and would not be a contributor in a potential historic district. Staff recommends that the Historic Preservation Commission accept the DPR Form and assign a CHRS Code of 6Z to the properties. If the Commission concurs with this recommendation, then the following motion is appropriate:

Approve the DPR Form with a Status Code of 6Z.



EXHIBIT "A"

DPR2018-05

842 East Lime Avenue



MEMORANDUM

DATE: December 21, 2017

To: Patrick Yslava

FROM: Elisa Bechtel, MLitt
LSA Associates, Inc.

SUBJECT: 842 East Lime Avenue, City of Monrovia, Los Angeles County, California (LSA Project No. PYS1701)

LSA has completed the evaluation of 842 East Lime Avenue in the City of Monrovia. In summary, the single-family residence does not meet the criteria for listing in the California Register of Historical Resources (California Register) or the local landmark criteria and is not a “historical resource” for purposes of the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA). Additional information is provided below and in the attached documentation.

METHODS

On December 14, 2017, LSA conducted an intensive-level historic resources survey of the property. During the survey, digital photographs were taken of the visible elevations, character-defining features, and context views. Detailed notes regarding the architectural features and integrity were made and a visual/reconnaissance survey of the surrounding area was completed to determine the condition of the current setting.

Archival research on the history and development of the property and surrounding area was undertaken to determine the construction, use, and ownership history of the building, as well as important themes in history that may have been associated with the property. Both primary and secondary sources of information such as historic maps and photographs, newspaper articles, and written histories of Monrovia were utilized in this endeavor.

LSA evaluated one historic-period (50 years of age or older) single-family residence for significance in accordance with the California Register, as well as the local ordinance and its landmark criteria. Results of the aforementioned efforts were documented on State of California Department of Parks and Recreation (DPR) forms.

RESULTS

County assessor information revealed that the residence was built in 1940 during the later years of the Great Depression. It is typical of that period in that it is small and modest with few, if any, distinctive architectural details or examples of craftsmanship. As such, it is generic and temporally ambiguous and individually does not convey an association with this significant period in history. It is a common property type that does not distinguish itself in any meaningful way or possess high artistic values. No evidence was found that it is the work of a master. Furthermore, it has sustained alterations that have compromised its architectural integrity. Therefore this altered, single-family property is unimportant and insignificant.

For these reasons, the property does not meet any of the California Register or local criteria. A more detailed history and the complete evaluation can be found in the attached DPR forms.

CONCLUSION

Based on the foregoing information, the property does not qualify as a “historical resource” as defined by CEQA. Therefore, the City of Monrovia may reach a finding of No Impact regarding historic-period built environment resources.

Please let me know if you have any questions regarding this information.

Attachments: DPR Forms

State of California — The Resources Agency
DEPARTMENT OF PARKS AND RECREATION
PRIMARY RECORD

Primary # _____
HRI # _____
Trinomial _____
NRHP Status Code 6Z

Other Listings _____
Review Code _____ Reviewer _____ Date _____

Page 1 of 5

Resource Name or #: 842 East Lime Avenue

P1. Other Identifier: _____

***P2. Location:** Not for Publication Unrestricted *a. County: Los Angeles and (P2b and P2c or P2d. Attach a Location Map as necessary.)

*b. USGS 7.5' Quad: Mt. Wilson, CA Date: 1961 PR 1988 T 1N; R 11W; S.B.B.M.

c. Address: 842 East Lime Avenue City: Monrovia Zip: 91016

d. UTM: Zone: 11; _____mE/ _____mN (G.P.S.)

e. Other Locational Data: (e.g., parcel #, directions to resource, elevation, etc., as appropriate) APN: 8517-019-022

***P3a. Description:** (Describe resource and its major elements. Include design, materials, condition, alterations, size, setting, and boundaries)
This modest, one-story Ranch style residence is situated on the south side of East Lime Avenue in a residential neighborhood. It is irregular in plan and surmounted by a low-pitched, side gable roof sheathed with composition shingles and has narrow eaves with exposed rafter tails. The exterior walls are clad with stucco siding and modern stone veneer skirting. The asymmetrical, north-facing façade includes: an attached, one-car garage with a modern door; a partial-width porch sheltered beneath the eave supported by square wood posts; a modern vinyl-framed, fixed window flanked by single-hung end vents; a single door with a metal security door; and a vinyl-framed, single-hung window. Aerials reveal that there is a small, detached structure at the rear of the property as well as several mature trees. The residence is in good condition, but has sustained alterations to its fenestration and siding and is a common type and style.

***P3b. Resource Attributes:** (List attributes and codes) HP2- Single-family residence

***P4. Resources Present:** Building Structure Object Site District Element of District Other (Isolates, etc.)

P5a. Photo or Drawing (Photo required for buildings, structures, and objects.)



P5b. Description of Photo: (View, date, accession #) Top: façade, view to the southwest; below: façade, view to the southeast (12/14/17).

***P6. Date Constructed/Age and Sources:** Historic
 Prehistoric Both
1940 (Los Angeles County Assessor)

***P7. Owner and Address:**
Unknown

***P8. Recorded by:** (Name, affiliation, and address)
Elisa Bechtel, MLitt
LSA Associates, Inc.
1500 Iowa Avenue, Suite 200
Riverside, CA 92507

***P9. Date Recorded:**
December 2017

***P10. Survey Type:** (Describe)
Intensive-level CEQA compliance



***P11. Report Citation:** (Cite survey report and other sources, or enter "none.") None.

***Attachments:** NONE Location Map Sketch Map Continuation Sheet Building, Structure, and Object Record
 Archaeological Record District Record Linear Feature Record Milling Station Record Rock Art Record
 Artifact Record Photograph Record Other (List):

BUILDING, STRUCTURE, AND OBJECT RECORD

*Resource Name or # (Assigned by recorder) 842 East Lime Avenue

B1. Historic Name: _____

B2. Common Name: _____

B3. Original Use: Single-family residence B4. Present Use: Single-family residence

*B5. Architectural Style: modest Ranch

*B6. Construction History: (Construction date, alterations, and date of alterations)
1940- No original building permits were found, but original build date confirmed by country assessor information.

*B7. Moved? No Yes Unknown Date: _____ Original Location: _____

*B8. Related Features:

B9a. Architect: Unknown b. Builder: Unknown

*B10. Significance: Theme: Residential Development Area: City of Monrovia

Period of Significance: 1940 Property Type: Single family property Applicable Criteria: NA

(Discuss importance in terms of historical or architectural context as defined by theme, period, and geographic scope. Also address integrity.)

This single-family, modest Ranch-style residence has been altered and there is no indication that it is associated with important events or people. Therefore, it does not appear to meet the criteria for listing in the California Register of Historical Resources or the local ordinance.

Historic Context: Originally owned by the San Gabriel Mission and then a part of Rancho Santa Anita, the land that includes present-day Monrovia was deeded to Scottish immigrant Hugo Reid in 1839. Reid would be the first to make a modern impact on the land, raising cattle and building the first structure (Jimenez 2008). After a succession of owners, in 1875 Elias J. "Lucky" Baldwin purchased the land, along with much of the surrounding area. Baldwin began erecting buildings and cultivating the land for farming, ranching, and orchards. In 1885, the main line of the Santa Fe Railroad, in which Baldwin was a stockholder, was opened through the ranch, making it practical to subdivide part of the land into a town site. Around this time Baldwin sold several hundred acres of what would become Monrovia to William N. and C.O. Monroe, Edward F. Spense, Judge John D. Bicknell, and James F. Crank (ibid.). A town site was laid out in early 1886 and the City of Monrovia was incorporated on December 8, 1887 (ibid.).

During the first quarter of the 20th century, the city's population boomed as numerous additions, tracts, and subdivisions expanded the original township boundaries until the City began to resemble suburban residential community it is today (ibid.). Craftsman, Revival, and "kit homes" dominated the development aesthetic during this period (ibid.). With the end of WWII and the return of thousands of veterans, Monrovia and the greater Los Angeles area saw an enormous explosion in the development of affordable housing. Much of this development took the architectural vocabulary of the pre-war years and combined it into simplified styles suitable for mass developments and small-scale apartments (City of Los Angeles 2011). In increasingly suburban Monrovia, popular residential architectural styles included Minimal Traditional and the various Ranch styles. Demographic and social changes in the 1960s led to major changes in the housing market. The children of the postwar baby boom began to reach adulthood in the mid-1960s, and the number of young adults increased rapidly for more than a decade thereafter, as those born in the later 1940s through the 1950s reached maturity. These young adults generally married and had children later than their counterparts in the 1950s, and were less likely to wait until marriage to leave their parents' households. The result was a surge in single-person households. This substantial increase in the number of childless adults translated into an increased demand for apartments as an alternative to houses. While some of the multifamily housing constructed during the boom period consisted of urban high-rises, including urban renewal projects, much of it took the form of low-rise, garden apartment complexes in suburban areas. These typically consisted of multiple two-story buildings with separate, common parking shelters. Today, Monrovia offers a variety of residential types from single-family houses to duplexes to apartments and condominiums.

See Continuation Sheet

B11. Additional Resource Attributes: (List attributes and codes)

*B12. References: See Continuation Sheet

B13. Remarks:

*B14. Evaluator: Elisa Bechtel, MLitt, LSA Associates, Inc., 1500 Iowa Avenue, Suite 200, Riverside, CA 92507

*Date of Evaluation: December 2017

(Sketch Map with north arrow required.)

Refer to Location Map

(This space reserved for official comments.)

State of California - The Resources Agency
DEPARTMENT OF PARKS AND RECREATION
CONTINUATION SHEET

Primary # _____
HRI # _____
Trinomial _____

Page 3 of 5 *Resource Name or #: (Assigned by recorder) 842 East Lime Avenue
*Recorded by LSA Associates, Inc. *Date: December 2017 Continuation Update

***B10. Significance.** (continued from page 2)

People Associated with this Property. No original building permits were found; therefore, the original owner, architect, and builder are unknown. Historic city directories list a J.M. Miller as resident in 1944 and 1948; no additional information on this person was found. Robert C. and Charlene M. Maycock were listed at this address from 1952 until 1959. Information found using Ancestry.com listed Mr. Maycock as an assistant manager and salesman for an undisclosed company; no additional information was found on the couple (Ancestry.com var.).

William R. "Billie" Tubbs and his wife Darlene resided at the address from 1961 to 1967 (ibid.). According to an article by the Monrovia Police Officers' Association, Mr. Tubbs was a graduate of the FBI National Academy and served as an officer of the Monrovia Police Department for twenty years before being appointed Police Chief in 1979 (Monrovia Police Officers' Association 2017). During his tenure as police chief, Mr. Tubbs also served as president of the San Gabriel Valley Police Chiefs Association; he retired from the police force in 1989 (ibid.).

City directory information revealed that elevator operator Louis Flores and his wife Connie resided at the address from 1968 until at least 1970 (Ancestry.com var.). No additional pertinent information was found on the couple.

Significance Evaluation. In compliance with CEQA, this property is being evaluated under the California Register criteria and local landmark criteria.

California Register Criterion 1 - Associated with events that have made a significant contribution to the broad patterns of local or regional history or the cultural heritage of California or the United States. The residence was built in 1940 during the later years of the Great Depression. It is typical of that period in that it is small and modest with few, if any, distinctive architectural details or examples of craftsmanship. As such, it is generic and temporally ambiguous and individually does not convey an association with this significant period in history.

California Register Criterion 2 - Associated with the lives of persons important to local, California or national history. As discussed above, online research and a review of historic newspaper articles revealed very little information for the owners/residents. This absence of information tends to suggest that the property is not associated with persons important in national, state, or local history.

California Register Criterion 3 - Embodies the distinctive characteristics of a type, period, region or method of construction or represents the work of a master or possesses high artistic values. This very modest Ranch-style residence is a common property type that does not distinguish itself in any meaningful way or possess high artistic values. No evidence was found that it is the work of a master. Furthermore, it has sustained alterations that have compromised its architectural integrity.

California Register Criterion 4 - Has yielded, or has the potential to yield, information important to the prehistory or history of the local area, California or the nation. The property was constructed using common materials and construction practices. It does not have the potential to yield information important to the history or prehistory of the local area, California, or the nation.

Local Landmark Criterion 1 - Identifies with persons or events significant in local, regional, state, or national history. As discussed above under California Register Criterion 2, it does not appear that anyone associated with the residence during the historic period is significant in history.

Local Landmark Criterion 2 - Is representative of the work of a notable builder, designer, or architect. As discussed previously, no information was found on the architect or builder.

Local Landmark Criterion 3 - Contributes to the significance of a historic area, being geographically definable area possessing a concentration of not less than 50% of historic or architecturally related grouping of properties which contribute to each other and are unified aesthetically by physical layout or development. At the time of this evaluation, the City has not identified the location of the subject property as a potential historic district. A brief visual windshield survey of the surrounding area revealed that many of the other buildings in the area have been altered or are modern and collectively do not constitute a potential historic district.

See Continuation Sheet

CONTINUATION SHEET

Primary # _____
HRI # _____
Trinomial _____

Page 4 of 5 *Resource Name or #: (Assigned by recorder) 842 East Lime Avenue
*Recorded by LSA Associates, Inc. *Date: December 2017 Continuation Update

Local Landmark Criterion 4 - Embodies one or more distinctive characteristics of style, type, period, design, materials, detail, or craftsmanship. As discussed above under California Register Criterion 3, the residence is a very modest example of a common property type, does not possess high artistic values, and is not a particularly good or significant representation of the style. It has sustained alterations to its siding and fenestration, therefore compromising its architectural integrity. Therefore, it is not significant under this criterion.

Local Landmark Criterion 5 - Has a unique location or physical character or represents an established and familiar visual feature of neighborhood, community, or city. Due to its modest and ordinary character and location, this property does not meet this criterion.

Local Landmark Criterion 6 - Incorporates elements that help preserve and protect a historic place or area of historic interest in the city. As discussed under Local Landmark Criteria 3 and 4, the property nor the surrounding area retain integrity of setting, materials, design, workmanship, or feeling, and, therefore, do not add to, nor are associated with, a historic place or area of historic interest.

Local Landmark Criterion 7 - Has yielded, or may be likely to yield information important in prehistory or history. As discussed above under California Register Criterion 4, the property does not have the potential to yield information important to the history or prehistory of the local area, California, or the nation due to its age and construction using common materials and construction practices.

***B12. References:** (continued from page 2)

Ancestry.com

Var. A variety of records were accessed online in December 2017 at: <http://home.ancestry.com/>. These include city directories, voter registration records, and United States Census Data.

Architectural Resources Group

2016 "City of Arcadia Citywide Historic Context Statement." Accessed online at: <https://www.arcadiaca.gov/government/city-departments/development-services/historic-preservation>

City of Los Angeles

2011 Jefferson Park HPOZ Preservation Plan, City of Los Angeles. Accessed in 2012 online at: [http://preservation.lacity.org/files/Jefferson%20Park%20\(Small%20File\)%20PP.pdf](http://preservation.lacity.org/files/Jefferson%20Park%20(Small%20File)%20PP.pdf)

Jimenez, Craig

2008 "Wild Rose Tract Historic District Historic Context and Survey." Accessed online in August 2017 at: http://www.cityofmonrovia.org/sites/default/files/fileattachments/community_development/page/1457/wildrose_historic_context.pdf

Los Angeles County Office of the Assessor

n.d. Property information accessed online in December 2017 at: http://maps.assessor.lacounty.gov/GVH_2_2/Index.html?configBase=http://maps.assessor.lacounty.gov/Geocortex/Essentials/REST/sites/PAIS/viewers/PAIS_hv/virtualdirectory/Resources/Config/Default

Monrovia Police Officers' Association

2017 "History of the MPOA." Accessed online in December 2017 at: <https://www.monroviapoa.org/about/history-of-the-mpoa?showall=1>.

State of California - Resource Agency
DEPARTMENT OF PARKS AND RECREATION
LOCATION MAP

Primary # _____
 HRI # _____
 Trinomial _____

