



HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION STAFF REPORT

APPLICATION: DHS2018-0004

AGENDA ITEM: AR-1

PREPARED BY: Nancy Lee
Associate Planner

MEETING DATE: July 2, 2018

TITLE: Determination of Historic Significance
205 Acacia Avenue

APPLICANT: Carlos Parrague
400 Prospect Avenue
Monrovia, CA 91016

REQUEST: Determine the historic significance of a residential building built within the historic period (50 years or older) that is proposing to alter more than fifty percent of a main building's roof area.

BACKGROUND: The City's demolition review standards are set forth in Chapter 17.10 of the Monrovia Municipal Code and apply to main residential buildings in any zone that are fifty (50) years old or older proposing total demolition or significant alteration or removal of exterior building wall area and/or roof area. The demolition application requires the submittal of either documentation from a historic survey that indicates a California Historical Resource Status (CHRS) code for the subject building and other site data, a historic assessment and determination of CHRS code for the property by a qualified historic preservation consultant, or a written request for an exemption due to perceived obvious lack of historic significance.

The evaluation and determination made by the Historic Preservation Commission is in the form of approval of a DPR Form which includes the assignment of a CHRS code. The determination made by the Commission using the CHRS codes is the first step in the process and will be part of the overall evaluation of the "project" pursuant to the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA).



The applicant is proposing to alter more than 50% of the main building roof area to accommodate a single-story rear addition and a new front porch. These alterations meet the

threshold for review under the demolition ordinance. By altering the main building roof area, the rear addition and new front porch would be cohesively integrated into the overall home design. Since the majority of the addition will take place towards the rear of the home, the primary change at the street level would be the new front porch. Aside from the new front porch, there are no proposed alterations or additions to the existing street facing facade.

On May 16, 2018, the applicant submitted a written request for exemption from the demolition review permit regulations due to the perceived lack of historic significance. The exemption request is attached as Exhibit "A".

ANALYSIS: The subject site is located on the west side of Acacia Avenue, between Oaks Avenue and Foothill Boulevard. According to building permit records, the existing 953 square foot single-story residence was built in 1951. The "L" shaped house has a low pitch cross-hipped roof that is covered with composition shingles. Roof elements include simple fascia. The house is clad in stucco. The fenestration appears original and consists of a picture window flanked by double-hung, multi-light, wood sashes on the front facade. A double hung window with shutters and a fixed octagonal window are also on the primary elevation. The side facing front door is sheltered with a simple extended overhang. An attached front facing two car garage is setback from the primary elevation on the north end of the structure. A red brick chimney is located on the partial gable between the house and the attached garage. No significant work has occurred on the house since 1951.

A building permit dated in 1951 identifies Saffel & McAdam as the builder of the home. The Historic Context Statement (HCS) does not list this builder as a notable builder or master architect. The original owners of the home were John B. and Grace Lemon. According to the applicant's research, there is no indication that the dwelling is associated with any persons or significant events or persons important to Monrovia history.

The Ranch home is typical of post war residential development (1946-1976). Character defining features of Traditional Ranch styled homes identified in the Historic Context Statement (HCS) include:

- Wide, covered front porch with wood posts;
- Low, horizontal massing with wide street façade;
- Plaster, wood lap, or board-and batten siding, often with brick or stone accents; and
- Divided light wood sash windows including picture, casement, and diamond pane.

The subject house is small and modest in size, and contains few distinctive architectural details or examples of craftsmanship such as those listed above. Therefore, individually, it does not convey an association with this significant period in history.

Staff evaluated the integrity of the property under seven aspects: location, design, setting, materials, workmanship, feeling, and association using the guidance of the HCS. Although the building is common and modest, the seven aspects of integrity remain unchanged due to the lack of alterations. In reviewing the integrity thresholds specified in the HCS, the retention of design, workmanship, and materials are more valued than location, setting, feeling, and association. Specifically, with respect to the architectural style, the HCS states "*Given the numerous examples in the city, must possess high integrity of design, materials, and workmanship and good integrity of all other aspects*". Though the subject structure retains integrity, the character defining features are minimal, and therefore the home does not

contain high integrity of design, materials, and workmanship. As such, staff determined that the property is not eligible for local landmark designation.

Neighborhood Context

The windshield survey by staff revealed that neighboring properties on this block of Acacia Avenue were constructed in both pre- and post-war architectural styles. The neighborhood is very eclectic and features architectural styles such as Tudor Revival, Minimal Traditional, Spanish Colonial Revival and Ranch styled homes. If this neighborhood were ever to be designated as a potential district, based on the criteria outlined in the HCS, the subject home would not qualify as a contributor because it does not exhibit the character defining features associated with post-war modernism and Ranch house style.

RECOMMENDATION: The applicant's exemption request demonstrates that the property at 205 Acacia Avenue does not have architectural or known historic value that meets the criteria for local landmark status and is not a contributor to a potential historic district. Staff recommends that the Historic Preservation Commission approve the DPR and assign a CHRS Code of 6Z to the property. If the Historic Preservation Commission concurs with this recommendation, then the motion is appropriate:

Approve the DPR Form with a Status Code of 6Z.



Real Estate Development Corporation 400 Prospect Avenue, Monrovia, CA 91016 (P)626-358-2360 (F)626-357-1716

03 May 2018

**TO: Planning Department
City of Monrovia**

SUBJECT: 205 Acacia Avenue, Monrovia, CA
Request for exemption from a formal historic significance assessment

This letter of request for an exemption is provided in accordance with Monrovia municipal code regarding main residential buildings that are 50 years old or older proposing significant alteration or removal of exterior building wall area. Once a property is designated a historic landmark, all changes to the exterior of the exterior of structures on the property are subject to the approval of a certificate of appropriateness by the historic preservation commission.

The following two conditions require a determination by the Historic Preservation Commission of the subject property as to whether it meets the definition of a “historic resource.”

- L.A. County Assessor and permit records indicate the main residential building at 205 Acacia Avenue, was built in 1951.
- The proposed plans for an addition to the rear of the house will affect 77% of the existing roof of the structure. (This % is triggered only because we are adding a covered front porch that is fitting in character with the current architectural style of the house. We could make a flat roof on the porch and avoid this whole review. Further, no exterior walls of the front elevation of the house are being modified in any manner)

•

Historic significance was researched in regard to:

1. Identity of persons or events significant in local, regional, state or national history.
2. Representation of the work of a notable builder, designer, or architect.
3. Contribution to the significance of an historic area, being a geographically definable area possessing a concentration of not less than 50% of historic or architecturally related grouping of properties which contribute to each other and are unified aesthetically by physical layout or development.
4. Embodiment of one or more distinctive characteristic of style, type, period, design, materials, or craftsmanship. Note: in order for a property to be considered solely on this criterion, the structure must be fully restored from public view and must be an excellent example of an architectural style.

PARAGUÉ

DEVELOPMENT

Real Estate Development Corporation 400 Prospect Avenue, Monrovia, CA 91016 (P)626-358-2360 (F)626-357-1716

5. A unique location or physical characteristic or represents an established and familiar visual feature of neighborhood, community, or the city of Monrovia.
6. Incorporation of elements that help preserve and protect an historic place or area of historic interest in the city.
7. Has yielded, or may be likely to yield information important in prehistory or history.

Investigation of available resources determined that the property is not suitable for placement on federal, state or city of Monrovia historic registers due to lack of obvious determinate criteria. This letter documents the resources and criteria applicable to the subject property and the basis for proposed exemption from historic significance.

LA County - Property Assessment Information System

http://maps.assessor.lacounty.gov/GVH_2/Index.html?configBase=http...

Parcel Details

- ◆ Property records are kept at the East District Office
- ◆ How frequently is this site updated? (and other FAQs)

Property Information

Assessor's ID No: 8519-017-003
Address: 205 ACACIA AVE
 MONROVIA CA 91016

Property Type: Single Family Residential
Region / Cluster: 05 / 05172
Tax Rate Area (TRA): 06191

- ◆ View Assessor Map
- ◆ View Index map

Recent Sales Information

Latest Sale Date: 12/19/2017
Indicated Sale Price: \$675,006

[Search for Recent Sales](#)

2017 Roll Values

Recording Date: 07/18/2013
Land: \$205,314
Improvements: \$51,319
Personal Property: \$0
Fixtures: \$0
Homeowners' Exemption: \$0
Real Estate Exemption: \$0
Personal Property Exemption: \$0
Fixture Exemptions: \$0

- ◆ 2017 Annual taxes
- ◆ Property tax payment FAQs
- ◆ Estimate supplemental taxes

Property Boundary Description

TRACT NO 2457 N 58 FT OF S 111 FT OF W
 130 FT OF E 155 FT OF
 LOT A

Building Description

Building Improvement 1

Square Footage: 953
Year Build / Effective Year Built: 1952 / 1952
Bedrooms / Bathrooms: 2 / 1
Units: 1

I want to...

LA County Street Map

PARRAGUÉ DEVELOPMENT

Real Estate Development Corporation 400 Prospect Avenue, Monrovia, CA 91016 (P)626-358-2360 (F)626-357-1716

Property Description:

-Architectural Description:

The house was built in 1951, the subject property may be classified as a minimal Ranch style. The house is simple build, one story, broad low one story, single family home, minimal ranch front fascia, boxed eaves, subtle entry sheltered by overhang and set into "L" form, built on raised foundation, plaster stucco wall, picture window, shutters, brick chimney, hipped with cross gable with asphaltic roof material and attached street facing garage.

FRONT



PARRAGUÉ DEVELOPMENT

Real Estate Development Corporation 400 Prospect Avenue, Monrovia, CA 91016 (P)626-358-2360 (F)626-357-1716

REAR





Real Estate Development Corporation 400 Prospect Avenue, Monrovia, CA 91016 (P)626-358-2360 (F)626-357-1716

-City Building Permits:

The original Builder was Saffell & McAdam, no significant information was found on this Builder. No significant work has occurred on the house since 1951.

Date	Permit Description	Owner	Architect/Builder
10/1951	Initial Building Construction	John Lemon	Saffell & McAdam
10/1951	Plumbing	John Lemon	Belvedere
10/1951	Plumbing	John Lemon	
11/1951	Plaster Interior	John Lemon	C.M. Johnson
11/1991	Plaster Exterior	John Lemon	C.M. Johnson
12/1951	Plumbing	John Lemon	Olin Kazzier
12/1951	Wiring	John Lemon	Fenton & Linderman
12/1951	Sewer	John Lemon	Belvedere
11/1991	Earthquake Damage	Wells Fargo	
05/1999	Reroof over existing	Brenda Kobernusz	Michael Sherman
06/1991	Redwood Fence	Brenda Kobernusz	
10/2015	Plumbing	Brenda Kobernusz	

-Architect

There are no known records of the original architect.

-Ownership

Date	Name	Source
Unknown-1951	John W Graham & Helen Barber Graham	County of Los Angeles Records
1951-1967	John B Lemon & Grace Lemon	County of Los Angeles Records
1967-1970	Dwight R Powers & Mabel Powers	County of Los Angeles Records
1970-1998	Mable Powers	County of Los Angeles Records
1998	Alice Stein	County of Los Angeles Records
1998-2017	Brenda R. Koberhusz	County of Los Angeles Records
2017-	Joseph James Eginton Jr & Denise Elizabeth Eginton	County of Los Angeles Records

Title search of the Owners has not revealed any prominent or notable citizenry

PARRAGUÉ **DEVELOPMENT**

Real Estate Development Corporation 400 Prospect Avenue, Monrovia, CA 91016 (P)626-358-2360 (F)626-357-1716

Neighborhood Assessment

Total 46 properties within about 300 foot radius of the subject property. They have a wide range of original construction and architectural style from 1903 to 1976.

1901-1910	- 3 properties
1911-1920's	- 4 properties
1921-1930	- 15 properties
1931-1940	- 5 properties
1941-1950	- 8 properties
1951-1960	- 10 properties
1961-1970	- 0 properties
1971-1980	- 1 properties
1981- Present	- 0 properties

SOUTH NEIGHBOR



PARRAGUÉ DEVELOPMENT

Real Estate Development Corporation 400 Prospect Avenue, Monrovia, CA 91016 (P)626-358-2360 (F)626-357-1716

EAST NEIGHBOR



NORTH NEIGHBOR



PARRAGUÉ DEVELOPMENT

Real Estate Development Corporation 400 Prospect Avenue, Monrovia, CA 91016 (P)626-358-2360 (F)626-357-1716





Real Estate Development Corporation 400 Prospect Avenue, Monrovia, CA 91016 (P)626-358-2360 (F)626-357-1716

Evaluation (See list of resources used at the end of this document)

1. Historical persons or Events.

There is no record of anyone or any event associated with the property who is of historical note or interest. The name John Graham was found in page 94 of the Monrovia-Duarte Community Book by Charles F. Davis. But nothing was found about him anywhere. Owners and occupants of record have no documented historical significance or involvement with any notable historical circumstances. A specific historical event, trend, or evolution of events is not recorded to have occurred on the subject property that would rate it as contributing significantly to the development of the community, region, state or nation.(not applicable)

2. Notable Builder or Architect.

The original architect is unknown. The builder was Saffell & McAdam. The name was not found in any of the reference material. The building was not indicated as work of significant influence.

3. Historic Grouping

The subject property is not associated with an historic area or district.

4. Architecture

The sample building design and materials are not representative of a particular or distinguishing architectural type, perhaps can be called a modest Ranch.. It's plain characteristics provide no notable or special value for a study of a period, style, or method of construction.

5. Unique feature:

The location and characteristics along with the visual statements to the neighborhood are not particularly special or unique. There are no physical characteristics defining this property or make it stand out.

6. Historic place

The property is not interrelated in the establishment, preservation or protection of a historic place or region in the city.

7. Source of future prehistory or history

There is no evidence that this construction in 1951 was the first of its kind in history. No evidence is known that would lead to finding or paleontological specimens. The proposed improvements and additional would not cause any obliteration of valuable historic artifacts beyond the substantial disturbance to the site of the current improvements done in the last 70 years. The addition is proposed to be constructed using common materials, method and features, it is not judged to have the potential to yield important data in regard to it's period to it's period of construction or occupancy



Real Estate Development Corporation 400 Prospect Avenue, Monrovia, CA 91016 (P)626-358-2360 (F)626-357-1716

Conclusion

The subject structure is not presently listed on any local, state or federal register. The subject property is not listed as a contributor to any local, state or federal historic district. The subject structure does not including any known historical associations or historic architectural significance or uniqueness. No evidence was found that would suggest the subject property or it's occupants or owners would quality now or in the future life of the building for any historic significance.

Due to the lack of historic significance, please accept this formal request to be exempt from providing a formal historic assessment as required in the application for discretionary review and approval.

Resource Findings

- Street Address Index: no reference to subject property in draft historic resources survey of 2004.
- Picture Index: no reference to subject property.
- Homes and Home Tours File Index: no reference to subject property.
- Early Monrovia structure org: No reference to subject property.
- Early Monrovia newspapers: No reference to subject property or past owners.
- Monrovia's heritage vol 1&2: No reference to subject property.
- Monrovia's heritage: An Architectural perspective: No reference to subject property.
- History of Monrovia (Wiley): No reference to subject property or occupants.
- History of Monrovia and Duarte(Davis): No reference to subject property or occupants.
- Monrovia Blue Book: No reference to subject property or occupants.
- City of Monrovia Historic Context Statement - No reference of subject property or neighborhood.

Thank you for your consideration

Carlos Parrague"
President

Page 1 of 4 *Resource Name or #: 205 Acacia Avenue

P1 Other Identifier: _____

*P2 Location: Not for Publication Unrestricted

a. County: Los Angeles

c. Address: 205 Acacia Avenue City: Monrovia Zip: 91016

e. Other Locational Data: APN # 8519-017-003

P3a Description: (Describe resource and its major elements. Include design, materials, condition, alterations, size, setting, and boundaries)

This one-story, 953 square foot, minimal Ranch residence was built in 1951. The "L" shaped house has a low pitch cross-hipped roof that is covered with composition shingles. Roof elements include a simple fascia. The house is clad in stucco. The fenestration appears original and consists of a picture window flanked by double-hung, multi-light, wood sashes on the front facade. A double hung window with shutters and a fixed octagonal window are also on the primary elevation. The side facing front door is sheltered with a simple extended overhang. An attached front facing two car garage is setback from the primary elevation on the north end of the structure. A red brick chimney is located on the partial gable between the house and the attached garage. The house is in generally in good condition and does not appear to have been altered.

P3b Resource Attributes: (List attributes and codes) HP2 - Single Family Property

*P4 Resources Present: Building Structure Object Site District Element of District Other

P5a Photograph

P5b Description of Photo: (view, date)

Facade (view from east) May 2018

P6 Date Constructed: 1951

City of Monrovia

Source: Building Permit

P7 Owner and Address:

Joseph and Denise Edington
205 Acacia Avenue
Monrovia, CA 91016

P8 Recorded by:

City of Monrovia

P9 Date Recorded: July 2018

P10 Survey Type: Individual



P11 Report Citation:

Attachments: NONE Location Map Sketch Map Continuation Sheet Building, Structure, and Object Record
 Archaeological Record District Record Linear Feature Record Milling Station Record Rock Art Record
 Artifact Record Photograph Record Other (List):

Page 2 of 4 *Resource Name or #: 205 Acacia Avenue

B1 Historic Name: N/A

B2 Common Name: N/A

B3 Original Use Single-family residential

B4 Present Use Single-family residential

B5 Architectural Style Ranch

B6 Construction History (Construction date, alterations, and date of alterations)

1951 – House and Garage (Building Permit)

1994 – Reroof

B7 Moved: No **Date Moved** N/A **Original Location** N/A

B8 Related Features:

B9a Architect: Unknown **b. Builder:** Saffel & McAdam

B10 Significance: **Theme:** Residential Development **Area:** Monrovia

Period of Significance: 1951 **Property Type** Single-Family Residence

Discuss importance in terms of historical or architectural context as well as integrity.

The dwelling is best described as a Minimal Ranch styled dwelling. Although it was constructed during the period of post war single-family residential infill from 1941-1961, it is a modest because it was constructed with simple details and materials. The house appears to be unaltered, therefore, the building retains integrity of location, design, setting, materials, workmanship, feeling, and association. However, since the building is simple and modest, the character defining Ranch details are minimal and therefore the home does not contain high integrity of design, materials, and workmanship. The surrounding residential properties are either pre- and post-war architectural styles (Tudor Revival, Minimal Traditional, Spanish Colonial, and Ranch), the neighborhood does not contain architectural cohesiveness as a whole to constitute a potential historic district.

B11 Additional Resource Attributes:

B12 References:
 Los Angeles County Assessor's Records
 City of Monrovia Building Permits

B13 Remarks

B14 Evaluator/ Date City of Monrovia
 July 2018



CONTINUATION SHEET

P5a Photograph	P5b Description of Photo: Side (South) Elevation 6/2018.
	

P5a Photograph	P5b Description of Photo: Rear elevation, 6/2018
	

CONTINUATION SHEET

Page 4 of 4 *Resource Name or #: 205 Acacia Avenue

P5a Photograph



P5b Description of Photo:
Side (North) Elevation 6/2018.