



CITY COUNCIL AGENDA REPORT



DEPARTMENT: City Manager's Office

MEETING DATE: May 4, 2021

PREPARED BY: Dylan Feik, City Manager
Jackie Tran, Communications Analyst

AGENDA LOCATION: AR-1

TITLE: *Ad Hoc* Committee on Equity and Inclusion Recommendations

OBJECTIVE: To receive and file the *ad hoc* Committee on Equity and Inclusion recommendations report

BACKGROUND: The disturbing and unjust killings of George Floyd and others led to broader and more urgent discussions in communities across the nation regarding race, racism, police brutality, equity, and the need to eradicate systemic racism and other barriers to equity. It was further recognized that there is a need for transparency in the fight to eradicate systemic racism and to raise awareness regarding the importance of equity, inclusion, diversity and human rights.

In response, on July 7, 2020, the Monrovia City Council adopted Resolution No. 2020-62 forming an *ad hoc* Committee on Equity and Inclusion ("Committee").

The resolution formed a committee of five members, each nominated by a member of the City Council to serve at the pleasure of the City Council. On July 21, 2020, the City Council appointed, Edward Elizalde, Susie Ling, Henry Olivas, Jr., Rev. Neil Tadken, and Ruhyyih Yuille to the Committee.

The Committee's sole function was to review with the community to determine whether any policies, practices, and procedures of the City of Monrovia are unjust or unfair; create structural barriers to diversity, equity, and inclusion in City governance, employment, or enforcement; or perpetuate systemic racism in City government and provide a report back to the City Council with any recommendations for change the Committee deems advisable for consideration.

To accomplish this function, the Committee:

1. Established a priority order for its review of City policies, practices, and procedures, with a primary focus on enforcement, employment, and community relations;
2. Solicited and accepted reports from City staff regarding issues within its jurisdiction;
3. Solicited and accepted broad community input regarding issues within its jurisdiction;
4. Determined, based on input from the City Manager, which internal administrative policies and procedures are unlikely to perpetuate systemic racism or inequity and need not be reviewed by the Committee; and
5. Collaborated on reports and recommendations to the City Council.

ANALYSIS: From August 13, 2020, to April 15, 2021, the Committee assembled virtually on a biweekly basis to individually review each city department's policies and procedures. Staff from each city department delivered an overview on operational areas and staff members' background, including race/ethnicity, gender, age, employment status, education levels and where they reside. Following a template created by the Committee, staff provided insight on how the department creates a safe work environment, what trainings are provided, who the department serves, how the department addresses

AR-1

marginalized groups, any boasts or concerns that the department has, and recommendations to make the department more diverse, equitable, and inclusive. Complying with the Brown Act, meetings were publicly held and recordings of the meetings are available on the City's website at www.cityofmonrovia.org.

After conducting a thorough review of each city department, the Committee compiled a document to report their findings and recommendations. The report includes an overview of each department, and recommendations for each department to be able to pursue diversity, equity, and inclusion. The Committee's report emphasizes the importance of being accountable towards the intentional and shared goal of inclusion and equity.

The *ad hoc* Committee on Equity and Inclusion Recommendations Report is available on the City's website at www.cityofmonrovia.org.

ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT: There is no environmental impact associated with this report.

FISCAL IMPACT: There is no fiscal impact associated with this report.

OPTIONS: As this is a receive and file report, there are no options presented.

RECOMMENDATION: Staff recommends that the City Council receive and file the report.

COUNCIL ACTION REQUIRED: If the City Council concurs, the appropriate action would be a motion to receive and file the *ad hoc* Committee on Equity and Inclusion recommendations.



ad hoc COMMITTEE ON
EQUITY & INCLUSION



To: Monrovia City Council

From: Monrovia Ad-Hoc Committee on Equity and Inclusion

Ruhiyyih Yuille, Chair
Edward Elizalde, Vice Chair
Susie Ling, Secretary
Henry Olivas, Committee Member
Reverend Neil Tadken, Committee Member

Re: FINAL REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS



“The definition of insanity is doing the same thing over and over again, but expecting different results.”

- Albert Einstein

AD HOC COMMITTEE ON EQUITY & INCLUSION

The disturbing and unjust killings of George Floyd and others led to broader and more urgent discussions in communities across the nation regarding race, racism, police brutality, equity, and the need to eradicate systemic racism and other barriers to equity. It was further recognized that there is a need for transparency in the fight to eradicate systemic racism and to raise awareness regarding the importance of equity, inclusion, diversity and human rights.

In response, on July 7, 2020, the Monrovia City Council adopted Resolution No. 2020-62 forming an ad hoc Committee on Equity and Inclusion (“Committee”).

The resolution formed a committee of five members, each nominated by a Councilmember to serve at the pleasure of the City Council. On July 21, 2020, the City Council appointed, Edward Elizalde, Susie Ling, Henry Olivas, Jr., Rev. Neil Tadken and Ruhyyih Yuille to the Committee.

The Committee’s sole function was to review with the community to determine whether any policies, practices, and procedures of the City of Monrovia are unjust or unfair; create structural barriers to diversity, equity and inclusion in City governance, employment or enforcement; or perpetuate systemic racism in City government and provide a report back to the City Council with any recommendations for change the Committee deems advisable for consideration.

To accomplish this function, the Committee:

1. Established a priority order for its review of City policies, practices and procedures with a primary focus on enforcement, employment, and community relations;
2. Solicited and accepted reports from City staff regarding issues within its jurisdiction;
3. Solicited and accepted broad community input regarding issues within its jurisdiction;
4. Determined, based on input from the City Manager, which internal administrative policies and procedures are unlikely to perpetuate systemic racism or inequity and need not be reviewed by the Committee; and
5. Collaborated on reports and recommendations to the City Council.

MEET THE COMMITTEE MEMBERS



RUHIYYIH YUILLE

Chair of the Ad Hoc Committee on Equity & Inclusion

As a second generation Monrovia Highschool graduate, my private and public work, which I consider service, has spanned the last 25 years and the continents of North America, South America, Western Europe and Southern Africa. I was encouraged by my parents James and Joannie Yuille to choose a life path that would significantly contribute to the betterment of the world. My work centers on the education and training of communities around issues of social justice and liberation. Towards this end, I have facilitated workshops in collaboration with both Local and National Governmental Organizations around issues of justice, education and equity; I have appeared on media outlets to share perspectives on the oneness of humanity, the importance of education as the path to true liberation, and the rights and freedoms inherent in the human condition; I have written and structured learning experiences/curriculum with learners from age 3 to late adulthood. My most recent work focuses on pedagogy and student liberation, the notion of rehumanization, and the beauty of racial diversity.

EDDIE ELIZALDE

Vice Chair of the Ad Hoc Committee on Equity & Inclusion

- I have been a resident of Monrovia since January 2006.
- I live in the northeast portion of the city with my wife, teenage daughter, and teenage son.
- I'm a police lieutenant for the Alhambra Police Department.
- I currently manage the personnel and training section. I started my law enforcement career in 1995 with the Alhambra Police Department as a Police/Fire and 911 Dispatcher.
- In 1999 I attended the Rio Hondo Police Academy.
- My hobbies are physical fitness, gardening, and DIY projects.



During the Spring and Summer of 2020, I saw first hand a demand from communities asking for police reform, justice, and better relationships amongst all groups in the communities. Although being a servant to the community for the last few decades, I felt a need to do more. When I first read about the Ad Hoc Committee, I felt this was the perfect venue for me, and I reached out to ask how I could become a part of it. I'm proud of the work the committee has accomplished. I walk away from this endeavor having a much deeper appreciation for community involvement and taking the time to see communal issues from a different perspective.

MEET THE COMMITTEE MEMBERS



SUSIE LING

Secretary of the Ad Hoc Committee on Equity & Inclusion

I was born in Taiwan and raised in the Philippines. I'm an Associate Professor of Asian American Studies and History at Pasadena City College. I've had the opportunity to volunteer for Monrovia Historic Preservation Group, Monrovia Legacy Project, and the Monrovia Historical Museum. Over the years, I have worked on collecting the ethnic history of Monrovia, which can be seen at the following website: susieling.wordpress.com.

HENRY OLIVAS

Committee Member of the Ad Hoc Committee on Equity & Inclusion

My name is Henry Claro Olivas, Jr.; I'm a graphic artist (BA in Design, UCLA, 1985), painter and writer, and have been a resident of Monrovia most of my life. Both my parents were Monrovia High School graduates, and all four of my grandparents also resided here. In fact, I currently live in the Almond Avenue home of my great-grandparents Louis and Lucinda Garcia, who moved to Monrovia circa 1905. My paternal great-grandmother Francisca Orozco and her family were Mexican immigrants who fled the violence of the 1910 revolution and settled on nearby Maple Avenue. I have two daughters, Lorelei and Semeli, who are also Monrovia residents.

Along with Jimmy O'Balles, I co-founded the Monrovia Latino Heritage Society in 2011 and remain its current president (though our activities have been put on hold for the last year due to the pandemic). I was honored to be invited to join the Ad Hoc Committee on Equity & Inclusion, and did so because of my interest in history, sense of justice and deep roots in the community. Living in what was once a segregated area of the city, I'm well aware of its past, having heard stories from my parents, grandparents and others who grew up here. Also, my friend and co-committee member Susie Ling has published "Recuerdos de Monrovia: History of Mexican Americans" which brings much of this history into focus.

It's my sincere hope that our committee's recommendations, by bringing to light past injustices in Monrovia and present inequities, creates a clear path forward. The history of our nation (of which Monrovia is a microcosm) has been an ongoing struggle to bring about equity, inclusion and justice to ALL citizens, and whatever steps we take to educate in this matter can only be a positive move forward.



MEET THE COMMITTEE MEMBERS

THE REVEREND NEIL TADKEN, RECTOR

Committee Member of the Ad Hoc Committee on Equity & Inclusion



Born and raised in New York, I earned my Master of Divinity degree from the Episcopal Theological School at Claremont/Claremont School of Theology. I also hold a bachelor's degree from Occidental College and a Master of Fine Arts degree in Theater from Cornell University.

I discerned my priestly calling while an active parishioner at All Saint's Church in Pasadena. Upon graduation from seminary, I worked as Director for ACTION: AIDS CareTeams in our Neighborhoods, an interfaith non-profit pastoral care ministry in Orange County. Following ordination, I served as Associate Rector for Pastoral Care

at St. James' in the City, Los Angeles, one of the most multicultural parishes in the Episcopal Diocese of Los Angeles. I was finally called to serve St. Luke's in Aug. 2013 and was instituted as the 16th Rector of the parish the following year.

In addition to my work on this ad hoc committee for the city, I serve as treasurer for the Interfaith Council of Monrovia, and for the Monrovia Ministerial Association. Throughout my rectorship, building relationships with Foothill Unity Center and the San Gabriel Valley chapter of Rebuilding Together, as well as other non-profits and the City of Monrovia, has been central to my ministry. A wise colleague advised me early in my rectorship to focus more on the "number of toilet flushes throughout the week over the number of butts in the pews on any given Sunday." It has been the wisest lesson I have learned in ministry. Make yourself and your community relevant to your city and good things can be achieved.

Prior to ordination, I was a professional actor and director. Between 1994 and 2001, soap opera watchers may have seen me recurring as "Don McTavish" on ABC's General Hospital and Port Charles. In 1993, I founded and directed a national AIDS education and outreach effort for television called "Day of Compassion," which became an annual event over the next 8 years, and was honored with a "Ribbon of Hope Award" from the American Academy of Television Arts and Sciences in 1997 for that effort.

INTRODUCTION

Monrovia’s Ad-Hoc Committee on Equity and Inclusion was established by City Council in July of 2020 (Resolution No. 2020-62) to “review the City of Monrovia’s policies, practices, and procedures to determine whether barriers exist that impede diversity, equity and inclusion in City Government.” Collaborating with the City Manager and the staff, this Committee of volunteer residents held bi-monthly meetings to review the departments of the City and their practices. The Committee members have a shared commitment to help the City intentionally do better and be more inclusive. This is the continuing work of all Monrovians.

In May of 2020, George Floyd was killed by a member of the Minneapolis Police Department. Floyd was one of a string of racially charged incidents around the nation. Coupled with the disproportionate impact of COVID-19 on people of color, there was a swelling of demand for change and empathy surrounding these issues and for the Black Lives Matter movement. In June of 2020, a series of peaceful multiethnic rallies were held at Monrovia’s Library Park. For many, the events of 2020 – and then 2021¹ – were reminiscent of the 1992 L.A. Riots, the 1960s riots around Monrovia High, and the 1965 Watts Riot.²

BLACK HISTORY MATTERS

Anti-Blackness and racism are systemic³ in the United States and around the world – as such, Monrovia is not immune to its consequences. It is a legacy inherited from generations of governments, cultural institutions, educational systems, and traditions. A culture of racism encourages class discrimination, xenophobia, sexism, homophobia, and anti-otherness. A culture of racism inhibits inclusion and harmony, as well as creativity and effective governance. Only by acknowledging our diversity can we begin to heal from our history of segregation and discrimination, and progress to a “more perfect union”⁴.

This part of Los Angeles County was inhabited by people of the Tongva nation since 500 BCE. In the Spanish and Mexican eras of California history, Rancho Santa Anita and Rancho Azusa de Duarte were established. It was in 1884 that William Monroe and his partners accrued some of this land and established subdivisions and lot sales that attracted migrants. In 1887, Monrovia was incorporated with a multiethnic population near 900. According to 2019 Census estimates, the population is just over 36,000 and 41% Hispanic, 35% White, 15% Asian, 5%

¹ 2021 saw the 6 January 2021 storming of the U.S. Capitol, the rise in anti-Asian hate crimes, and continued border tensions.

² In April of 1992, racial tensions exploded in Los Angeles after 4 LAPD officers were found not guilty for the filmed beating of motorist Rodney King in March of 1991. In the 1960s, there were several incidents of racial tension at Monrovia High triggered by segregated physical areas, the presence of White supremacist groups on campus, the lack of African American staff, etc. In 1965, the Watts Uprising was 6 days of racial unrest following the CHP handling of an African American driver.

³ Systemic is defined as “relating to a system.”

⁴ The words “more perfect union” are from the Preamble of the United States Constitution.

African American, 1.2% Native Hawaiian/Pacific Islander, 0.4% American Indian, and 5.8% Two or More Races. Monrovia’s official poverty rate is at 7.8% (California is 11.8%) and 26.2% are foreign born (California is 26.8%).⁵

It would be useful for the City to also ascertain community proportion of other variables especially single parent households, LGBTQ populations, mentally disabled populations, physically disabled populations, and language needs populations. The Committee made a request to the Southern California Association of Governments (SCAG) during a demographic presentation on 27 August 2020 to include these questions in its 2021 demographic survey.

Monrovia is unique in that there are African American residents that trace back seven generations. Along with Duarte and Pasadena, Monrovia was a safe haven – a non-“sundown town” – on the Santa Fe, Atchison, and Topeka Line. Monrovia was the destination of ambitious John Isaac Wesley Fisher and the Bennettsville team; national activists like Lt. Col. Allen Allensworth and Anna H. Jones; as well as hundreds who came - especially from Mississippi - during the Great Migration out of the South. Monrovia was a beacon of opportunity from Reconstruction into the 1970s. Monrovia boasts some of the oldest African American churches in the County.⁶

Monrovia also has Latinx families that are descendants of the founding of Los Angeles in 1781. Chinese Americans were recruited here by William Monroe in 1884 to clear brush and boulders. Japanese American families came to Monrovia in the early 1900s - and stayed. Jews, Filipinos, Indonesians, Armenians, Middle Easterners, and others are also part of the fabric of our community. Since its incorporation, Monrovia has been home to people of many faiths.

It was between the 1920s and the 1970s that Monrovia established formal systemic racism through segregated city facilities (pool, churches), segregated retail businesses (restaurants, department stores, movie theaters), segregated education (Huntington Elementary), segregated housing (south of Olive), and segregated economic opportunities. In fact, Member Olivas’ great-grandparents, Louis and Lucinda Garcia, refused to sit in the back of Immaculate Conception Catholic Church which Mexican American construction workers helped to build in Monrovia in 1905-06. Louis Garcia was one of those builders.

⁵ Information from <https://www.census.gov/quickfacts/fact/table/monroviacitycalifornia,CA/PST045219>
⁶ For more historical information, see Susie Ling’s “History of African Americans in Monrovia” (2015) “*Recuerdos de Monrovia: History of Mexican Americans*” (2015), and “Monrovia’s Asian American History” (2020) at susieling.wordpress.com. Also see Richard Singer’s *1887: The History of Early Monrovia* (2020), *Renaissance Years: A History of Modern Monrovia* (2017), and Mary Ellen Romney MacArthur’s dissertation “De Facto Segregation in Monrovia, California: Almera A. Romney and Huntington Elementary School” (1993).

REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Between August of 2020 and March of 2021, the Ad-Hoc Committee reviewed the City's seven departments, and these are our findings and recommendations.

	California (Census 2019)	Monrovia City (Census 2019) n=36,331	Employees in 11/2020, n = 270
African American	6.5 %	5.4 %	4% = 10 individuals
Asian American plus Native Hawaiian	16.0	16.0	11% = 29 individuals
Hispanic/Latinx	39.4	41.1	38% = 104 individuals
Native or Indigenous	1.6	0.4	1% = 2 individuals
White	36.5	34.5	45% = 123 individuals
Two or More/Other/NA	4.0	5.8	1% = 2 individuals

I. Human Resources

Lauren Vasquez reported that in November of 2020, the City had a total of 211 full-time (FT) employees (including 41 police officers and 42 in the Fire Department), and 59 part-time individuals. These numbers are lower because of the pandemic; usually the City hovers near 240 full-time and 100 part-time. In 2018-19, the City recruited for 41 job openings, 20 in 2019-20, and 13 so far in 2020-21 (during the pandemic). Monrovia's HR must adhere to federal, state, and municipal codes, plus M.O.U.'s with 3 union bodies (General Employees, Police and Fire), and 2 unrepresented groups (Management and Mid-Management.)

It is observed that City staff are professional and have a positive team spirit. There is a Monrovia Employee Engagement Group that coordinates several social opportunities including "service days," annual awards, games, and picnics. Flexible schedules, tuition reimbursement, training opportunities, and other employee benefits are available.

Recommendations:

1. City/HR should state goals to increase ethnic, racial, and linguistic diversity in the staffing of all departments, and to encourage all personnel to be more sensitive to cultural bias in their dealings with clients and customers.
2. The Committee applauds the City's disaggregation of candidate pools for race/ethnicity, age, and gender at each stage of the hiring process to ascertain "bottleneck" problems and potential changes to alleviate such "bottlenecks." We want applicants to be successful.

3. Modify job descriptions:
 - a. Include statements about the City's history of racial diversity and its commitment to respecting diversity in job announcement's introductory profile of City.
 - b. Consider statement such as "demonstrated experience in diversity, equity, and inclusion" as a "desirable quality" in job announcements.
 - c. Establish other "bonus qualifications" i.e. multilingualism, community involvement.
4. Use third parties (e.g. HR managers from other institutions) to review job screening procedures with an emphasis on diversity, equity, and inclusion.
5. Diversify marketing and outreach procedures, with greater consideration for ethnic press, ethnic organizations, and social media outlets - especially for Police hires.
6. First and second-level hiring panel members should reflect diversity, and be trained in the awareness of unconscious bias. Hiring panel members might sign a pledge to respect diversity.
7. Second-level interviews should be less informal and use consistent procedures to level playing field.
8. Consider non-employees on certain hiring committees to encourage new perspectives. For example, a member of City's Preservation Committee might sit on hiring for Public Works Department, or Library Board member may sit in on the hiring of librarians.
9. New employee onboarding/training might include more discussion of Monrovia's history and commitment to diversity, equity, and inclusion. Questions about effectiveness in working with diverse clientele may be a formal item in staff evaluations.
10. City should line-item budget for continuing quality anti-bias training for all City personnel. Managers currently have one-to-one internal training. Training should include speakers from "outside the building" to provide fresh perspectives. Anti-bias training may also be extended to include part-time workers and City volunteers. Some of this educational process might include appreciation of Monrovia's wilderness, Monrovia's historical legacy, and even a tour of Monrovia's architecture.
11. HR must guard against bias in their evaluation process of employees.
12. HR should continue to work to enhance an equitable working environment for all employees. Anonymous work satisfaction surveys might be useful in every department.
13. The City should do quantitative and qualitative surveys of residents' satisfaction and needs. Such questions may include "Are you satisfied with the services of Monrovia Police Department? Library?", as well as open-ended questions such as "In what ways can the City be more effective in serving its multiethnic population?" Such surveys may be included with the water bill. These surveys should be done by every department in the City.

II. Monrovia Police Department

Established in 1903, Monrovia's Police Department - like other police departments - has a history of discrimination and bias. While this reputation does not accurately describe today's

officers, the Police Department must understand community sentiments cannot be easily erased.

In 1942, Julian Fisher was the first African American officer in Monrovia. Fisher was the officer designated to keep African Americans and Latinx in the segregated niche of Monrovia orderly. Louie Romero, past president of the Monrovia Latino Heritage Society, remembered the 1950s, “We called him *El Pescador*, and Fisher would sometimes warn us that his shift was ending. There was one other officer that would just harass us.”⁷ In 1956, 13-year-old Steven Kiyoshi Kuromiya was arrested for having sexual encounters with another boy.⁸ In Nov of 1971, 13-year-old African American Mark Allen was arrested for alleged shoplifting. By 6:25 pm, he was found dead in jail #M4 from an alleged suicide. Community rallies ensued, and the NAACP and the community demanded the hiring of more African American officers.⁹ Near 2008, MPD was in several lawsuits by former officers that alleged harassment.¹⁰ Such history is not forgotten.

According to Chief Sanvictores, in November of 2020, Monrovia PD had 41 FT peace officers (and recruiting to fill 9 slots). MPD should have 1 chief, 2 captains, 4 lieutenants, 7 sergeants, 6 detectives, 6 agents, and 24 patrol officers, or a total of 50. There are also non-sworn and part-time personnel in the 79-member department. MPD reports having a very difficult time recruiting officers to a small department. These are the number of fulltime sworn officers.

Male: 38 (90% of FT)
Female: 4 (10%)

White Male: 16 (38% of FT)
White Female: 3 (7%)
Hispanic Male: 16 (38%)
Hispanic Female: 1 (2%)
Asian Male: 5 (12%) including Chief Sanvictores
Asian Female: 0
Indigenous Male: 1 (2%)
Indigenous Female: 0
African American Male: 0
African American Female: 0

MPD works with POST (Peace Officer’s Standards and Training) to provide extensive training on a myriad of issues from racial and cultural diversity to domestic violence to terrorist prevention. MPD should be commended for effective programs including CARY (Chaplains for

⁷ Interview with Louie Romero by Susie Ling, 20 May 2013.
⁸ “Consideration of Posthumous Pardon for Steven Kiyoshi Kuromiya”, 26 Oct 2020 letter signed by Dylan Feik, City Manager at <https://www.cityofmonrovia.org/Home/ShowDocument?id=23730>.
⁹ Richard Singer. *Renaissance Years: A History of Monrovia* (2017), pp. 1-6.
¹⁰ “Monrovia Faces New Lawsuit by Police Officer,” 13 March 2009, *San Gabriel Valley Tribune*.

At-Risk Youth), MAGIC (Monrovia Anti-Gang Intervention Committee), Homeless Outreach Program, and collaboration with MUSD. MPD extended ride-along opportunities to members of this Committee.

This Committee applauds MPD’s community efforts including Spark of Love toy collection, National Night Out, Santa parade, and Breast Cancer Awareness.

Recommendations:

1. MPD should offer their award-winning “de-escalation simulation training” to some members of the public and MAP Adult/Youth Leadership Academy.
2. MPD should have a policy of not tolerating racism especially in light of the history of racial bias in the Department.
3. As MPD trains their officers daily, it may be beneficial to include outside subject experts, and community speakers to stimulate cultural awareness. MPD may also survey officers to their preference of training, resources, and professional services (i.e. rape counseling, working with homeless, working with immigrants).
4. MPD may investigate the need for special interest response teams eg homeless response team, mental health, etc.
5. As working with mental health clinicians has been deemed effective, Monrovia should seek to enhance this program. Monrovia should continue to train all officers on sensitivity to mental health issues.
6. MPD should establish anonymous surveys of officers about feeling marginalized or harassed. MPD should aim for unbiased evaluation of its officers.
7. MPD should include “cultural and racial sensitivity” as a formal criteria in their evaluation of officers and in their hiring criteria.
8. MPD needs to “think outside the box” in recruiting officers of color. It may be useful to seek the support of other Monrovia organizations from Monrovia-Duarte Black Alumni Association to the Chamber of Commerce in recruitment efforts. The Committee applauds efforts to track diversity at each stage of this long recruitment; this might help the ability to assess special needs at each stage.
9. MPD should explore the benefits of establishing a citizens/community advisory resource to provide support and collaboration.
10. The Fire and Police Departments should study their response data (timeliness and types) to various geographic neighborhoods in Monrovia. This is an important equity strategy.
11. MPD needs to have officers that mirror the racial make-up of the community it serves. This Committee applauds the Dec 2020 hire of 3 officers representing different racial backgrounds.

III. Administrative Services

This unit provides accounting and management support to other units in City Hall. About 50% of their “customers” are internal, 10% are with business vendors (i.e. street fair, Monrovia

Renewal construction, Athens), and 40% are utility customers/residents. Administrative Services does not keep separate statistics of the ethnicity of the utility customers. Some customers have special language needs, and others need financial flexibility. Staff speak Spanish, Chinese, and Tagalog. Staff tries to keep an eye on the most vulnerable of customers.

In December of 2020, there are 13 staff members, 2 part-timers, and 2 vacancies. 40% of this department are of Asian and Pacific Islander descent, 33% Hispanic, and 27% White (no African Americans, no Indigenous) and 80% female. Team work and customer service are highly stressed in this unit. Staff have biweekly meetings and mandatory harassment training every two years plus opportunities with Cal JPIA, GFOA, and CSMFO for technical and customer service training. These include selections for unconscious bias, workplace harassment, sensitivity training, and the like.

Recommendations

- 1. The Department should explore ways to address the linguistic needs of residents and customers, including on the City website. While there are translation services available on the Internet, using Chinese and Spanish words are a means of inclusion.
- 2. The Department should strive to ethnically diversify its staff.

IV. Community Development

This work unit under Craig Jimenez includes (1) Building and Safety, (2) Neighborhood and Business Services, (3) Planning, and (4) Administration. There are 23 full-timers and 3 part-timers of which 52% are white, 36% are Latinx, 1 African American and 1 Asian American. 52% of the staff is female.

The department seeks to address the needs of marginalized communities, especially of the disabled.

In 2006, this department established Monrovia Area Partnership (MAP). Of the 400 graduates, 50 are very active. MAP did intentionally try to recruit volunteers from certain neighborhoods. This department also sponsors the Youth Leadership Academy and youth employment for at-risk interns.

The department is concerned about changing state laws and the rising cost of housing in all of Southern California.

Recommendations

- 1. This City and thus this department inherits a history of redlining and racial segregation. The economic difference in neighborhoods is already engrained. Equitable policy may not be enough, a reparations attitude may be necessary. For example, the structures that receive "City of Monrovia Landmark" should be "outstanding examples of a certain

style of architecture”.¹¹ Does this overlook places that may have been homes of community heroes of more modest means? Can flexibility be built in to permit fee scales and the like?

2. While the Neighborhood Treasure Project has celebrated diversity, the loved bears and the painted utility boxes can also reflect diversity. Perhaps we have utility boxes painted with diverse children or of the likeness of women of Monrovia. City banners might include other languages or images that welcome and recognize diversity. A “bienvenidos” here and there is friendly. Why not go bold and do a large mural of a diversity theme - similar to the Diego Rivera murals at Monroe School or Kobe Bryant mural in Los Angeles. Murals can easily be replaced. The City may wish to involve Monrovia Association of Fine Arts in such projects.
3. The department staff should actively seek to collaborate with community members in reviewing its General Plan. It currently works with 5 committees including Planning Commission, Historic Preservation Commission, Board of Appeals, Art in Public Places Committee, and Development Review Committee.
4. The Monrovia Historical Museum should better incorporate our community’s diverse history, perhaps with permanent displays alongside the existing presentations of the City founders.
5. The City should collaborate with the Monrovia Housing and Tenants Advocates and other community groups to encourage and promote affordable housing in Monrovia.

V. Fire and Rescue Department

Established the 1906, the Department’s motto is “The Pride of Monrovia: Helping Anyone in Need.” In 2020 especially, the community of Monrovia has been very grateful for the professional services of the 46 members of the Fire Department through both the Covid pandemic and the Bobcat Fires. Fire and Rescue answer near 4600 calls per year. The 46 department members - organized in 3 teams - go through constant training as deemed necessary by California regulations. Chief Brad Dover said that the department focuses on customer service, and has a healthy team spirit and “grit”. The average age of the department members is 38.9 and Monrovia firefighters average 10 years tenure in Monrovia. 15% of this department volunteer to be peer counselors for other firefighters. The department is active with many community activities including City of Hope, Make a Difference Day, Rotary, Boy Scouts, Monrovia Reads, Spark of Love, Muscular Dystrophy Association, and with burn units.

Monrovia Fire and Rescue has a “CERT” (Community Emergency Response Team) of about 80 trained volunteers, many of whom are retired. Attempts at recruiting young CERT members was tried, but not as successful. A *Listos* CERT class hopes to train more volunteers in the Spanish language.

¹¹ Quoted from <https://www.cityofmonrovia.org/your-government/community-development/historic-preservation/historic-landmarks>.

Recommendations

1. The Committee concurs with the Chief on the needs to continue to train on diversity sensitivity, and to diversify the department's staff. 93% of the staff is male, with 67% White, 20% Latinx, 9% Asian Pacific American, and 4% African American. It should be noted that some of officers are of mixed race and/or raised in other nations and cultures.
2. The Committee concurs with the Chief that the department needs to be wary of "group think" or a "fixed mindset", especially as it is a tight male community. Fire departments inherit a lot of tradition and stereotypes.
3. While the Committee applauds the generous charitable efforts of the department, the perpetuation of cultural norms is noted. For example, the Sparks of Love toy drive is associated with Christmas, a religious holiday not celebrated by all. Gender neutral toys - or books - might be encouraged. Perhaps, the unit can purposefully share female firefighter figurines at their toy giveaway program, or share stories of female firefighters at Monrovia Read events.
4. The Committee recommends regularly gathering anonymous survey data on employee satisfaction, especially employees of historically marginalized experiences. It may not be adequate to depend on casual observations or verbal reports.
5. The Committee recommends regularly gathering survey data from customers or client base - from other internal departments (eg Public Works) to Monrovia businesses and residents. The staff should purposefully gather data from historically underrepresented communities. This is a healthy way to receive honest feedback.
6. The Fire and Police Departments should study their response data (timeliness and types) to various geographic neighborhoods. This is an important equity strategy.

VI. Community Services Department

This department is divided into Administration, Library Services and Recreational Services. The staff includes 22 full-timers and between 40 to 60 part-timers. Two thirds of the staff are women, and 30% live in Monrovia. Director Tina Cherry reports that the division focuses on open door policy and team work. For example, library staff are each charged with a "learning hour" each week with an annual summit. As with all City of Monrovia staff, training on unconscious bias and customer relations are mandatory.

Prior to Covid, Rec Services coordinated some 30 community events and just opened a successful community garden. They have programs for underserved seniors, disabled, and youth. With the quarantine, the staff has focused on innovations including Movies in the Park. The Library offers free Wifi, printing, and has established a "literacy" van that brings books on high density housing areas that may be further from the physical library. After the quarantine, the Library coordinated virtual story time in English and Spanish languages, curbside pick-up, delivery to seniors, etc.

Three community Commissions include Community Services (7 members), Library (5 members), and Old Town Advisory (5 members). There are also Teen Advisory Board, Youth Commission, and paid summer internship program.

Notably, the Community Services Department has an impressive list of “community partners” ranging from the Monrovia Latino Heritage Society to Monrovia Association of Fine Arts (MAFA). This allows community and the department to “collaborate rather than duplicate.” Even members of this Ad-Hoc Committee reported great ease in working with the Library on past projects.

This Ad-Hoc Committee commended the department for its work – before and after quarantine.

Recommendations

- 1.** Outreach – especially to marginalized niches and non-users – needs to continue to be a priority for this department. Perhaps community brainstorming sessions on this matter would be of service. Consideration may be given to widen the Library Board membership.
- 2.** Intentional focus on programs of diversity and inclusion for the community would be welcomed. For example, a book club on diversity issues may be attempted. The 2020 Juneteenth program at Station Square Park was successful.
- 3.** As the Library has developed a strategic plan for its development, perhaps Recreational Services may consider the same.
- 4.** Diversity of staff – full-time and part-time – should remain a priority.
- 5.** The City and Department should be intentional in getting staff response to work place satisfaction, and consistent in obtaining customer evaluations.

VII. Public Works Department

Director Sean Sullivan reports that the department consists of (1) Administration, (2) Engineering, and (3) Field Services. There are 32 full-time employees and no part-timers, of which 84% are male and 53% Hispanic, 31% White, 10% Asian, and 6% African American. The City uses contractors for tree trimming, garbage collection, sidewalk maintenance, special cleaning, utilities, etc. The unit is always on call, and provides safe and compliant water and physical surroundings for the citizens.

As Monrovia has a history of segregation, Public Works inherits problems of uneven distribution of resources – from heavy use of streets to size of road verges near sidewalks, etc.

As with other departments in the City, the staff works well together and has developed a reputation of “liking to eat” in employee social gatherings. All City staff receive non-harassment

training for one hour per year and modernized customer service workshops. This group also receives safety and technical training relevant to their positions.

The department and its contractors offer special consideration for marginalized groups (i.e. senior discounts for water), as well as Monrovia Transit.

Recommendations

- 1. The department should prioritize the diversification of its staff despite the industry being heavily male. As in some of its positions, the department provides training, there might be more innovative ways to recruit applicants, especially women and African Americans.
- 2. The department may explore more contracts with women-owned or minority-owned businesses.

FINAL RECOMMENDATIONS ON ACCOUNTABILITY

Accountability - short-term and long-term - is of great importance to this Committee. The City Council, every City employee, every City agency and organization, and every resident must make inclusion and equity our intentional and shared goal.

- 1. The City Manager and each of the seven departments of the City should respond in written form to the City Council within six months of this report submission. By November 2021, the Manager and departments should highlight their responses to these Ad-Hoc Committee recommendations. In April of 2022, there should be a follow-up review of this report by City Council.
- 2. District-based voting and representation may be a means to bring more equity to the City of Monrovia. While the due diligence and leadership of the current City Council members are noted, the value of district-based voting for Monrovia should be studied by a citizens group.
- 3. Even during pandemics, it is important that the City and City Council allow residents' comments and feedback during meetings and activities.
- 4. It has come to our attention that other cities such as San Gabriel, Culver City, Temecula - and SCAG - have established permanent commissions on equity issues, similar to that of Los Angeles County's Human Relations Commission.

It is the recommendation of this Ad-Hoc Committee that, at this time, instead of having a special committee on equity issues, that every single niche of the City be charged with - to borrow the words of the San Gabriel HEAR Commission - "advancing and advocating for equity, access, diversity, and social justice, safety, mutual appreciation, increased cultural competency, positive inter-group relations, and respect for all members of the community". It is the

responsibility of Monrovia City Council and all City staff to be aware of such concerns in all that they do.

Monrovia City Council may wish to re-consider an equity commission at a later date.

San Gabriel: <https://www.sangabrielcity.com/1501/HEAR-Commission#:~:text=The%20purpose%20of%20the%20HEAR,of%20the%20San%20Gabriel%20community>

Culver City: <https://www.culvercity.org/City-Hall/Boards-Commissions/Equity-Human-Relations-Advisory-Committee-EHRAC>

Temecula: <https://temeculaca.gov/1421/Race-Equity-Diversity-and-Inclusion-Comm>

SCAG: <https://scag.ca.gov/special-committee-equity-and-social-justice>

Attachment 1: A Sample of Relevant Monrovia Organizations

ChangeMakers

Foothill Unity Center

Interfaith Council

Monrovia Area Partnership (MAP)

Monrovia-Duarte Black Alumni Association

Monrovia Historic Preservation Group

Monrovia Historical Museum

Monrovia Historical Society

Monrovia Housing and Tenants' Advocates

Monrovia Latino Heritage Society

Attachment 2: Resources

On Community Development:

<https://ncrc.org/gentrification/>

<https://www.urban.org/sites/default/files/publication/51666/311218-City-Government-s-Role-in-the-Community-Development-System.PDF>

On Department Wide Intentional Plan:

<https://diversity.berkeley.edu/about/strategic-plan>

On Police Accountability:

<https://www.nacole.org/>

Resource on Housing

Carol Daley's attachments and comments of 4/15

<https://www.cityofmonrovia.org/home/showpublisheddocument?id=25347>

Attachment 3: Some Public Comments

From: [Carol Daley](#)
To: [Office of Public Information](#)
Subject: Ad-Hoc Committee April 15, 2021 For the record
Date: Thursday, April 15, 2021 2:40:23 AM
Attachments: [Letter to Ad Hoc Committee on Equity and Inclusion April 14, 2021.docx](#)
[Housing - We need inclusionary affordable housing NOW!.docx](#)
[Housing Team- Inclusionary Zoning Ordinance 101.docx](#)

Dear Madam Chair Yuille and Monrovia Ad-Hoc Committee on Equity and Inclusion, 4/14/21

I think you all did quite good with the justice and equality document that you have collaborated and put together. Some of the statistics in it are mind-blowing! I like your suggestions and ideas of follow-up with the different departments. There is one critical area, however, that I feel is lacking: fair, inclusionary and equitable availability to affordable housing in our city.

Re: Under IV. Community Development

I would like to address this statement in the document: *"The department is concerned about changing state laws and the rising cost of housing in all of Southern California."*

Does the committee really think that the City of Monrovia will be influential about changing the state laws, or be able to do anything about the rising cost of housing in So California? So meanwhile, why don't we work on what 'Monrovia' **can do** to deal with the rising cost of housing and how our city can address the needs of our citizens that are being driven out of our city if they are at the lower end of income levels and can no longer afford to live here?

The last time the Ad-Hoc team met, I submitted the suggestion of adding **'that our city needs an affordable inclusionary zoning ordinance'**. I felt the matter was just *'dismissed'* without any real discussion by all. At the heart of our city are families. Families need housing. They need equal shots at jobs. They need equal representation within our city. But at the heart of everything, they need affordable housing.

I would like to suggest, that in your document, as number one on the recommendations, it needs a 'map' on how to achieve, or work towards affordable housing in our city. By suggesting an **'affordable inclusionary zoning ordinance'**, you are actually supporting something that has some teeth in it, something significantly more than words, words, words about 'we want affordable housing'. HOW DO YOU ACHIEVE IT? This is how. This is the roadmap! This is do-able and it costs the city nothing!

Respectfully submitted,

Carol Daley

PS. I should also mention, that there are different levels of affordable housing as defined by the state: above moderate, moderate, low, very low, extremely low. A lot of times people think that when we are talking about extremely low, we are talking about the 'people living on the street'. I would like to put a face on the 'extremely low' income level.

I worked for the Monrovia Post Office for 30 years, making \$50,000/year. In retirement I make about half that, and if I were a single household, with my annual salary of **\$27,324, I would fall into the extremely low category**. So, I think you see and realize, many people in our city were not blessed to have had such a good job like myself, and that many of our citizens would obviously fall into the extremely low income level as well. My point is, don't get scared by the term, 'extremely low income.'

PS. I have attached a few documents that were written in the past that discuss Inclusionary Zoning Ordinances.

March 24, 2021

City of Monrovia
Ad Hoc Committee on Equity and Inclusion
Chair Ruhyyih Yuille
Vice Chair Edward Elizalde
Committee Members:
Susie Ling
Henry Olivas
Rev. Neil Tadken

By Email: cityclerk@ci.monrovia.ca.us

Re: Public Comment for March 25th, 2021 Committee Meeting

Dear Chair Yuille, Vice Chair Elizalde, and Committee Members Ling, Olivas, and Tadken:

My name is John Shaw and I am a grateful resident of Monrovia. Thank you for your time and efforts to make our town a better place to live for all citizens.

Throughout 2020, many repulsive incidents awakened the United States to our crisis of racial injustice. It wasn't anything new; we just didn't pay much attention throughout the history of our country. Now, despite our collective wishes to put 2020 behind us, even more despicable acts have proven that this crisis isn't going away.

With the creation of the Ad Hoc Committee on Equity and Inclusion, City Council took an important step to listen to the concerns of Monrovia's citizens and lead the way with needed recommendations and actions.

One vital recommendation of the Committee should be to create a permanent Human Relations Commission charged with continuing your efforts.

Monrovia has several boards and commissions. Groups like the Planning Commission, the Community Services Commission, the Development Review Committee, and others take on the important work of making our town a better place to live. I submit that a permanent commission, charged with continually assessing needs and acting to improve equity and inclusion across Monrovia, is just as important as any other commission or board.

Some would argue that a permanent commission isn't needed because Monrovia doesn't have a "problem". We must resist finding comfort in these claims. Instead, we must amplify the voices of our whole community and take the lead across a country in crisis – in crisis in large part because cries for change have too often been silenced or ignored.

One sign at last June's Library Park protests said this: "YOU SHOULD HAVE LISTENED". My hope is that we will listen – continually - and take action. Creating a permanent commission to continue the work of the Ad Hoc Committee will be vital for all citizens of Monrovia.

Sincerely,



John Shaw



From: Melissa Taylor
To: Office of Public Information
Subject: Ad Hoc Committee Public Comment
Date: Thursday, March 25, 2021 9:05:43 AM

Good Evening Members of the Ad Hoc Committee on Equity and Inclusion,

Thank you for the hard work over this past year to better understand Monrovia's diversity, equity, and inclusion issues. It is my hope that part of your recommendation will be to create a permanent DEI commission similar to other California cities coming to terms with their past . This started as a result of the Black Lives Matter movement, and now we are becoming aware of the Anti-Asian culture that is taking place, I believe it is important to have this oversight to hold departments and people accountable. We will need you (or your successors) to be the watchdog to ensure all of these suggestions are implemented and maintained. As more people find their voice, I believe we will hear from other previously oppressed communities.

Additionally, I do think that part of the commission's goal will be bringing awareness to the community (I am thinking of the Easter bunnies I see throughout Old Town, but nothing for Passover, or nothing for Women's History Month, or Black History Month, or the Lunar New Year). There are so many ways we can celebrate our diversity here in Monrovia, and I would hate to see them ignored because the committee has been dissolved. This would be a great opportunity to bring the community together and restructure MAP to encourage discussions about the historical context of our town. Redlining is one thing, but also our housing prices have ballooned causing further diversion between those who can afford to live here vs. those who grew up here. Again, thank you for doing the hard work, asking the tough questions, and helping move our city move forward.

