



# HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION STAFF REPORT

**APPLICATION:** Historic District HD-2      **AGENDA ITEM:** PH-1  
**PREPARED BY:** Craig Jimenez, Director      **MEETING DATE:** March 22, 2017  
Community Development

---

**SUBJECT:** Historic District HD-2  
North Encinitas Historic District  
100 and 200 blocks of North Encinitas Avenue  
Encinitas Historic District Working Group, Applicant

**REQUEST:** Designation of a North Encinitas Historic District

**BACKGROUND:** The City of Monrovia has received an application for historic district designation for the 100 and 200 blocks of North Encinitas Avenue. The proposed district encompasses the majority of residentially developed properties on both sides of North Encinitas Avenue between Foothill Boulevard and Greystone Avenue.

The Historic Preservation Ordinance (Ord. 95-01) establishes the criteria and regulations pertaining to historic landmarks and historic districts. In 2008, the Wild Rose Tract Historic District was designated as Monrovia's first historic district. This effort was recognized by the state with a 2009 Governor's Preservation Award.

Based on concerns about mansionization, the residents of the 100 and 200 blocks of North Encinitas Avenue began discussing the potential of designating this area as a historic district. City staff held a neighborhood meeting on March 19, 2015 to provide information to residents about the process. To gain a better understanding about the support of district designation among the property owners, a petition was circulated. The petition included 42 signatures of (out of 64) property owners who were in favor. This provided the needed property owner consent to move forward on the application.

The petition was submitted to the City to initiate the designation process for the district. Within the proposed district boundaries there are 64 parcels. Under the provisions of the Monrovia Municipal Code, the City cannot accept an application without a majority consenting to the application (50% plus 1). Each property owner within the proposed district boundaries is entitled to one "vote". In this case, 33 is the required number of affirmative responses requires.

Although the number of property owners was enough to process the application, the Municipal Code requires that *all* property owners have the opportunity to vote on the proposed application. On July 12, 2016, staff mailed ballots with self addressed stamped envelopes to the remaining property owners. Of the ballots mailed, 10 were opposed to the application; 12 did not respond. Based on the 42 affirmative responses, the application was then able to proceed.

This process was driven by the neighborhood. A group of residents formed the Encinitas Historic District working group (EHDwg) to research and compile the information needed for the application. Working collaboratively with City Staff, EHDwg prepared and submitted the application for historic district designation. Their efforts are documented in the North Encinitas Historic District Historic Context and Survey.

The field of Historic Preservation is based on established protocol for documentation and designation for individual landmarks and historic districts. Using this basis, communities can then tailor programs and process based local considerations.

Based on this protocol, the City's local ordinance, information provided in the application and additional research, staff prepared the *Historic Context and Survey* for the proposed district which is attached. The report fully documents the evaluation of the district and includes the Historic Context Statement, background information, evaluation of each property and evaluation of the district as a whole.

**DISCUSSION:** The basis for determining the historic value and significance of the district is the historic context, which gives a broad overview of the history and development of a community. The context is important in establishing the significance of the district and provides the framework for the evaluation of the district. It helps to answer the question: why is this area significant?

If a district is established, all properties located within the boundaries of the district, whether they are considered historic or not, are under the purview of the Historic Preservation Commission when exterior changes are proposed. *Contributors*, those properties that "provide substance" or *contribute* to the district's character and significance as determined by the context, are considered by the City as Historic Landmarks in all respects and therefore eligible for the same incentives, including a Mills Act Contract. They are also subject to the same review processes. A *noncontributor*, while geographically within a district's boundary, does not fall within the context, theme or period of significance identified in the designation statement or they have been altered to the extent that they no longer convey the significance of the district. They lack historic *integrity*. Exterior changes to noncontributors are also under the Commission's purview; however these modifications are reviewed at a lower threshold than that of contributor.

### **North Encinitas Historic District Overview**

The North Encinitas Historic District in many ways is like many other neighborhoods in Monrovia, especially neighborhoods north of Foothill Boulevard. The district is comprised of mostly single family residential structures. However, several low-density multifamily properties sporadically occur throughout the district reflecting the current and historic zoning regulations. It still, however, retains the character of a single-family neighborhood. Below is a summary of the findings contained in the *Historic Context and Survey*.

Periods of significance/contexts. Within the boundaries of the North Encinitas Historic District, there are 64 individual properties. This neighborhood represents close to 130 years of residential development. As originally envisioned, this neighborhood could justify several periods of significance representing a broad span of development history within the City of Monrovia. Historic districts may span several periods of development if the district overall reflects a strong sense of a specific time and place.

However, as the evaluation continued, it became apparent that the predominant development pattern of the district is narrow. Of the 64 properties, 41 (64%) were developed within a 21-year timeframe (1901-1922). Additionally, there are three remaining structures that were built in the 19<sup>th</sup> Century. The overwhelming majority (69%) of the properties fall into two (citywide) periods of significance from Monrovia's founding to the Great Depression.

From the theme of architectural style, all the structures within the periods of significance, with the exception of two reflect Victorian-era or Craftsman influences. It is interesting to note, that of all the dwellings constructed between 1888 and 1922, only one was not originally wood-sided. That house, at 271, a Tudor Revival also represents the only house from the Eclectic Period of the mid-1920s.

Themes. Within the context of the periods of significance (1886-1929), the North Encinitas Historic District in Monrovia is significant under two themes:

- Planning and development and its relationship to the broad patterns of community development in Monrovia.
- Important examples of architectural styles common in Monrovia during the first quarter of the 20<sup>th</sup> century.

There are 64 properties within the proposed district boundaries. Using the basis of the context, periods of significance and themes, each primary dwelling was evaluated and documented on a separate DPR Form. Each structure was rated using the California Historical Resource Status (CHRS) Codes. Only the eligibility for local district designation was considered, therefore the status codes used are limited to the following:

- **5D3** – Appears to be a contributor to a district that appears eligible for local listing or designation through survey evaluation.
- **5B** – Locally significant both individually (listed, eligible, or appears eligible) and as contributor to a district that is locally listed, designated, determined eligible, or appears eligible through survey evaluation.
- **5S2** – Eligible for local listing or designation (CHRS given to the district as a whole).
- **6Z** – Found ineligible for NR (National Register), CR (California Register) or Local designation through survey evaluation.

Note: if district designation is approved, the 5D2 and 5S2 codes will be changed to 5D1 and 5S1.

The table in Attachment A summarizes the results of the survey.

### Summary of findings

- The two oldest dwellings were built in 1888, based on Tax Assessor Records.
- Three were built in the first period of significance (1886-1899).
- The majority of houses (41) were built between 1901 and 1922. This represents 64% of the properties.
- 44 of the 64 properties (69%) in the district were built within the two periods of significance (1886-1929). Six of those no longer retain the necessary integrity to be classified as contributing properties.
- 38 properties (59% of the entire district) are contributors. Of the contributors, 25 are Craftsman (66%); 16 are Victorian-era influenced styles (42%).
- There are 9 designated Monrovia historic landmarks.
- 20 of the 38 contributors (53%) were rated 5B (also individually significant).

### Criteria and Guidelines

The district contains a concentration of structures representing the development of Monrovia's early neighborhoods as well as a high number of the Victorian-era or Craftsman influenced architectural styles. This provides two themes: planning and community development and architecture as the basis for evaluation.

Based on the high concentration of structures built in the first quarter of the 20<sup>th</sup> century and the integrity of the contributors, the North Encinitas Historic District appears eligible for local designation under Title 17 of the City of Monrovia Municipal Code. Based on the provisions of the Historic Preservation Ordinance, the district meets the following criteria:

- **Criteria Number 3.** It contributes to the significance of a historic area that is geographically and visually definable. The area possesses a high concentration of historic and architecturally related grouping of properties which contribute to each other and are unified aesthetically through the design and setting. The district consists of about half of the Keefer Subdivision, the first subdivision to be platted for residential development north of Foothill Boulevard. The process of subdivision outside the Monrovia Tract and the platted Town of Monrovia was an important factor in the City's expansive growth during the first two years after the town was

founded through the end of the real estate boom in 1888. The district is important in illustrating Monrovia's early development and subdivisions outside the original townsite. These two blocks represent the process of early twentieth century suburban development in southern California and Monrovia, especially residential development by the middle-class early residents of Monrovia.

The district is also an example of the process of community development and the evolution of Monrovia to a suburban residential community. The 100 and 200 blocks of North Encinitas Avenue remain one of Monrovia's most concentrated neighborhoods with homes from the early 1900s. By 1922, almost three-fourths of the neighborhood was developed.

The District is significant for its association with the development of a cohesive neighborhood of working class families in Monrovia from 1888 to 1922. Sixty nine percent of the properties in the district have primary structures dating to the two periods of significance and 59% (38) are contributing.

- **Criteria Number 4.** The contributing structures in the district embody the characteristics of the Victorian-era and Craftsman architectural styles including the use of distinctive design, materials, detail and craftsmanship. In general, the residences found in the district are modest in scale, style, and detailing. Most retain a high degree of integrity. The majority of the neighborhood developed in a fairly short time period and the district displays the evolution of architectural styles and stylistic treatments to buildings in Monrovia during the first quarter of the 20<sup>th</sup> Century.
- **Criteria Number 6.** The 100 and 200 blocks of North Encinitas Avenue incorporate elements that help preserve and protect an area of historic interest in the City of Monrovia. The district is significant for its association with the development of a cohesive neighborhood of working class families from 1888 to 1922.

**RECOMMENDATION:** Staff recommends that the Historic Preservation Commission forward a Nomination Statement to the City Council recommending that this area be designated as the North Encinitas Historic District. If the Commission concurs, then following the public hearing, the following motion is appropriate:

**Designate the North Encinitas Historic District, as Historic District Number 2, and so recommend to the City Council.**

## North Encinitas Historic District Property Evaluation

Site Address	Year Built	Style	CHRS	HL
116 N ENCINITAS AVE	1921	Craftsman	5D3	
120 N ENCINITAS AVE	1976	Ranch	6Z	
122 N ENCINITAS AVE	1888	National	6L	
130 N ENCINITAS AVE	1906	Transitional Victorian	5B	
133 N ENCINITAS AVE	1908	Transitional Victorian	5D3	
134 N ENCINITAS AVE	1908	Transitional Victorian	6Z	
137 N ENCINITAS AVE	1988/1947	Vernacular	6Z	
138 N ENCINITAS AVE	1999	New Traditional Craftsman	6Z	
141 N ENCINITAS AVE	1912	Craftsman	5D3	
144 N ENCINITAS AVE	1921	Craftsman	5D3	
145 N ENCINITAS AVE	1910	MP Folk Victorian	6Z	
148 N ENCINITAS AVE	1912	Colonial Revival Bungalow	5D3	
149 N ENCINITAS AVE	1975	Ranch	6Z	
152 N ENCINITAS AVE	1921	Craftsman	5D3	
155 N ENCINITAS AVE	1901	Transitional Victorian	5B	
156 N ENCINITAS AVE	1913	Craftsman	5B	
159 N ENCINITAS AVE	1906	Transitional Victorian	5B	
160 N ENCINITAS AVE	1922	Craftsman	6Z	
163 N ENCINITAS AVE	1961/1942	Minimal Traditional (moved)	6L	
164 N ENCINITAS AVE	1920	Craftsman	5B	HL-92
167 N ENCINITAS AVE	1902	Queen Anne	5B	
168 N ENCINITAS AVE	1912	Craftsman	5D3	
171 N ENCINITAS AVE	1910	Transitional Victorian	5D3	
172 N ENCINITAS AVE	1906	Transitional Victorian	5B	
175 N ENCINITAS AVE	1910	Transitional Victorian	6Z	
176 N ENCINITAS AVE	1912	Craftsman	5B	
177 N ENCINITAS AVE	1910	Craftsman	5B	
180 N ENCINITAS AVE	1920	Craftsman	5D3	
201 N ENCINITAS AVE	1903	Queen Anne	5B	HL-68
202 N ENCINITAS AVE	1951	Minimal Traditional	6L	
205 N ENCINITAS AVE	1911	Craftsman/Bungalow	5B	HL-39
208 N ENCINITAS AVE	1945	Minimal Traditional	6L	
209 N ENCINITAS AVE	1907	Transitional Victorian	5D3	
210 N ENCINITAS AVE	1888	Folk Victorian	6L	
214/216 N ENCINITAS AVE	1913	Craftsman	5B	HL-114
217 N ENCINITAS AVE	1904	Transitional Victorian	5D3	
219 N ENCINITAS AVE	1911	Craftsman	5D3	
220 N ENCINITAS AVE	1906	Vernacular Cottage	5B	HL-105
223 N ENCINITAS AVE	1953	Minimal Traditional	6Z	
224 N ENCINITAS AVE	1904	National/Craftsman	5B	HL-72
227 N ENCINITAS AVE	1905	Folk Victorian	5B	
228 N ENCINITAS AVE	1914	Craftsman	5D3	
231 N ENCINITAS AVE	1896	Queen Anne Transitional	5B	
232 N ENCINITAS AVE	2001	New Traditional	6Z	
235 N ENCINITAS AVE	2008/1948	New Traditional	6Z	
236 N ENCINITAS AVE	1910	National/Craftsman	5D3	
239 N ENCINITAS AVE	2002	American Vernacular	6Z	
242 N ENCINITAS AVE	1953	Minimal Traditional	6Z	
243 N ENCINITAS AVE	1908	American Foursquare	5B	HL-38
244 N ENCINITAS AVE	1965	Ranch	6Z	
246 N ENCINITAS AVE	1912	National/Craftsman	5D3	
247 N ENCINITAS AVE	1961	American Vernacular	6Z	
251 N ENCINITAS AVE	1913	Craftsman	5B	HL-31
252 N ENCINITAS AVE	1922	Craftsman	5D3	
255 N ENCINITAS AVE	2004	New Traditional Victorian	6Z	
256 N ENCINITAS AVE	1921	Craftsman	5D2	
259 N ENCINITAS AVE	2006	American Vernacular	6Z	
260 N ENCINITAS AVE	1921	Craftsman	5D3	
263 N ENCINITAS AVE	1914	Craftsman	5B	HL-75
264 N ENCINITAS AVE	1948	Minimal Traditional	6L	
267 N ENCINITAS AVE	2002/1948	New Traditional Craftsman	6Z	
268 N ENCINITAS AVE	1948	Minimal Traditional	6L	
271 N ENCINITAS AVE	1922	Tudor	5B	
272 N ENCINITAS AVE	2007	New Traditional Craftsman	6Z	