

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION STAFF REPORT

APPLICATION: DPR2017-01 AGENDA ITEM: AR-3

PREPARED BY: Sheri Bermejo MEETING DATE: January 25, 2017

Planning Division Manager

SUBJECT: Determination of Historic Significance

902, 902A and 902B West Colorado Boulevard

APPLICANT: Todd Bowden

212 West Foothill Boulevard

Monrovia, CA 91016

REQUEST: Determine the historic significance of two residential buildings built

within the historic period (50 years or older) that are proposed for

demolition

BACKGROUND: On September 20, 2016, the City Council adopted revised demolition permit review regulations (Ordinance 2016-10) as a preservation effort to further discourage the demolition and substantial alteration of potential significant residential structures that contribute to the defining character of the City of Monrovia. The new demolition review standards became effective on October 20, 2016 and apply to main residential buildings in any zone that are fifty (50) years old or older proposing total demolition or significant alteration or removal of exterior building wall area and/or roof area.

The new application requirements require the submittal of either documentation from a historic survey that indicates a California Historical Resource Status (CHRS) code for the subject building and other site data, a historic assessment and determination of CHRS code for the property by a qualified historic preservation consultant, or a written request for an exemption due to obvious lack of historic significance.

The evaluation and determination made by the Historic Preservation Commission is in the form of an approval of a DPR Form, which includes the assignment of a California Historical Resource Status Code (CHRS code). The determination made by the Commission using the CHRS codes is the first step in the process and will be part of the overall evaluation of the "project" pursuant to the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA).

Because CEQA defines "project" as the whole of an action, all components, parts and phases of the activity or permit must be considered in making the environmental determination for the project. Evaluating each part separately is referred to as "piecemealing" which is expressly prohibited. Therefore in the case of a demolition, since it is typically part of a larger project, the potential impacts of the demolition are part of the overall project environmental review. The Commission is not approving or denying the demolition, this review is only the first step in the entitlement process.

On November 14, 2016, the owner of 902 West Colorado Boulevard submitted an application to demolish all structures onsite, consisting of a primary residence, a duplex, and a carport with an attached accessory building which were built within the historic period (50 years of age or older). The application was supplemented with a professional historic assessment and DPR form prepared by LSA Associates, Inc. (LSA), dated December 22, 2016, which have been attached to this report as Exhibit "A." Based on the findings of the historic assessment, the property does not meet any of the local criteria for landmark designation.

DISCUSSION: The subject multiple-family property is located on the south side of West Colorado Boulevard between North 5th Avenue and Monterey Avenue. The property is developed with a primary residence (902 West Colorado Boulevard), a duplex (902A and 902B West Colorado Boulevard), and a two-car carport with an attached ancillary room.

According to LSA's historic assessment, the residential structures mostly resemble the Ranch architectural style, and include single-story floor plans with low-pitched cross-gabled roof structures and exposed round rafter tails. The majority of the exterior walls are clad in stucco with some board-and-batten siding. Several window types are found on the structures, ranging from wood framed double-hung and single-hung windows, aluminum framed sliding windows, and wood framed multi-paned casement windows.

The results of the formal historic assessment indicate that although the primary residence was constructed in 1920 during Monrovia's prime single-family residential development period (1886-1940), due to alterations it no longer conveys an association with that period. The assessment further indicates that while the structure has character defining features of the Ranch style, it is a very modest example and it is not a particular significant or good representation of the style.

The property was improved with the duplex in 1948, which historically was near the beginning of the post-WWI single-person housing, or apartment housing, boom in Monrovia. As noted in the assessment, the most significant period of this development trend occurred during the mid-1960s and 1970s, when adult postwar baby boomers were less likely to wait until marriage to leave their parents' households. The residential development during this later period consisted of multiple two-story buildings with separate, common parking structures. In summary, the assessment concludes that the residential duplex pre-dates the apartment boom and is not associated with the single-person housing trend.

The DPR form prepared for the property indicates that the residential buildings were constructed, expanded, and altered over the course of twenty-eight years using common materials and construction practices. LSA's review of online research and historic newspaper articles did not yield information suggesting that anyone associated with the residences during the historic period is significant in history. Information on the architect or builder was also not found during archival research. LSA completed a windshield survey as part of the assessment to verify if the property was located in a potential historic district. The DPR states that many of the other buildings in the surrounding area have also been altered or are modern. Therefore, based on the information presented in the historic assessment LSA assigned the property a CHRS code of 6Z. A 6Z status is assigned to properties that do not meet any of the criteria required for landmark designation.

RECOMMENDATION: Staff recommends that the Historic Preservation Commission find that the residential structures located at 902, 902A and 902B West Colorado Boulevard are not eligible for landmark status and assign a CHRS code of 6Z to the property. If the Commission concurs with this recommendation the following motion is appropriate:

Approve the DPR Form with a Status Code of 6Z finding that the residential structures at 902, 902A and 902B do not have architectural or known historic value that meet the criteria for local landmark status.



BERKELEY
CARLSBAD
FRESNO
IRVINE
PALM SPRINGS
POINT RICHMOND
RIVERSIDE
ROCKLIN
SAN LUIS OBISPO

MEMORANDUM

Date: December 22, 2016

To: Todd Bowden

Bowden Development, Inc.

FROM: Elisa Bechtel, MLitt

LSA Associates, Inc.

Subject: 902 West Colorado Boulevard, City of Monrovia, Los Angeles County, California (LSA

Project No. BOW1602)

LSA has completed the evaluation of 902 West Colorado Boulevard in the City of Monrovia. In summary, the multiple-family property does not meet the criteria for listing in the California Register of Historical Resources (California Register) or the local landmark criteria and is not a "historical resource" for purposes of the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA). Additional information is provided below and in the attached documentation.

METHODS

On December 1, 2016, LSA conducted an intensive-level historic resources survey of the property. During the survey, digital photographs were taken of all building elevations, character-defining features, and context views. Detailed notes regarding the architectural features and integrity were made and a windshield survey of the surrounding area was completed to determine the condition of the current setting.

Archival research on the history and development of the property and surrounding area was undertaken to determine the construction, use, and ownership history of the buildings, as well as important themes in history that may have been associated with the property. Both primary and secondary sources of information such as building permits, historic maps and photographs, newspaper articles, and written histories of Monrovia were utilized in this endeavor.

LSA evaluated three historic-period (50 years of age or older) buildings (a primary residence, a duplex, and a carport with attached ancillary building) for significance in accordance with the California Register, as well as the local ordinance and its landmark criteria. Results of the aforementioned efforts were documented on State of California Department of Parks and Recreation (DPR) forms.



RESULTS

Archival research indicates that the property is associated with Monrovia's pre- and post-World War II suburban development booms. The first building on the site, the primary residence (902 West Colorado Boulevard), was constructed in 1920, followed by the construction of the duplex (902A and 902B West Colorado Boulevard) in 1948.

Residential development in the period between 1886-1940 cemented Monrovia as a single-family residential community and provided the foundation for the city's layout and built environment as they exist today. The primary residence was constructed in 1920 at a time when the City's development of single-family properties was at its height, however, alterations have compromised its ability to convey an association with that period. The property was expanded into a multiple-family property at the beginning of the post-WWII residential boom. However, it is not associated with the most significant part of that boom in Monrovia, which came later and related to demographic changes in the 1960s that resulted in a demand for single-person housing. The property is not associated with or representative of that event and within the larger historic context of housing development from 1945-1973, this modest, altered multiple-family property is unimportant and insignificant.

For these reasons, the property does not meet any of the California Register or local criteria. A more detailed history and the complete evaluation can be found in the attached DPR forms.

CONCLUSION

Based on the foregoing information, the property does not qualify as a "historical resource" as defined by CEQA. Therefore, the City of Monrovia may reach a finding of No Impact regarding historic-period built environment resources.

Please let me know if you have any questions regarding this information.

Attachments: DPR Forms

State of California — The Re	esources Agency	Primary #		
PRIMARY RECORD		HRI #		
	Other Listings			
	Review Code	Reviewer	Date	
Page 1 of 6	Resour	ce Name or #: 902 West Colorado E	Boulevard	
P1. Other Identifier:				
P2. Location: ☐ Not for Pul	olication ⊠ Unrestricted *a.	County: Los Angeles and ((P2b and P2c or P2d. Attach a	
Location Map as necessary.)			
*b. USGS 7.5' Quad: <u>//</u>	<u>t. Wilson, CA</u> Date : 1961	PR 1988 T 1N; R 11W; S.B. B.M.		
c. Address: 902 West C	olorado Boulevard	City: Monrovia	Zip: 91016	
d. UTM: Zone: 11;	mE/	mN (G.P.S.)		

*P3a. Description: (Describe resource and its major elements. Include design, materials, condition, alterations, size, setting, and boundaries)
This multiple-family property is located on the south side of West Colorado Boulevard in a residential area. It is comprised of a primary residence (902 West Colorado Boulevard), a duplex (902A and 902B West Colorado Boulevard), and a two-car carport with an attached ancillary room.

e. Other Locational Data: (e.g., parcel #, directions to resource, elevation, etc., as appropriate) APN: 8506-025-029

The modest Ranch style primary residence, 902 West Colorado Boulevard, has an irregular plan and is surmounted by a low-pitched, cross-gabled roof sheathed in composition shingles and has narrow eaves with exposed, rounded rafter tails. The exterior walls are clad primarily with stucco and some board-and-batten siding. The north-facing, asymmetrical façade features a small porch sheltered beneath the eave, an east-facing, single, wood and glass door; a large, wood-framed, fixed window flanked by aluminum-framed, single-hung end vents; a pair of wood-framed, double-hung windows; and an attached garage with a modern door. The remaining elevations include a variety of aluminum-framed sliding and single hung windows, arranged as singles or pairs. The façade is mostly obstructed from view from the public right-of-way by overgrown landscaping. See Continuation Sheet

*P3b. Resource Attributes: (List attributes and codes) HP3- Multiple family property

*P4. Resources Present: ⊠Building □Structure □Object □Site □District □Element of District □Other (Isolates, etc.)





See Continuation Sheet

P5b. Description of Photo: (View, date, accession #) Top: façade, view to the south; bottom: eastern elevation, view to the northwest (12/1/16)

*P6. Date Constructed/Age and Sources: ⊠Historic □Prehistoric □Both 1920, 1938, 1948 (Los Angeles County Assessor)

*P7. Owner and Address: Unknown

*P8. Recorded by: (Name, affiliation, and address)
Elisa Bechtel, MLitt
Casey Tibbet, M.A.
LSA Associates, Inc.
1500 Iowa Avenue, Suite 200
Riverside, CA 92507

*P9. Date Recorded: December 2016

***P10. Survey Type:** (Describe) Intensive-level CEQA compliance

*P11. Report Citation: (Cite survey report and other sources, or enter "none.") None.

*Attachments:

NONE

Location Map

Sketch Map

Continuation Sheet

Building, Structure, and Object Record

Archaeological Record

District Record

Linear Feature Record

Milling Station Record

Record

Artifact Record

Other (List):

DPR 523A (1/95) *Required information

State of California — The Resources Agency DEPARTMENT OF PARKS AND RECREATION	Primary #HRI#
Page 2 of 6 *Resource Name or # (Ass	*NRHP Status Code 6Z signed by recorder) 902 West Colorado Boulevard
B1. Historic Name:	B4. Present Use: Multiple-family property ate of alterations) terations and additions. tion of duplex and carport. ction of garage and alteration/addition to living room.
1963 – permit issued to owner Frank C. Hagaman for con 1987 – permit issued to owner Frank C. Hagaman for rero 1996 – permit issued to owner Eleanor Hagaman for heat *B7. Moved? ⊠No □Yes □Unknown Date:* *B8. Related Features:	nstruction of garage carport. cofing.
*B10. Significance: Theme: Residential Development Period of Significance: 1920-1948 Property Type: (Discuss importance in terms of historical or architectural context as This modest Ranch style, multiple-family property has be important events or people. Therefore, it does not appear to Resources or the local ordinance. Historic Context: Originally owned by the San Gabriel Missi present-day Monrovia was deeded to Scottish immigrant Hugo the land, raising cattle and building the first structure (Jimen Baldwin purchased the land, along with much of the surroundin farming, ranching, and orchards. In 1885, the main line of the Sthrough the ranch, making it practical to subdivide part of the lacres of what would become Monrovia to William N. and C.O. Crank (ibid.). A town site was laid out in early 1886 and the City During the first quarter of the 20 th century, the city's population the original township boundaries until the City began to reser Revival, and "kit homes" dominated the development aestheti thousands of veterans, Monrovia and the greater Los Angeles housing. Much of this development took the architectural voc	Area: City of Monrovia Multiple family property Applicable Criteria: NA s defined by theme, period, and geographic scope. Also address integrity.) been altered and there is no indication that it is associated with meet the criteria for listing in the California Register of Historical ion and then a part of Rancho Santa Anita, the land that includes Reid in 1839. Reid would be the first to make a modern impact on the Reid in 1839. After a succession of owners, in 1875 Elias J. "Lucky" ag area. Baldwin began erecting buildings and cultivating the land for Santa Fe Railroad, in which Baldwin was a stockholder, was opened and into a town site. Around this time Baldwin sold several hundred Monroe, Edward F. Spense, Judge John D. Bicknell, and James F. of Monrovia was incorporated on December 8, 1887 (ibid.). To boomed as numerous additions, tracts, and subdivisions expanded mble suburban residential community it is today (ibid.). Craftsman, ic during this period (ibid.). With the end of WWII and the return of sarea saw an enormous explosion in the development of affordable rebulary of the pre-war years and combined it into simplified styles (City of Los Angeles 2011). In increasingly suburban Monrovia, tional and
led to major changes in the housing market. See Continuation S B11. Additional Resource Attributes: (List attributes and codes) *B12. References: See Continuation Sheet B13. Remarks: *B14. Evaluator: Elisa Bechtel, MLitt and Casey Tibbet, M Associates, Inc., 1500 Iowa Avenue, Suite 200, Riverside, CA *Date of Evaluation: December 2016	Sheet) Refer to Location Map 1.A., LSA
(This space reserved for official comments.)	

DPR 523B (1/95) *Required information

State of California - The Resources Agency
DEPARTMENT OF PARKS AND RECREATION

CONTINUATION SHEET

Primary #	
HRI#_	
Trinomial	

Page	3	of	6	*Resource Name	or #: (A:	ssigned by recorder)	902 \	Nest Colorado B	oulevard
*Recor	ded by	L	SA Associates, Inc.	*	*Date:	December 2016	Χ	Continuation	Update

*P3a. Description: (continued from page 1) The modest Ranch style duplex, 902A and 902B West Colorado Boulevard, has an irregular plan and is oriented to the west. It is surmounted by a low-pitched, cross-gabled roof sheathed in composition shingles and has narrow eaves with exposed rafter tails. The exterior walls are clad primarily with stucco and some board-and-batten siding. The west-facing, asymmetrical façade features a partial-width porch with brick planters sheltered beneath an extended eave supported by decorative metal supports; a wood-framed, double-hung window; a single, west-facing door; an aluminum-framed sliding window; a north-facing, metal-framed, louvered window; a north-facing, wood-framed multi-paned casement window; and a single, north-facing door with a metal and mesh screen door; and a wood-framed fixed window with double-hung end vents sheltered beneath an aluminum awning.

At the rear of the property there is also a side-gabled, partially-enclosed car port. There is an attached ancillary room at its southern end. The property appears to be in good condition, but the buildings have sustained various alterations to their plan and fenestration.

P5a. Photo or Drawing: (continued from page 1)





Left: 902A and 902B West Colorado Boulevard, view to the east; right: carport and accessory structure, view to the southwest (12/1/16).

*B10. Significance: (continued from page 2) The children of the postwar baby boom began to reach adulthood in the mid-1960s, and the number of young adults increased rapidly for more than a decade thereafter, as those born in the later 1940s through the 1950s reached maturity. These young adults generally married and had children later than their counterparts in the 1950s, and were less likely to wait until marriage to leave their parents' households. The result was a surge in single-person households. This substantial increase in the number of childless adults translated into an increased demand for apartments as an alternative to houses. While some of the multifamily housing constructed during the boom period consisted of urban high-rises, including urban renewal projects, much of it took the form of low-rise, garden apartment complexes in suburban areas. These typically consisted of multiple two-story buildings with separate, common parking shelters. Today, Monrovia offers a variety of residential types from single-family houses to duplexes to apartments and condominiums.

People Associated with this Property. Building permits list E.(F?) Body as the owner of the property in 1920 and 1923; no additional information was found on this person. Historic city directories list Marie Weiss as resident in 1935 through 1937, followed by a vacancy in 1939, and then L.O. Strong in 1944. Information found using Ancestry.com listed this resident as Loran O. Strong of Speedy's Automotive; no additional information was found on this person (Ancestry.com var.). Building permits list James W. Needham as owner in 1946, followed by Swan Nelson (a carpenter) and his wife Katie in 1947 and 1948 (ibid.). Mrs. May Bissell resided at the address from 1951 until at least 1955 (ibid.). Frank C. (a plumber) and Eleanor Hagaman are listed at the address starting in 1958 and remained the owners and residents of 902 West Colorado Boulevard until at least 1996; no additional information on the couple was found (ibid.). Beginning in 1958, residents for the duplex at 902A and 902B West Colorado Boulevard are also listed. Paul F. Sickles, a machinist, and Glenn A. Hart, a carrier, resided at 902A and 902B respectively until at least 1967; no additional information was found on them (ibid.).

Architectural Context. Character-defining features of the Ranch style include a one-story configuration; a sprawling layout, often laid out in an L or U shape that creates backyard privacy; low-pitched hip, gable, or gable-on-hip roof with wide eaves; a variety of wood, brick, and stucco siding, often in combination; wood-frame double-hung windows, often with multiple lights or diamond-panes; a large picture window in the façade, often flanked by narrower windows; and an attached two-car garage. Decorative features include scalloped vergeboards, false cupolas and dovecotes, extended gable eaves, and turned porch supports. Later examples of the style incorporate aluminum-framed vertical-slider windows instead of wood-framed double-hung windows.

See Continuation Sheet

DPR 523L (1/95) *Required Information

DEPARTMENT OF PARKS AND RECREATION			Primary #		
CONTIN	UATION SHEET		Trinomial		
Page 4	of <u>6</u>	*Resource Name or #: (Assigned by recorder)	902 West Colorado Boulevard		
*Recorded by	LSA Associates, Inc.	*Date: December 2016	X Continuation Update		

Significance Evaluation. In compliance with CEQA, this property is being evaluated under the California Register criteria and local landmark criteria.

California Register Criterion 1 - Associated with events that have made a significant contribution to the broad patterns of local or regional history or the cultural heritage of California or the United States. Residential development in the 1886-1940 period cemented Monrovia as a single-family residential community and provided the foundation for the city's layout and built environment as they exist today (Jimenez 2008). The primary residence was constructed in 1920 at a time when the City's development of single-family properties was at its height and was expanded into a multiple-family property in 1948 during the post-World War II period. The oldest aerial photograph found dates to 1952 and by that time the surrounding area was completely developed with what appear to be single-family or small multi-family homes on small lots (Historicaerials.com). Between 1980 and 1994, historic aerials reveal that the area transitioned to the higher density, multi-family developments that exist today (ibid.). Because it pre-dates the boom in apartment construction associated with demographic changes in the 1960s and the demand for single-person housing, it is not associated with or representative of that trend. Within the historic context of housing development from 1945-1973, this modest, altered multiple-family property is unimportant and insignificant.

California Register Criterion 2 - Associated with the lives of persons important to local, California or national history. As discussed above, online research and a review of historic newspaper articles revealed very little information for the owners/residents. This dearth of information tends to suggest that the property is not associated with persons important in national, state, or local history.

California Register Criterion 3 - Embodies the distinctive characteristics of a type, period, region or method of construction or represents the work of a master or possesses high artistic values. This modest Ranch-style residence and duplex are a common type and style, are not the work of a master, and do not possess high artistic values. They have sustained alterations that have compromised their architectural integrity. No information was found on the architect or builder.

California Register Criterion 4 - Has yielded, or has the potential to yield, information important to the prehistory or history of the local area, California or the nation. The buildings on the property were constructed and expanded/altered over the course of 28 years using common materials and construction practices. They do not have the potential to yield information important to the history or prehistory of the local area, California, or the nation.

Local Landmark Criterion 1 - Identifies with persons or events significant in local, regional, state, or national history. As discussed above under California Register Criterion 2, it does not appear that anyone associated with the residences during the historic period is significant in history.

Local Landmark Criterion 2 - Is representative of the work of a notable builder, designer, or architect. As discussed above under California Register Criterion 3, no information was found on the architect or builder.

Local Landmark Criterion 3 - Contributes to the significance of a historic area, being geographically definable area possessing a concentration of not less than 50% of historic or architecturally related grouping of properties which contribute to each other and are unified aesthetically by physical layout or development. At the time of this evaluation, the City has not identified the location of the subject property as a potential historic district. A brief windshield survey of the surrounding area revealed that many of the other buildings in the area have been altered or are modern and collectively do not constitute a potential historic district.

Local Landmark Criterion 4 - Embodies one or more distinctive characteristics of style, type, period, design, materials, detail, or craftsmanship. As discussed above under California Register Criterion 3, while the property includes character-defining features of the Ranch style, such as one-story configuration, low roofline, and mixed wall cladding, it is a very modest example of a common property type, does not possess high artistic values, and is not a particularly good or significant representation of the style. It has sustained alterations to its plan and fenestration, therefore compromising its architectural integrity. Therefore, it is not significant under this criterion.

Local Landmark Criterion 5 - Has a unique location or physical character or represents an established and familiar visual feature of neighborhood, community, or city. Due to its deep setback and mature and overgrown landscaping that obscures its visibility, as well as its modest and ordinary character and location, this property does not meet this criterion.

See Continuation Sheet

DPR 523L (1/95) *Required Information

Costs of Onlifernia. The December Assessed		
State of California - The Resources Agency DEPARTMENT OF PARKS AND RECREATION	Primary #	
	HRI#	
CONTINUATION SHEET		
		-
Page 5 of 6 *Resource Name or #: (Assigned	oy recorder) 902 West Colorad	o Boulevard
*Recorded by LSA Associates, Inc. *Date: December	oer 2016 X Continuation	Update
Local Landmark Criterion 6 - Incorporates elements that help preserve in the city. As discussed under Local Landmark Criteria 3 and 4, the primaterials, design, workmanship, or feeling, and, therefore, do not add to, interest.	operty nor the surrounding area	retain integrity of setting,
Local Landmark Criterion 7 - Has yielded, or may be likely to yield info above under California Register Criterion 4, does not have the potential to y local area, California, or the nation due to its age and construction using communications.	rield information important to the	history or prehistory of the
*B12. References: (continued from page 2) Ancestry.com Var. A variety of records were accessed online in December 2016 at: voter registration records, and United States Census Data.	http://home.ancestry.com/. These	e include city directories,
Architectural Resources Group 2016 "City of Arcadia Citywide Historic Context Statement." Accesse departments/development-services/historic-preservation	ed online at: https://www.arcadi	aca.gov/government/city-
California Department of Transportation 2011 <i>Tract Housing in California, 1945-1973. A Context for National</i> Analysis, Sacramento.asp?page=1102	Register Evaluation. Caltrans	Division of Environmental
City of Monrovia Var. Building permits for 902 West Colorado Boulevard. Accessed online http://www.cityofmonrovia.org/communitydevelopment/page/online-		
City of Los Angeles 2011 Jefferson Park HPOZ Preservation Plan, City of Los Angeles. Acce http://preservation.lacity.org/files/Jefferson%20Park%20(Small%20">http://preservation.lacity.org/files/Jefferson%20Park%20(Small%20")		
Hise, Greg 1997 Magnetic Los Angeles: Planning the Twentieth Century Metropolis. Press.	Baltimore and London, The John	s Hopkins University
Jimenez, Craig 2008 "Wild Rose Tract Historic District Historic Context and Survey." Acc http://www.cityofmonrovia.org/sites/default/files/fileattachments/cont.pdf		
Los Angeles County Office of the Assessor n.d. Property information accessed online in April 2016 at:		

DPR 523L (1/95) *Required Information

State of California - Resource Agency
DEPARTMENT OF PARKS AND RECREATION
LOCATION MAD

Primary #	
HRI #	
Trinomial	-

Page <u>6</u> of <u>6</u>

*Resource Name or # (Assigned by recorder) 902 West Colorado Boulevard

