



HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION STAFF REPORT

APPLICATION: DPR2017-03

AGENDA ITEM: AR-5

PREPARED BY: Craig Jimenez
Director

MEETING DATE: January 25, 2017

TITLE: Determination of Historic Significance
220 West Evergreen Avenue

APPLICANT: City of Monrovia/Successor Agency to the Monrovia Redevelopment Agency

REQUEST: Determine the historic significance of a residential structure built within the historic period (50 years or older) that is proposed for demolition.

BACKGROUND: In September 2016, the City Council adopted Ordinance No. 2016-10 updating Monrovia's demolition review provisions. Among other things, the new ordinance requires an evaluation of structures over 50 years old that are considered for demolition. The Ordinance defines demolition as "any act or process that destroys or damages in part or in whole, a main residential building." The evaluation is triggered not only when the complete demolition of a building is proposed, but also specified portions of a building are removed.

When a demolition is proposed, the new application requires the submittal of one of three things: documentation from a historic survey that indicates a California Historic Resource Status Code (CHRS code) for the subject building and other site data; a historic assessment and determination of CHRS code for the property by a qualified historic preservation consultant; or a written request from the property owner for an exemption due to obvious lack of historic significance.

The evaluation and determination made by the Historic Preservation Commission is in the form of approval of a DPR Form which includes the assignment of a CHRS code. The determination made by the Commission using the CHRS codes is the first step in the process and will be part of the overall evaluation of the "project" pursuant to the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA).

Because CEQA defines "project" as the whole of an action, all components, parts and phases of the activity or permit must be considered in making the environmental determination for the project. Evaluating each part separately is referred to as "piecemealing" which is expressly prohibited. Therefore, in the case of a demolition since it is typically part of a larger project, the potential impacts of the demolition are part of the overall project environmental review. The Commission is not approving or denying the demolition, this review is only the first step in the entitlement process.

ANALYSIS: As early as 1993, Monrovia was planning the area around the proposed light rail station on South Myrtle Avenue. By the mid-2000's, as the Gold Line through Monrovia was coming closer to fruition, the City began an intensive land use planning process for the area. It was during this time that the name "Station Square Transit Village" was coined to identify the entire 80 acre planning area bordered by Evergreen, Magnolia and Shamrock Avenues and Duarte Road. It was also during this period that the Monrovia Redevelopment Agency began to purchase properties in the area to facilitate the redevelopment of the area. Since that time, the development landscape has changed dramatically. Although the impact of the Great Recession affected the timing of the development, the greatest impact was felt through the elimination of the redevelopment agencies statewide. This left

the Successor Agency to the Monrovia Redevelopment Agency with several remnant parcels, including the subject property.

The subject property has been vacant and boarded up for almost two years and has become an attractive nuisance to the area. Since the plan for this area continues to be to redevelop Station Square as a high density transit oriented neighborhood, the Successor Agency is proposing to demolish this property to abate the nuisance.

220 West Evergreen Avenue

This single family dwelling is on a small lot mid-block on West Evergreen between Magnolia and Primrose Avenues. Tract No. 15646 shows that the 24-lot subdivision encompassed both sides of Evergreen Avenue bounded Magnolia Avenue on the west and Pine Street (now Primrose) on the east. In reviewing the subdivision and building records, it appears that the owners who initiated the subdivision, Manly Russell Williams and Josie Sanford Williams, sold the lots to V.A. Oertle of Temple City. The houses along the south side of Evergreen (including this house) were built by K.B. Cavanagh of Alhambra and designed by James Turner (identified on a building permit as “draftsman”) of Monrovia. During the 1960s, the properties in this block on the north side of Evergreen were acquired for the construction of the Foothill Freeway which left an isolated 11-house residential neighborhood surrounded by primarily industrial uses and the freeway.

A building permit was issued in April 1950 to construct an 874 square foot house; construction was completed in July 1950. In 1980, a small addition was made to the front of the house which expanded the house size to 1,263 square feet. (Prior to the addition, it appears to be the same floor plan as 202 West Evergreen Avenue.) The structure is a single story, single family residential structure sitting on a concrete slab.

The structure is an simple example of a Postwar Minimal House, a subtype of the Minimal Traditional. The house has an U-shaped plan with the attached front-facing, two-car garage prominently situated on the west side in front of the living area. The moderate pitched, cross-hipped roof has shallow eaves finished with a plain fascia; the roofing material is concrete shingles. The original roofing material was cedar shingle. The building is sided with medium sand finish stucco. Additionally there is a highly textured fieldstone wainscot that runs along the front elevation (likely added in 1980). The front door is centrally located and slightly recessed. The 1980 addition to the east side of front elevation created a small entry court. The primary decorative feature is a large picture window on the primary elevation. All original windows have been replaced with vinyl windows and a curved decorative three sided surround (top and sides only) was added to the two windows on the front elevation. A full evaluation is on the attached DPR Form.

Although the property represents a typical example of residential development in the early postwar period, this Postwar Minimal House is not a significant example due to its lack of sufficient architectural definition and integrity necessary for designation on any level. There is no indication that it is associated with any significant events or persons important to Monrovia history. Therefore, it does not appear to meet the criteria qualifying as a local historic landmark.

Based on staff’s evaluation, a CHRS code of 6Z has been assigned indicating that the property does not meet the criteria for local landmark status.

RECOMMENDATION: Staff recommends that the Historic Preservation Commission find that the residential structure located at 220 West Evergreen Avenue is not eligible for landmark status. If the Historic Preservation Commission concurs, then the appropriate action would be a motion to:

Approve the DPR Form with a status code of 6Z finding that the residential structure at 220 West Evergreen Avenue does not have architectural or known historic value that meet the criteria for local landmark status.

Other Listings
Review Code

Reviewer

Date

Page 1 of 2 *Resource Name or #: 220 West Evergreen Avenue

P1 Other Identifier: _____

*P2 Location: Not for Publication Unrestricted

a. County: Los Angeles

c. Address: 202 West Evergreen Avenue City: Monrovia Zip: 91016

e. Other Locational Data: APN # 8507-002-900

P3a Description: (Describe resource and its major elements. Include design, materials, condition, alterations, size, setting, and boundaries)
This property is located on the south side of West Evergreen Avenue in a small residential neighborhood that was isolated by the construction of the Foothill Freeway (I-210) in the 1960s. The property is improved with an 1,263 square foot single story, single family residential structure sitting on a concrete slab.

The structure is an simple example of a Postwar Minimal House, a subtype of the Minimal Traditional. The house has an U-shaped plan with the attached front-facing, two-car garage prominently situated on the west side in front of the living area. The moderate pitched, cross-hipped roof has shallow eaves finished with a plain fascia; the roofing material is concrete shingles. The original roofing material was cedar shingle. The building is sided with medium sand finish stucco. Additionally there is a highly textured fieldstone wainscot that runs along the front elevation (likely added in 1980). The front door is centrally located and slightly recessed. An addition on to the east side of front elevation created a small entry court. The primary decorative feature is a large picture window on the primary elevation. All original windows have been replaced with vinyl windows and a curved decorative three sided surround (top and sides only) was added to the two windows on the front elevation.

The house is part of a 24-lot tract (TR 15646) encompassing both sides of Evergreen Avenue between Magnolia Avenue and Pine Street (now Primrose Avenue). The property was subdivided by the owners Manly and Josie Williams. At the time the property was developed, the building permits show it was owned by V.A. Oertle of Temple City and developed by K.B. Cavanagh of Alhambra.

P3b Resource Attributes: (List attributes and codes) HP2. Single family property

*P4 Resources Present: Building Structure Object Site District Element of District Other

P5a Photograph

P5b Description of Photo: (view, date)

Facing southwest, 1/2017

P6 Date Constructed: 1950

Source: Building Permit

P7 Owner and Address:

Successor Agency to MRA

415 S. Ivy Avenue, Monrovia, CA

P8 Recorded by:

City of Monrovia

P9 Date Recorded: 1/2017

P10 Survey Type: Individual



P11 Report Citation:

Attachments: NONE Location Map Sketch Map Continuation Sheet Building, Structure, and Object Record
 Archaeological Record District Record Linear Feature Record Milling Station Record Rock Art Record
 Artifact Record Photograph Record Other (List):

Page 2 of 2 *Resource Name or #: 220 West Evergreen Avenue

- B1 Historic Name:** n/a
- B2 Common Name:** n/a
- B3 Original Use** Residential
- B4 Present Use** Residential
- B5 Architectural Style** Minimal Traditional

B6 Construction History (Construction date, alterations, and date of alterations)

1950 – permit issued to owner V.E. Oertle for the construction of the house.
 1980 – permit issued to owner McCown for the a 135 SF addition (living room)

B7 Moved: No **Date Moved** _____ **Original Location** _____

B8 Related Features:
 none

B9a Architect: James Turner (draftsman) **b. Builder:** K. B. Cavanagh (Alhambra)

B10 Significance: **Theme:** Residential Development **Area:** City of Monrovia

Period of Significance: 1945-1953 **Property Type** HP2 - Single Family Property

Discuss importance in terms of historical or architectural context as well as integrity.

The structure is a basic example of a Postwar Minimal House built as part of a small tract of homes. Although the property represents a typical example of residential development in the early Postwar period, the house is not a significant example due to its lack of sufficient architectural definition and integrity, including an addition to the front elevation, necessary for designation on any level. There is no indication that it is associated with any significant events or persons important to Monrovia history. Therefore, it does not appear to meet the criteria qualifying as a local historic landmark.

B11 Additional Resource Attributes:

B12 References:
 City Building permits, Sanborn Fire Maps. Los Angeles County Tax Assessor, Los Angeles County Dept. of Public Works

B13 Remarks

B14 Evaluator/ Date City of Monrovia
 January 2017

