

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION STAFF REPORT

APPLICATION: DPR2017-04 AGENDA ITEM: AR-6

PREPARED BY: Jose Barriga MEETING DATE: January 25, 2017

Assistant Planner

TITLE: Determination of Historic Significance

419 Lotone Street

APPLICANT: Christopher and Dana Dattola

419 Lotone Street Monrovia, CA 91016

REQUEST: Determine the historic significance of a residential building built within the

historic period (50 years or older) that is proposing to alter more than 50

percent of the existing roof structure.

BACKGROUND: In September 2016, the City Council adopted Ordinance No. 2016-10 updating demolition Monrovia's review provisions. Among other things, the ordinance requires new evaluation of structures over 50 vears old that are considered for demolition. The Ordinance defines demolition as "any act or process that destroys or damages in part or in whole. а main residential building." The evaluation triggered only when not the complete demolition of a building is proposed. but also specified portions of a building are removed.



When a demolition is proposed, the new application requires the submittal of one of three things: documentation from a historic survey that indicates a California Historic Resource Status Code (CHRS code) for the subject building and other site data; a historic assessment and determination of CHRS code for the property by a qualified historic preservation consultant; or a written request from the property owner for an exemption due to obvious lack of historic significance.

The evaluation and determination made by the Historic Preservation Commission is in the form of approval of a DPR Form which includes the assignment of a CHRS code. The determination made by the Commission using the CHRS codes is the first step in the process

and will be part of the overall evaluation of the "project" pursuant to the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA).

Because CEQA defines "project" as the whole of an action, all components, parts and phases of the activity or permit must be considered in making the environmental determination for the project. Evaluating each part separately is referred to as "piecemealing" which is expressly prohibited. Therefore, in the case of a demolition since it is typically part of a larger project, the potential impacts of the demolition are part of the overall project environmental review. The Commission is not approving or denying the demolition, this review is only the first step in the entitlement process.

On December 20, 2016, the owner of 419 Lotone Street submitted a written request to be exempt from the Demolition Review Permit Regulations for the main residence at the subject property. The demolition review permit is prompted by the alteration or demolition of fifty percent or more of a main residential building's roof area that is 50 or more years old.

ANALYSIS: According to the current Tax Assessor information, the existing 1,578 square foot two-story residence was built in 1912. The residential unit has three bedrooms, two bathrooms and attached two-car garage located on the front elevation. The building's entrance is located on second floor, and is accessed by an open exterior staircase.

City building permits do not provide any information as to when the home was originally built. However, a sewer permit was issued in December of 1913 to Miss Gibbs who was the owner at the time. In 1965, building permits indicate that a significant addition to the front of the dwelling was approved as part of a variance application request (Variance Application No. V-182). The addition consisted of a new two-car garage with a new bedroom above the garage that resulted in the demolition of an existing one-car garage with a bedroom above. There is no record of any additions or alterations to the property prior to 1965. In 1970, aluminum siding was installed on the rear exterior of the residence.

The residence is clad in several materials, including stucco on the front (south) elevation, vertical wood panel siding on portions of east elevation, and vertical aluminum siding on the rear (north) elevation of the building. The stucco exterior covers the addition in 1965, as well as the ground level storage area located behind the two-car garage. The vertical wood panel siding encompasses a portion of the east elevation and it is not clear if the siding is an original physical feature. Along the west and north elevations, the exterior is clad in vertical aluminum that was installed in 1970. A combination of several window types exists throughout the building elevations, including louvered windows, wood casement windows, and aluminum sliding windows. The wood windows are primarily located by the front door, on the side (west) elevation, and on rear (north) elevation. The roof is comprised of three different low-pitched gable pieces that intersect into a shed roof at the rear of the structure. The existing disjointed roof structure is a result of the combination of the various additions and remodels which not all may have occurred with approved building permits. The residence provides large overhanding eaves, consisting of both exposed rafters and boxed stucco eaves.

Over the structure's lifetime, significant additions and alterations have occurred and many of the physical features and elements of the original structure have been removed and/or altered. These alterations have impacted the building's visual quality. The building's original forms, features and details are no longer identifiable, and therefore do not convey architectural significance. The existing residence no longer retains a particular architectural style or construction technique that is unique or significant to residential development in Monrovia in the early 1900s.

The home is not part of the draft Historic Resources Survey of 2004. Due to its lack of architectural integrity, Staff has assigned it a CHRS Code of 6Z. A 6Z status is assigned to properties that do not meet any of the criteria required for landmark designation.

RECOMMENDATION: Staff recommends that the Historic Preservation Commission find that the residential structure located at 419 Lotone Street is not eligible for landmark status. If the Historic Preservation Commission concurs with this recommendation, then the following the public hearing, the appropriate action would be a motion to:

Approve the DPR Form with a Status Code of 6Z finding that the residential structure at 419 Lotone Street does not have architectural or known historic value that meet the criteria for local landmark status.

City of Monrovia Department of Community Development

PRIMARY RECORD

Primary # HRI # Trinomial

CHR Status Code 6Z

Other Listings Review Code

Reviewer

Date

		IVEAIGM	Code	Keviewei			Date		
Page	_1_ of _2_ *F	Resource Name or	#: 419 Lo	tone Street					
P1	Other Identifier:								
*P2	Location:	☐ Not for Public	ation	Unrestricted		_			
	a. County: Lo	s Angeles							
	c. Address: 41	9 Lotone Street			City:	Monrovia	Zi	p: 91016	
	e. Other Location	nal Data: APN #	8503-001-02	22					
P3a	Description: (Desc	cribe resource and its	major element	s. Include design, n	naterials,	condition, alte	erations, size, setting,	and boundaries)	
	The subject building is a 1,578 square foot single-family home built in 1912, per LA County Assessor. The residence two-story structure. The main entrance is located on the second floor and is accessed by an exterior steel staircase concrete steps. The floor plan contains three bedrooms and two bathrooms on the second floor and a two-car garag the first floor. The plan is asymmetrical. At the rear of the property there is also a detached accessory structure.							el staircase with o-car garage on	
	square foot addition in several material and vertical aluminas well as the group ortion of the east elevations, the ext throughout the built he wood window roof is comprised or the several square for the wood window roof is comprised or the several square for the wood window roof is comprised or the several square for t	e an attached one-con. The addition corns, including stucconum siding on the rund level storage arest elevation and it erior is clad in verticaliding elevations, in a re primarily locatof three different lovers.	asisted of a two on the front (ear (north) elea located be is not clear cal aluminum cluding louve ted by the frour-pitched gab	vo-car garage with south) elevation, veration of the bushind the two-car if the siding is a that was installed red windows, word door, on the side pieces that interestion.	h a secovertical vilding. Tigarage. n origin din 1970 od case ide (wesersect in	and floor bed wood panel s he stucco ex The vertical al physical f b. A combina ment window at) elevation, to a shed roo	room above. The residing on portions of kterior covers the a wood panel siding eature. Along the tion of several wind vs, and aluminum s and on rear (north	esidence is clad f east elevation, ddition in 1965, encompasses a west and north low types exists sliding windows.) elevation. The	
P3b	Resource Attribu	tes: (List attributes ar	nd codes) HP2	2 - Single Family I	Property	,			
*P4 P5a] Site	date Fac	trict			
				P6	Date Constructe	d: 1912			
			***				Source: LA County Assessor		
				Ch: 419	P7 Owner and Address: Christopher and Dana Dattola 419 Lotone Street Monrovia, CA 91016				
							5		
					Brain and a second		P8 Recorded by: City of Monrovia		
					y or ivioritovia	January			
		A STATE OF THE STA	NO THE REAL PROPERTY.			P9	Date Recorded:	2017	
						P10	Survey Type:	Individual	

P11 Report Citation:

Attachments:	\boxtimes NONE	☐ Location Map	☐ Sketch Map	☐ Continuation Sh	eet 🛛 Building,	Structure, and C	bject Record
☐ Archaeologi	cal Record	☐ District Record	☐ Linear Feat	ure Record 🗌 Millin	g Station Record	d ☐ Rock Art Re	ecord
☐ Artifact Reco	ard \square Phat	tograph Record	Other (List):				

City of Monrovia
Primary # _____

Department of Community Development
HRI # _____

BUILDING, STRUCTURE, AND OBJECT RECORD Trinomial _____

Page 2 of 2 *Resource Name or #: 419 Lotone Street								
D4	Historic Name:	NI/A						
B1	HISTORIC Name:	N/A						
B2	Common Name:	N/A						
В3	Original Use	Single-family reside	ential					
В4	Present Use Single-family residential							
В5	Architectural Style	Craftsman/Contem	Craftsman/Contemporary					
В6	Construction History (Construction date, alterations, and date of alterations)							
	1913 – sewer permit 1965 – demolish existing bedroom and single car garage 1965 – construct two-car garage and bedroom above per Variance Application No. V-182 1970 – installation of aluminum siding on rear of house							
В7	Moved: No	Date Moved	N/A	Original Lo	ocation N/A			
В8	Related Features:							
	Detached accessory structure at rear of property also has no known historic or architectural significance							
В9а	Architect: L	Inknown	I	b. Builder:	Unknown			
B10	Significance: T	heme: Residential D	evelopment	Area:	Monrovia			
	Period of Significance: None Property Type HP2 - Single Family Property Discuss importance in terms of historical or architectural context as well as integrity. Over the structure's lifetime, significant additions and alterations have occurred and many of the physical features and elements of the original structure have been removed and/or altered. These alterations have impacted the building's visual quality. The building's original forms, features and details are no longer identifiable, and therefore do not convey architectural significance. The existing residence no longer retains a particular architectural style or construction technique that is unique or significant to residential development in Monrovia in the early 1900s							

B11 Additional Resource Attributes:

B12 References:

Los Angeles County Assessor's Records City of Monrovia Building Permits

B13 Remarks

B14 Evaluator/ City of Monrovia January 2017

