



HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION STAFF REPORT

APPLICATION: HL-140/MA-130

AGENDA ITEM: PH-3

PREPARED BY: Teresa Santilena
Assistant Planner

MEETING DATE: June 1, 2016

SUBJECT: Historic Landmark HL-140/Mills Act MA-130
177 Acacia Avenue

APPLICANT: William and Jill Levensgood
177 Acacia Avenue
Monrovia, CA 91016

REQUEST: Historic landmark designation and approval of a Mills Act Contract

ENVIRONMENTAL DETERMINATION: Categorical Exemption (Class 1)

BACKGROUND: Pursuant to the Historic Preservation Ordinance, the property owners of 177 Acacia Avenue have filed an application for consideration of historic landmark designation and approval of a Mills Act Contract.

ANALYSIS: The single family home at 177 Acacia Avenue was built in 1929. The house is 1,416 square feet in area and has three bedrooms and one bathroom, according to the Los Angeles County Assessor. A detached two-car garage is located behind the home, in the southwest corner of the lot. The architecture of the garage (flat roof, stucco exterior, wood sliding doors, half-cylinder mission tile clay roofing on the edges of the roof) compliments the architecture of the house.



The owners have maintained the original interior and exterior features of the Spanish Revival home. Building permit history indicates that the home appears today much as it was originally built. No new square footage has been added, and much of the work has been in the nature of repair. A kitchen remodel was completed in 2004, which was sensitive to the original

The owners have maintained the original interior and exterior features of the Spanish Revival home. Building permit history indicates that the home appears today much as it was originally built. No new square footage has been added, and much of the work has been in the nature of repair. A kitchen remodel was completed in 2004, which was sensitive to the original

design of the home. That remodel included a non-period window and a non-period door on the exterior of the home, which will be replaced with period ones.



The property has all of the defining features of Spanish Revival architecture. The home has an asymmetrical front façade. The primary entryway is arched with a decorative iron gate and leads into a covered front porch and walled entry courtyard. The exterior front wall steps down and continues around the low-walled courtyard, which has a small fountain. The smooth stucco walls are unbroken by wood trim to the low-pitched gable roof. The cross gabled roof structure has red half-cylinder mission style clay tiles. The terracotta ornamentation at the top of the stucco chimney matches the roof tiles. The front gable extends over the porch and has curved wooden bracing and two decorative wooden pillars. The exposed rafter tails also have a decorative curved detail. The original wood front door has brass and iron ornamentation. The original

wood casement multi-paned windows are covered by cloth awnings and held in place by decorative iron braces.

The driveway has an ornate wrought iron gate, matching the style of the small gate in the arched entry. A detached two-car garage is original to the home and compliments the architecture of the house. In the rear of the garage, a small attached shed has a brick fireplace with a cast iron swing arm cauldron holder to hang pots while cooking over the fire. The attached shed and fireplace appear to be original to the home, as reflected on the Sanborn map.

The interior of the home is also well preserved in its original state with original hardwood floors, coved tray ceilings, and original hardware and sconces. The living room fireplace boasts three vintage Claycraft tiles, depicting scenic images of California. Claycraft Potteries was a Los Angeles based ceramics company, run by the father and son team of Fred and George Robertson from 1921-1939.

The homeowners submitted a list of the previous owners and a thorough history of the family that built and first lived in the home but the information provided about them does not achieve the significance needed to meet Criterion Number 1 (persons significant in local, regional, state or national history). See attached information submitted.



Criteria and Guidelines

The Commission must determine the applicable designation criteria for landmark status for the home at 177 Acacia Avenue. As specified by the Historic Preservation Ordinance, a property must include one or more of the applicable designation criteria. The following criterion is presented for the Commission's consideration.

Criteria Number 4 – *It embodies one or more distinctive characteristics of style, type, period, design, materials, detail, or craftsmanship.*

This property is locally significant as a good example of Spanish Revival architecture and features in its overall design. The property exemplifies characteristics of Spanish Revival architecture with its asymmetrical façade and use of stucco walls and chimney; arched principal entryway; walled entry courtyard; mission style clay roof tiles; terracotta ornamentation on the chimney; a stepped wall detail on the walled courtyard in the front of the home; low-pitched and flat roofs; wood casement windows; multi-paned windows; cross gabled roof structure with little eave overhang; decorative wood and wrought iron details on the exterior of the home; and wrought iron supports over the windows for cloth awnings. The interior and exterior of the home are in good condition and substantially intact. Due to the architecture, the dwelling appears eligible for designation as a City of Monrovia Landmark.

Staff's determination is that 177 Acacia Avenue meets Criterion Number 4.

Mills Act Contract

The applicants are also requesting approval of a Mills Act Contract which will provide tax savings for the homeowners. The City will lose a portion of the property tax collected on the property to assure its preservation and enhancement.

Conditions

The house is well restored from public view, so the set standards and conditions will be applied to the house (attached Exhibit C). These include placing a historic plaque on the property and electrical safety inspection within two years. A seismic retrofit will be required within ten years. The non-period window and the non-period door will be required to be replaced within four years.

DPR Form

The property is not part of the current Historic Resources Survey and it is not on the Potential Landmark list. Since Staff is processing this application as a City of Monrovia Historic Landmark, a status code of 5S3 has been assigned (appears to be individually eligible for local listing or designation through survey evaluation). If the Historic Preservation Commission determines that the house is eligible for listing for local designation and the City Council concurs, then the code will be changed to 5S1 (individual property that is listed or designated locally).

The DPR form is attached for the review, comment and approval of the Commission.

RECOMMENDATION: Staff recommends that the Historic Preservation Commission forward a Nomination Statement to the City Council recommending that the house at 177 Acacia Avenue be designated as a historic landmark. Approval of a Mills Act Contract with the property owner subject to the attached conditions is also recommended.

If the Historic Preservation Commission concurs with this recommendation and determines that the property meets at least one of the seven criteria for historic landmark designation,

and the information provided on the DPR is accurate then, following the public hearing, the following motion is appropriate:

Designate the property at 177 Acacia Avenue as Historic Landmark Number 140, and approve entering into a Mills Act Contract with the conditions of approval, and so recommend to the City Council.

PRIMARY RECORD

Other Listings
Review Code

Reviewer

Date

Page 1 of 2 *Resource Name or #: HL-140/MA-130

P1 Other Identifier: 177 Acacia Avenue

*P2 Location: Not for Publication Unrestricted

a. County: Los Angeles

c. Address: 177 Acacia Avenue City: Monrovia Zip: 91016

e. Other Locational Data: APN # 8519-017-014

P3a Description: (Describe resource and its major elements. Include design, materials, condition, alterations, size, setting, and boundaries)

The property exemplifies characteristics of Spanish Revival architecture with its asymmetrical façade and use of stucco walls and chimney; arched principal entryway; walled entry courtyard; mission style clay roof tiles; terracotta ornamentation on the chimney; a stepped wall detail on the walled courtyard in the front of the home; low-pitched and flat roofs; wood casement windows; multi-paned windows; cross gabled roof structure with little eave overhang; decorative wood and wrought iron details on the exterior of the home; and wrought iron supports over the windows for cloth awnings. There is one non-period window and one non-period door that will be replaced with period ones. The interior and exterior of the home are in good condition and substantially intact.

There is a detached two-car garage with attached shed located on the south side of the property. Building permits could not be located but the architecture (flat roof, stucco exterior, wood sliding doors, mission tile roofing on the edges of the roof) compliments the architecture of the house. The detached garage and shed are not considered as contributing features to the property.

P3b Resource Attributes: (List attributes and codes) HP2. Single Family Property

*P4 Resources Present: Building Structure Object Site District Element of District Other

P5a Photograph

P5b Description of Photo: (view, date)

Front elevation, May 2016

P6 Date Constructed: 1929

Source: Assessor records

P7 Owner and Address:

William and Jill Levengood

177 Acacia Avenue

P8 Recorded by:

City of Monrovia

P9 Date Recorded: May 2016

P10 Survey Type: Individual



P11 Report Citation: None

Attachments: NONE Location Map Sketch Map Continuation Sheet Building, Structure, and Object Record Archaeological Record District Record Linear Feature Record Milling Station Record Rock Art Record Artifact Record Photograph Record Other (List):

Page 2 of 2 *Resource
 Name or #: HL-140/MA-130

- B1** **Historic Name:** N/A
- B2** **Common Name:** N/A
- B3** **Original Use:** Single-family residence
- B4** **Present Use:** Single-family residence
- B5** **Architectural Style:** Spanish Revival
- B6** **Construction History** (Construction date, alterations, and date of alterations)

1929 – House and garage built

- B7** **Moved:** No **Date Moved:** N/A **Original Location:** N/A
- B8** **Related Features:** N/A

- B9a** **Architect:** Unknown **b. Builder:** Unknown
- B10** **Significance:** The **Area:** Monrovia
- Period of Significance:** 1929 **Property Type:** HP2 - Single Family Property

This property does not exhibit the necessary historical or architectural significance necessary for National Register listing. However, it is locally significant as a good example of Spanish Revival architecture and features in its overall design. Due to the architecture, the dwelling appears eligible for designation as a City of Monrovia Landmark.

B11 **Additional Resource Attributes:**

- B12** **References:**
- California Colonial: The Spanish and Rancho Revival Styles by Elizabeth Jean Macmillan
 - Casa California, Spanish Style Houses from Santa Barbara to San Clemente by Elizabeth McMillan
 - History of Monrovia, by John Wiley
 - Monrovia's Heritage: An Architectural Perspective, by the Monrovia Old House Preservation Group
 - Pure California: 35 Inspiring Houses in the New California Tradition by Basserman and Lagoni Architects
 - "Spanish Bungalows," Cottages and Bungalows Robert Schweitzer
 - Spanish Revival Architecture, by S.F. Cook and Tins Skinner
 - The Craftsman Blog, "Mission Styles," February 19, 2013
 - US Federal Census, Population Schedules
 - www.fullertonheritage.org "Spanish Colonial Revival"
 - www.ancestor.com
 - City of Monrovia Building Permits
 - Los Angeles County Assessor
 - Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps

B13 **Remarks**

- B14** **Evaluator/Date:** City of Monrovia/May 2016

Sketch Map with north arrow:



STANDARDS AND CONDITIONS
177 Acacia Avenue
Mills Act Contract MA-129

During the term of this agreement, the Historic property shall be subject to the following conditions:

1. All structures on the property shall be kept in excellent condition including exterior walls, windows and roofing.
2. A Certificate of Appropriateness shall be required for all exterior alterations and/or additions to any structure on the property. The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Historic Preservation shall be applied to the property with the exception that standard condition #9 shall allow for additions, exterior alterations or related new construction to match the original house upon approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness (Attachment A).
3. *View Corridor Maintained.* The view corridor enabling the general public to see the house from the public right-of-way shall not be further obscured. The view corridor, including landscaping, hardscape and fencing, shall be maintained.
4. *Landmark Plaque.* The owner(s) shall place a Historic Preservation Commission approved historic plaque on the site within two (2) years of the City Council designation of the historic landmark.
5. *Electrical Safety Inspection.* Within two (2) years of the date of City Council approval, an electrical safety inspection report shall be submitted on the electrical contractor's letterhead indicating that the existing service panel meets minimum code and poses no hazardous conditions, GFCI outlets are provided as specified by code, and proper grounding of the panel exists. This condition shall be waived if the building records confirm the upgrading of the service panel or written electrical inspection completed within the last five (5) years is provided.
6. *Seismic Retrofit.* Documentation by either a building permit or building inspector's report must be submitted verifying completion of a seismic retrofit. If the house has not been seismically retrofitted, it shall be retrofitted within ten (10) years of the date of the City Council approval. Seismic retrofit shall be at minimum the bolting of the house to an approved foundation.
7. The exterior kitchen door shall be replaced with an architecturally appropriate door within four (4) years.
8. *Window Replacement.* Window openings on the original 1921 portion of the building that have been boarded up must be replaced with period windows within four (4) years of the date of the City Council approval.
9. The property owner(s) shall submit to the Planning Division a progress report every two (2) years for the first ten (10) years of the Contract listing a response to the conditions of approval as listed on this document. Report shall also include interior and exterior maintenance projects completed since your last required update report. After the first ten (10) years, a progress report shall be required every five (5) years.

**NOTICE OF PUBLIC HEARING
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
415 SOUTH IVY AVENUE
MONROVIA, CA 91016**

A public hearing will be held by the Historic Preservation Committee of Monrovia at 7:30 p.m., or as soon thereafter as possible on Wednesday, June 1, 2016, at City Hall in the Council Chambers, 415 South Ivy Avenue, Monrovia, California, to determine whether or not the following request for Historic Landmark Designation and Mills Act Contract should be approved under Title 17 Historic Preservation Ordinance of the Monrovia Municipal Code.

APPLICATION

Historic Landmark HL-140/Mills Act Contract MA-130
William and Jill Levensgood
177 Acacia Avenue
Monrovia, CA 91016

ENVIRONMENTAL DOCUMENTATION

Categorical Exemption (Class 1)

Staff Report pertaining to this item will be available on Thursday, May 26, 2016, at the Monrovia City Hall, 415 South Ivy Avenue, Monrovia, California, Community Development Department/Planning Division and online at www.cityofmonrovia.org.

Este aviso es para informarle sobre una junta pública acerca de la propiedad indicada más arriba.

Si necesita información adicional en español, favor de ponerse en contacto con Ili Lobaco del Departamento de Planificación al número (626) 932-5587.

For further information regarding this application, please contact the Planning Division at (626) 932-5565.

Sheri Bermejo
Planning Division Manager

PUBLISH ON MAY 19, 2016