



HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION STAFF REPORT

APPLICATION: CA2016-01

AGENDA ITEM: AR-2

PREPARED BY: Craig Jimenez, Director
Community Development

MEETING DATE: May 9, 2016

TITLE: Certificate of Appropriateness CA2016-01
Monrovia Santa Fe Depot
1709 South Myrtle Avenue

APPLICANT: Daylight Limited, LLC

REQUEST: Certificate of Appropriateness for the rehabilitation plan for the Santa Fe Depot

ENVIRONMENTAL DETERMINATION: Categorical Exemption (Class 31)

BACKGROUND: On December 15, 2015, the City Council approved a lease and improvement agreement with Daylight Limited, LLC for the rehabilitation and adaptive reuse of the Santa Fe Depot. The agreement dedicated \$1.5 million from the City's Gold Line Construction Authority funding for the Depot's repair and upgrade. In accordance with the terms of the agreement, the Historic Preservation Commission appointed Commissioners Hendrix, Houston, and Ryan to serve on a subcommittee to assist Staff, providing additional oversight of the rehabilitation work at the Depot.

Over the past few months, the subcommittee and Staff met with the design team to review, discuss and refine the proposal prior to the submittal of an application for review by the Historic Preservation Commission.



Additionally, the City Council designated the Monrovia Santa Fe Depot as Historic Landmark No. 137 on April 19, 2016. Designation of the building as a historic landmark will ensure that changes to the building are reviewed under the purview of the Historic Preservation Commission through the Certificate of Appropriateness process. The applicant, Daylight Limited, LLC, has submitted the rehabilitation plan for review by the Commission.

ANALYSIS: The proposal will restore, repair and reinstall historic elements of the building in their original locations. Missing or severely damaged elements will be reconstructed. These tasks fall under the classification of restoration, which does not require approval of a

Certificate of Appropriateness, however are presented as part of the overall rehabilitation plan to provide an overview and the context of the scope of the project in order to illustrate how the rehabilitation and restoration components will be integrated.

Scope of work

The rehabilitation will repair and restore the character defining elements, such as the reinstallation of tile roof and stucco repair, while proposing modifications that reflect a historic reference consistent with and/or reminiscent of the original design.

The evaluation of the building for an adaptive reuse as a restaurant identified certain elements that include modifications of elements of the original building. These components are presented for the review and consideration of a Certificate of Appropriateness by the Commission as outlined below:

- Replace the eastern freight door on the north elevation and the freight door on the south elevation with frameless, fixed glass windows with contemporary graphic elements that represent the image of the original doors.
- Repair the western freight door on the north elevation and fix in place.
- Repair the freight door on the west elevation and fix in place.
- Repair the existing double entry door and transom on south elevation and fix in place and replace the lower two rows of windows with wood.
- Remove the remaining wrought iron bars on windows. This involves the removal of historic material.
- Install HVAC and mechanical screening on the roof.
- Lower the original floor level in freight room to match adjacent interior space.
- Lower roof behind parapet to minimize visibility of future mechanical equipment.
- Replicate windows throughout the building maintaining the original design and proportions with true light double pane windows. Double pane windows are proposed to increase energy efficiency and will also provide additional sound attenuation.
- Restore interior of historic public spaces (lobby/waiting area) where possible or rebuild as needed consistent with the original design, including the floor finishes.
- Add new "back of house" opening at grade level to accommodate adaptive reuse as a restaurant.
- Demolish the existing platform and rebuild a larger platform to allow for adequate seating capacity.
- Construct a new canopy above the rebuilt platform. Canopy will have a contemporary design with a steel frame and a polycarbonate panel roof.
- Copper inlay flooring will be used to delineate the original extent of the platform from the expanded area.

The subcommittee will continue to oversee the rehabilitation work throughout the process to provide assistance as needed including the review of specific materials and finishes. Modifications to the approved plan that are outside of the scope of this Certificate of Appropriateness will be referred to the Commission for review and approval.

Certificate of Appropriateness Findings

The Historic Preservation Ordinance requires exterior changes or additions to all historic properties to be approved by the Historic Preservation Commission through a Certificate of Appropriateness. The Commission can issue a Certificate of Appropriateness if it is determined that the construction is consistent with the following:

- It does not adversely affect any significant feature of the landmark
- It is consistent with the architectural period of the building
- The scale, massing, proportions, materials, colors, textures, fenestration, decorative features and details proposed are consistent with the period.

Standards for Rehabilitation

Additionally, pursuant to the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation (attached), two of those standards specifically apply to the construction of the canopy:

- New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.
- New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

RECOMMENDATION: Staff's determination is that the proposal for the rehabilitation of Santa Fe Depot meets both the findings for a Certificate of Appropriateness as well as the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and recommends approval. If the Historic Preservation Commission concurs then, the appropriate action would be a motion to:

Approve Certificate of Appropriateness CA2016-01

THE SECRETARY OF THE INTERIOR'S STANDARDS FOR HISTORIC PRESERVATION

The Secretary of the Interior is responsible for establishing standards for all national preservation programs under Departmental authority and for advising Federal agencies on the preservation of historic properties listed or eligible for listing in the National Register of Historic Places.

The Standards for Rehabilitation, a section of the Secretary's Standards for Historic Preservation Projects, address the most prevalent preservation treatment today: rehabilitation. Rehabilitation is defined as the process of returning a property to a state of utility, through repair or alteration, which makes possible an efficient contemporary use while preserving those portions and features of the property which are significant to its historic, architectural, and cultural values.

The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation

The Standards that follow were originally published in 1977 and revised in 1990 as part of Department of the Interior regulations (36 CFR Part 67, Historic Preservation Certifications). They pertain to historic buildings of all materials, construction types, sizes, and occupancy and encompass the exterior and the interior of historic buildings. The Standards also encompass related landscape features and the building's site and environment as well as attached, adjacent or related new construction.

The Standards are to be applied to specific rehabilitation projects in a reasonable manner, taking into consideration economic and technical feasibility.

1. A property shall be used for its historic purpose or be placed in a new use that requires minimal change to the defining characteristics of the building and its site and environment.
2. The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.
3. Each property shall be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or architectural elements from other buildings, shall not be undertaken.
4. Most properties change over time; those changes that have acquired historic significance in their own right shall be retained and preserved.
5. Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be preserved.
6. Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.
7. Chemical or physical treatments, such as sandblasting, that cause damage to historic materials shall not be used. The surface cleaning of structures, if appropriate, shall be undertaken using the gentlest means possible.
8. Significant archeological resources affected by a project shall be protected and preserved. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures shall be undertaken.
9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.
10. New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.