



HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION STAFF REPORT

APPLICATION: HL-136/MA-127

AGENDA ITEM: PH-1

PREPARED BY: Ili Lobaco
Associate Planner

MEETING DATE: July 29, 2015

TITLE: Historic Landmark HL-136/Mills Act Contract MA-127
415 North Primrose Avenue

APPLICANT: John and Danielle Barkume

REQUEST: Historic landmark designation and approval of a Mills Act Contract

ENVIRONMENTAL DETERMINATION: Categorical Exemption (Class 1)

BACKGROUND: Pursuant to the Historic Preservation Ordinance, the property owners of 415 North Primrose Avenue have filed an application for consideration of historic landmark designation and approval of a Mills Act Contract.

ANALYSIS: This 3,088 square foot, two-story home was built in 1908 (per assessor records). It is a large Craftsman home laid out in a "U" shaped plan. The wood frame, single-family dwelling is sheathed in a combination of siding that includes horizontal wood siding on the exterior of the first floor and shingle wood siding on the exterior of the second floor. This contrasting siding is wrapped on all four elevations of the house. The house is capped by a gable roofing system. The front has wood framed sash and tripartite windows. Situated within the base of the "U" is the primary entrance into the residence. The concrete porch located within the U-shaped indentation is covered by an open trellis. The glazed entry door is flanked by pairs of sash windows. Above the open trellis are symmetrical windows that include two smaller windows to the far right and far left with a roof overhang. The other two centered windows are protected by a shed roof overhang. The house sits on a river rock foundation and is set back from the public right-of-way. Original windows are located on all elevations of the house.



Permits on file show construction of a detached two-car garage built in 1987, new railing in 1990 on the rear balcony and a pool in 1979. A seismic retrofit was completed in 1991.

The applicant submitted the history of the occupants of the home that included Florence Conable who built the house and lived in it until her death in 1949. Although she was active in the Woman's Club, serviced on the Library Board and was secretary in the local Red Cross unit, she is not associated with any notable historical event.

Criteria and Guidelines

The Commission must determine the applicable designation criteria for landmark status for the house at 415 North Primrose Avenue. As specified by the Historic Preservation Ordinance, a property must include one or more of the applicable designation criteria. The following criterion is presented for the Commission's consideration.

Criteria Number 4 – *It embodies one or more distinctive characteristics of style, type, period, design, materials, detail, or craftsmanship.*

The property is significant under this criterion as it exemplifies characteristics of Craftsman architecture with its large overhanging eaves, decorative knee braces, horizontal and decorative siding, and original wood trimmed windows and doors. Its architectural style with its U-shaped pattern is unique and not commonly found in Monrovia.

The building is in excellent condition and retains integrity in its design, materials and workmanship. Staff's determination is that 415 North Primrose Avenue meets Criteria Number 4.

Mills Act Contract

The applicant is also requesting approval of a Mills Act Contract which will provide tax savings for the homeowner. The City will lose a portion of the property tax collected on the property to assure its preservation and enhancement.

Conditions

The building is well restored from public view, so the set standards and conditions will be applied (Exhibit C). These include placing a historic plaque on the property and electrical safety inspection within two years. Staff is recommending that the concrete walkway leading to the front of the home be repaired or replaced within two years of the signing of the contract. Similar conditions have been placed on other Mills Act properties such as 346 Stedman Avenue (driveway), 201 Acacia Avenue (driveway), 214-216 North Encinitas Avenue (walkway), and 220 North Encinitas Avenue (walkway) to name a few. A seismic retrofit, one of the required conditions, has already been completed in 1991 and the building permit is on file with the City.

DPR Form

Since Staff is processing this application as a City of Monrovia Historic Landmark, a status code of 5S3 has been assigned (appears to be individually eligible for local listing or designation through survey evaluation). If the Historic Preservation Commission determines that the building is eligible for listing for local designation and the City Council concurs, then the code will be changed to 5S1 (individual property that is listed or designated locally). The DPR form is attached for the review, comment and approval of the Commission.

RECOMMENDATION: Staff recommends that the Historic Preservation Commission forward a Nomination Statement to the City Council recommending that the house at 415 North Primrose Avenue be designated as a historic landmark. Approval of a Mills Act Contract with the property owner subject to the attached conditions is also recommended.

If the Historic Preservation Commission concurs with this recommendation and determines that the property meets at least one of the seven criteria for historic landmark designation, and the information provided on the DPR is accurate then, following the public hearing, the following motion is appropriate:

Designate the property at 415 North Primrose Avenue as Historic Landmark Number 136, and approve entering into a Mills Act Contract with the conditions of approval, and so recommend to the City Council.

STANDARDS AND CONDITIONS
415 North Primrose Avenue
Mills Act Contract MA-127

During the term of this agreement, the Historic property shall be subject to the following conditions:

1. All structures on the property shall be kept in excellent condition including exterior walls, windows and roofing.
2. A Certificate of Appropriateness shall be required for all exterior alterations and/or additions to any structure on the property. The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Historic Preservation shall be applied to the property with the exception that standard condition #9 shall allow for additions, exterior alterations or related new construction to match the original house upon approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness (Attachment A).
3. *View Corridor Maintained.* The view corridor enabling the general public to see the house from the public right-of-way shall not be further obscured. The view corridor, including landscaping, hardscape and fencing, shall be maintained.
4. *Landmark Plaque.* The owner(s) shall place a Historic Preservation Commission approved historic plaque on the site within two (2) years of the City Council designation of the historic landmark. The plaque shall be displayed at all times and shall be visible from the right-of-way.
5. *Electrical Safety Inspection.* Within two years of the date of City Council approval, an electrical safety inspection report shall be submitted on the electrical contractor's letterhead indicating that the existing service panel meets minimum code and poses no hazardous conditions, GFCI outlets are provided as specified by code, and proper grounding of the panel exists. This condition shall be waived if the building records confirm the upgrading of the service panel or written electrical inspection completed within the last five (5) years is provided.
6. The river rock fireplace in the main living room shall be protected and preserved.
7. The concrete walkway leading from the sidewalk to the front porch shall be repaired or replaced with scoring and concrete finish to match existing with two (2) years.
8. The property owner(s) shall submit to the Planning Division a progress report every 2 years for the first 10 years on the anniversary date of the Contract, listing a response to the conditions of approval as listed on this document. Report shall also include interior and exterior maintenance projects completed since your last required update report. After the first 10 years, a progress report shall be required every 5 years.

PRIMARY RECORD

Primary #
HRI #
Trinomial
CHR Status Code 5S3

Other Listings
Review Code

Reviewer

Date

Page 1 of 2 *Resource Name or #: HL-136-MA-127

P1 Other Identifier: 415 North Primrose Avenue

***P2 Location:** Not for Publication Unrestricted

a. County: Los Angeles

c. Address: 415 North Primrose Avenue **City:** Monrovia **Zip:** 91016

e. Other Locational Data: APN # 8520-019-010

P3a Description: (Describe resource and its major elements. Include design, materials, condition, alterations, size, setting, and boundaries)

The wood frame, single-family dwelling is sheathed in clapboard siding and is capped by a gable roofing system. The home has contrasting materials on the first and second floor and the foundation is made of river rock. The entrance to the home is sheltered between two projecting wings while the original pergola, removed many years ago, has been replaced with an exact duplicate based on photographs obtained from the descendants of former owners. The projecting wings are punctuated by wood frame sash, tripartite and fixed windows. The glazed entry door is flanked by pairs of sash windows. The house is set back from the public right-of-way.

P3b Resource Attributes: (List attributes and codes) HP1. Unknown

***P4 Resources Present:** Building Structure Object Site District Element of District Other

P5a Photograph



P5b Description of Photo: (view, date)

Front, July 2015

P6 Date Constructed: 1908

Source: County Assessor

P7 Owner and Address:
John and Danielle Barkume
415 N Primrose Ave
Monrovia, CA 91016

P8 Recorded by:

City of Monrovia

P9 Date Recorded: July 2015

P10 Survey Type: Individual

P11 Report Citation:

Attachments: NONE Location Map Sketch Map Continuation Sheet Building, Structure, and Object Record
 Archaeological Record District Record Linear Feature Record Milling Station Record Rock Art Record
 Artifact Record Photograph Record Other (List):

BUILDING, STRUCTURE, AND OBJECT RECORD Trinomial _____

Page 2 of 2 *Resource Name or #: HL-136-MA-127

B1 Historic Name: N/A

B2 Common Name: N/A

B3 Original Use Single-family residential

B4 Present Use Single-family residential

B5 Architectural Style Craftsman

B6 Construction History (Construction date, alterations, and date of alterations)

- 1908 - constructed
- 1979 – Swimming pool
- 1987 – new detached, two-car garage
- 1990 – new railing on rear balcony
- 1991 – retrofit

B7 Moved: No Date Moved N/A Original Location N/A

B8 Related Features:

B9a Architect: Unknown b. Builder: Unknown

B10 Significance: Theme: Architecture Area: Los Angeles

Period of Significance: 1908 Property Type HP2 - Single Family Property

Discuss importance in terms of historical or architectural context as well as integrity.

The property does not exhibit the necessary historical or architectural significance necessary for National Register listing. However, it is locally significant due to its adept use of Craftsman bungalow styling and features in its overall design.

Therefore, the dwelling appears eligible for designation as a City of Monrovia Landmark and California Register historical resource.

B11 Additional Resource Attributes:

B12 References:
County Assessor
City Building Permits

B13 Remarks

B14 Evaluator/
Date

Sketch Map with north arrow:

**NOTICE OF PUBLIC HEARING
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
415 SOUTH IVY AVENUE
MONROVIA, CA 91016**

A public hearing will be held by the Historic Preservation Commission of Monrovia at 7:30 p.m., or as soon thereafter as possible on **Wednesday, July 29, 2015** at City Hall in the Council Chambers, 415 South Ivy Avenue, Monrovia, California, to determine whether or not the following request for Historic Landmark Designation and Mills Act Contract should be approved under Title 17 Historic Preservation Ordinance of the Monrovia Municipal Code.

APPLICATION

Historic Landmark HL-136/Mills Act Contract MA-127
John and Danielle Barkume
415 North Primrose Avenue
Monrovia, CA 91016

ENVIRONMENTAL DOCUMENTATION

Categorical Exemption (Class 1)

Staff Report pertaining to this item will be available on Thursday, July 23, 2015 after 4:00 p.m. at the Monrovia City Hall, 415 South Ivy Avenue, Monrovia, California, Community Development Department/Planning Division.

Este aviso es para informarle sobre una junta pública acerca de la propiedad indicada mas arriba.

Si necesita información adicional en español, favor de ponerse en contacto con del Departamento de Planificación al número (626) 932-5587.

For further information regarding this application, please contact the Planning Division at (626) 932-5565.

Craig Jimenez
Planning Division Manager

PUBLISH ON JULY 16, 2015