



## **HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION STAFF REPORT**

**APPLICATION:** HL-141/MA-131

**AGENDA ITEM:** PH-1

**PREPARED BY:** Sheri Bermejo  
Planning Division Manager

**MEETING DATE:** March 1, 2017

**SUBJECT:** Historic Landmark HL-141/Mills Act MA-131  
438 West Duarte Road

**APPLICANT:** MJW Investments, LLC (Mathew J. Waken)  
1278 Glenneyre Street, Suite 439  
Laguna Beach, CA 92651

**REQUEST:** Historic Landmark Designation and approval of a Mills Act Contract

**ENVIRONMENTAL DETERMINATION:** Categorical Exemption (Class 1)

**BACKGROUND:** On June 2, 2015 the City Council adopted Resolution No. 2015-17, which approved a fourteen unit multi-family development at 430 – 438 West Duarte Road. The project is now complete, and it consists of thirteen attached residential units and an existing potential landmark residence (438 West Duarte Road).

The existing residence was originally proposed for demolition. The Historic Preservation Commission reviewed the demolition permit at their July 23, 2014 meeting. Using the California Historic Resources Status Codes, the Commission assigned a rating of 5S3, which indicated that the house would qualify as a historic landmark under Criteria 4. The Monrovia Municipal Code defines Criteria 4 as a property that embodies one or more distinctive characteristics of style, type, period, design, materials, detail or craftsmanship. Although the applicant appealed this decision, the City Council upheld the Commission's decision at their September 16, 2014 meeting. As a result, the project developer decided to incorporate the existing residence into the larger multi-family project. The developer's scope of work included both rehabilitating and renovating the historic house.

Pursuant to the Historic Preservation Ordinance, the property owner of 438 West Duarte Road has filed an application for consideration of historic landmark designation and approval of a Mills Act Contract.



**ANALYSIS:** The 2,078 square foot stucco-sided single-story residence was built in 1927 and has four bedrooms and three bathrooms. The Spanish Colonial Revival house is crowned by a low-pitched, side-gabled roof with a front gabled roof over the front porch. Red tiles cover the roof and smooth stucco sheathes the exterior. Roof elements include shallow overhanging eaves with exposed rafter tails on the rear and most of the front elevation. The gable ends have no overhang. Traditional Spanish Colonial Revival features include, recessed multi-pane casement windows, a turned spindle wood screen covering the rectangular window, and a deeply recessed front entrance. The front porch roof overhang is supported by a circular stucco substantial column that supports a wide beam beneath the roof. Decorative wood shutters flank the casement windows located on the front and east sides. An interior chimney is located on the west side.



The house is significantly intact. Interior architectural details of the home include arched doorways, original wood doors and casement windows, wood beam ceiling in the living room and a variety of niches throughout the house. Original oak flooring is found throughout the home.

In 2016, during the construction of the multi-family development, the historic home was completely refurbished and rehabilitated. The improvements included, but were not limited to, patching and painting the entire exterior, including trim and eaves. Three kitchen louvered windows were replaced with two casement windows and one single-hung window to match the existing windows on the home. Windows with cracked glazing were also replaced with new glazing. An inappropriate porch enclosure was added to the front northwest corner of the house in 1962, and was later enclosed. Upon the approval of a Special Review Application by the Historic Preservation Commission in July 2016, the porch enclosure was demolished and replaced with a new freestanding wood pergola. Lastly, many improvements were completed on the building's interior, which included electrical rewiring, a complete kitchen remodel with new cabinets and appliances, the refinishing of existing hardwood floors, and new paint. The existing vintage light fixtures, drapery rods, original bathroom tile floors, and the bathroom tubs were protected and maintained in the dwelling.

The first building permit on file for the property was to construct a new house in 1927 and lists the owner as Annie R. Noble. At that time, Duarte Road was called Main Street (Royal Oaks Drive was named Duarte Avenue).

The owner submitted information from City Directories regarding persons who have occupied the home in the past. The names include: C. W. Shallcross (1927-1943), Benjamin Hodges (1944 -1947), and the Coleman/Edwards family (1948-2014). There is no known information that any of these persons were significant in local, regional or state history. Information provided to the owner by the Edwards family suggests that the house was originally surrounded by orchards. The 1937 Los Angeles Directory indicates the existing house was on a much larger piece of land that extended to the southeast corner of Mayflower Avenue and Duarte Road.

### **Criteria and Guidelines**

The Commission must determine the applicable designation criteria for landmark status for the home at 438 West Duarte Road. As specified by the Historic Preservation Ordinance, a property must include one or more of the applicable designation criteria. The following criterion is presented for the Commission's consideration:

**Criteria Number 4** – *It embodies one or more distinctive characteristics of style, type, period, design, materials, detail, or craftsmanship.*

This property is locally significant as a good example of a Spanish Colonial Revival architecture and features in its overall design.

The property exemplifies characteristics of Spanish Revival architecture with its asymmetrical façade and use of stucco walls and chimney; arched principal entryway; clay red roof tiles; low-pitched and cross-gabled roof structure with little eave overhang; wood casement windows; multi-paned windows; and decorative wood and wrought iron details on the exterior of the home. The interior and exterior of the home are in excellent condition and substantially intact. Due to the architecture, the dwelling appears eligible for designation as a City of Monrovia Landmark.

Staff's determination is that 438 West Duarte Road meets Criterion Number 4.

### **Mills Act Contract**

The applicants are also requesting approval of a Mills Act Contract, which will provide tax savings for the homeowners. The City will lose a portion of the property tax collected on the property to assure its preservation and enhancement.

### **Conditions**

The house is well restored from public view, so the set standards and conditions will be applied to the house (attached Exhibit C). These include placing a historic plaque on the property, and maintaining the building's exterior stucco finish, roofing materials, windows and doors. A seismic retrofit will be required within ten years.

### **DPR Form**

The Historic Preservation Commission reviewed a demolition permit at their July 23, 2014 meeting, and using the California Historic Resource Status Code, the Commission assigned the subject property a status code of 5S3 which indicated that the house would qualify as a landmark due to its architectural styling. This rating was later upheld by the City Council at their September 16, 2014 meeting during the review of an appeal application of the July 2014 Historic Preservation Commission decision. Since Staff is processing this application as a City of Monrovia Historic Landmark, a status code of 5S3 continues to be assigned (appears to be individually eligible for local listing or designation through survey evaluation). The 2014 DPR Form has been updated to reflect the current property information. If the Historic Preservation Commission determines that the house is eligible for listing for local designation and the City Council concurs, then the code will be changed to 5S1 (individual property that is listed or designated locally).

The DPR form is attached for the review, comment and approval of the Commission.

**RECOMMENDATION:** Staff recommends that the Historic Preservation Commission forward a Nomination Statement to the City Council recommending that the house at 438 West Duarte Road be designated as a historic landmark. Approval of a Mills Act Contract with the property owner subject to the attached conditions is also recommended.

If the Historic Preservation Commission concurs with this recommendation and determines that the property meets at least one of the seven criteria for historic landmark designation, and the information provided on the DPR form is accurate then, following the public hearing, the following motion is appropriate:

**Designate the property at 438 West Duarte Road as Historic Landmark Number 141, and approve entering into a Mills Act Contract with the conditions of approval, and so recommend to the City Council.**

**STANDARDS AND CONDITIONS**  
**438 West Duarte Road**  
**Mills Act Contract MA-131**

During the term of this agreement, the Historic property shall be subject to the following conditions:

1. All structures on the property shall be kept in excellent condition including exterior walls, windows and roofing.
2. A Certificate of Appropriateness shall be required for all exterior alterations and/or additions to any structure on the property. The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Historic Preservation shall be applied to the property with the exception that standard condition #9 shall allow for additions, exterior alterations or related new construction to match the original building upon approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness (Attachment A).
3. *View Corridor Maintained.* The view corridor enabling the general public to see the building from the public right-of-way shall not be further obscured. The view corridor, including landscaping, hardscape and fencing, shall be maintained.
4. *Landmark Plaque.* The owner(s) shall place a Historic Preservation Commission approved historic plaque on the site within two (2) years of the City Council designation of the historic landmark. The plaque shall be displayed at all times and shall be visible from the right-of-way.
5. *Electrical Safety Inspection.* Within two (2) years of the date of City Council approval, an electrical safety inspection report shall be submitted on the electrical contractor's letterhead indicating that the existing service panel meets minimum code and poses no hazardous conditions, GFCI outlets are provided as specified by code, and proper grounding of the panel exists. This condition shall be waived if the building records confirm the upgrading of the service panel or written electrical inspection completed within the last five (5) years is provided.
6. *Seismic Retrofit.* Documentation by either a building permit or building inspector's report must be submitted verifying completion of a seismic retrofit. If the house has not been seismically retrofitted, it shall be retrofitted within ten (10) years of the date of the City Council approval. Seismic retrofit shall be at minimum the bolting of the house to an approved foundation.
7. The property owner(s) shall submit to the Planning Division a progress report every two (2) years for the first ten (10) years on the anniversary date of the Contract, listing a response to the conditions of approval as listed on this document. Report shall also include interior and exterior maintenance projects completed since your last required update report. After the first ten (10) years, a progress report shall be required every five (5) years.

Other Listings  
Review Code

Reviewer

Date

Page 1 of 2 \*Resource Name or #: 438 West Duarte Road

P1 Other Identifier: 438 West Duarte Road

\*P2 Location:  Not for Publication  Unrestricted

a. County: Los Angeles

c. Address: 438 West Duarte Road City: Monrovia Zip: 91016

e. Other Locational Data: APN # 8509-009-050

P3a Description: (Describe resource and its major elements. Include design, materials, condition, alterations, size, setting, and boundaries)

This 2,078 square foot stucco-sided single-story residence was built in 1927 and has three bedrooms and three bathrooms. The Spanish Colonial Revival house is crowned by a low-pitched, side-gabled roof with a front gabled roof over the front porch. Red tiles cover the roof and smooth stucco sheathes the exteriors. Roof elements include shallow overhanging eaves with exposed rafter tails on the rear and most of the front elevation. Traditional Spanish Colonial Revival features include, recessed multi-pane casement windows, a turned spindle wood screen covering the rectangular window, and a deeply recessed front entrance. The front porch roof overhang is supported by a circular stucco column that supports a wide beam beneath the roof. Decorative wood shutters flank the casement windows located on the front and east sides. An interior chimney is located on the west side.

P3b Resource Attributes: (List attributes and codes) HP2. Single family property

\*P4 Resources Present:  Building  Structure  Object  Site  District  Element of District  Other

P5a Photograph

P5b Description of Photo: Front view, July 2014



P6 Date Constructed: 1927

Source: LA County Assessor

P7 Owner and Address:

MJW Investments, LLC  
Matthew J. Waken  
1278 Glenneyre Street #439  
Laguna Beach, CA 92651

P8 Recorded by:

City of Monrovia

P9 Date Recorded: February 2017

P10 Survey Type: Individual

P11 Report Citation:

Attachments:  NONE  Location Map  Sketch Map  Continuation Sheet  Building, Structure, and Object Record  
 Archaeological Record  District Record  Linear Feature Record  Milling Station Record  Rock Art Record  
 Artifact Record  Photograph Record  Other (List):

Page 2 of 2 \*Resource Name or #: 438 West Duarte Road

**B1 Historic Name:** None

**B2 Common Name:** None

**B3 Original Use** Single-family Residence

**B4 Present Use** Single-family Residence

**B5 Architectural Style** Spanish Colonial Revival

**B6 Construction History** (Construction date, alterations, and date of alterations)

- 1927 – House constructed for \$10,800
- 1961 – Pool added
- 1962 – Porch roof added to northwest corner of front of house
- 2016 – Demolished 1962 patio structure off master bedroom and constructed freestanding pergola structure

**B7 Moved:** No      **Date Moved** \_\_\_\_\_      **Original Location** \_\_\_\_\_

**B8 Related Features:**

**B9a Architect:** Unknown      **b. Builder:** Lincoln Manufacturing Company

**B10 Significance:** **Theme:** Architecture      **Area:** Monrovia

**Period of Significance:** 1927      **Property Type** HP2 - Single Family Property  
 Discuss importance in terms of historical or architectural context as well as integrity.

This property does not exhibit the necessary historical or architectural significance necessary for National Register listing. However, it is locally significant due to its adept use of Spanish Colonial Revival styling and features in its overall design. Therefore, the dwelling appears eligible for designation as a City of Monrovia Landmark and California Register historical resource.

**B11 Additional Resource Attributes:**

**B12 References:**  
 Monrovia City Directories  
 LA County Assessor  
 Monrovia Building Permits

**B13 Remarks**

**B14 Evaluator/ Date**      City of Monrovia  
 Updated February 2017

