

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION STAFF REPORT

APPLICATION: Special Review AGENDA ITEM: AR-1

PREPARED BY: Sheri Bermejo MEETING DATE: April 26, 2017

Planning Division Manager

SUBJECT: Special Review

324-326 South Myrtle Avenue

Bill Kilpatrick, Property Owner

APPLICANT: 324-326 South Myrtle Avenue

Monrovia, CA 91016

REQUEST: Review of Proposed Façade Remodel

BACKGROUND: The building located at 324-326 South Myrtle Avenue is in the City's Historic Commercial Downtown (HCD) zone. Section 17.14.050 of the Monrovia Municipal Code gives authority to the Historic Preservation Commission to review and approve façade changes in the HCD zone to ensure the appropriateness for Old Town and to encourage the preservation and restoration of historic buildings. The Historic Preservation Commission completed a Special Review for a proposed façade remodel at 324-326 South Myrtle Avenue on November 30, 2016. At that meeting the Commission approved the structural changes to the building and conceptual design but requested that the final exterior finishes and decorative features come back to the Commission for further review and approval.

As the Commission is aware, the original building was constructed as a J.C. Penney retail store in 1956 with 13,500 square feet of ground floor area and 13,500 square feet of basement area totaling 27,000 square feet. In 1983, J.C. Penney vacated the building. A remodel was completed in 1986, which changed the retail appearance to an office frontage. In 1989 approvals were obtained for the building to be used as an antique mall. It was last occupied by the 4th Dimension billiard hall. The current building owner is in the process of completing a significant interior tenant improvement which will convert the



existing single tenant building into three new tenant spaces, consisting of two retail/restaurant storefronts along Myrtle Avenue, totaling approximately 3,000 square feet, and a 24,000 square foot administrative/professional office space occupying the ground floor at the rear of the building and the entire basement.

Devising a new exterior design for the subject midcentury building has been challenging for many reasons. In particular, the building's storefront has four to five times the amount of frontage than most other storefronts in Monrovia's downtown. Additionally, the extant portion of the 1955 building is also very simple, consisting entirely of painted brick. Lastly, from a seismic point of view, all sides of the existing building were built like a fortress except for the Myrtle Avenue storefront which has little structural support. The Myrtle Avenue frontage requires the addition of substantial structural elements to meet seismic requirements.

Throughout the planning process, the building owner and his designer worked very diligently with both City staff and the appointed subcommittee (Vice Chair Burke and Commissioners Jimenez and Ryan) to come up with alternative colors and finishes that will both respect the existing building's architectural style, as well as compliment the City's historic downtown. The applicant's exterior building designer completed a significant amount of pre-planning background research. She focused her study on midcentury modern building architecture and reviewed several Monrovia High School yearbook photos taken of this subject block of Myrtle Avenue. Several exterior finish samples were also tested and reviewed for appropriateness. Prior to deciding on this final proposed color and material selection, she also conducted survey to obtain the community's feedback. Individuals who walked past the building were surveyed on four different days, and a total of 40 signatures were collected from people who are currently living or working in Monrovia. A copy of the applicant's survey results have been included in this report as Exhibit "A."

DISCUSSION: The façade renovation incorporates a remodeled storefront that will consist of traditional design elements, such as display windows containing clear glass, a bulkhead, and recessed entries. Both the subcommittee and the applicant's design team agreed that these features were both desirable for the pedestrian oriented retail and restaurant uses, as well as complementary to other Myrtle Avenue storefronts.

New materials and finishes have been selected to convey a sense of quality and durability, and to create a pleasing diversity of colors and textures. The new array of design elements are intended to reflect a modest midcentury modern architectural style.



The façade remodel proposes to retain the original brick building's midcentury aesthetic as much as possible. All design elements that were added for decoration in the 1980s will be removed, including the green cornice trims at the top of the building, the green light fixture that spans the entire length of the storefront, and the ceramic red tiling.

The renovation plan maintains the largely masonry building which will be painted light grey (Dunn Edwards Faded Gray #DEW382). The building will also be improved with a new black flashing at the top. A new black aluminum storefront with large 6'-0" by 6'-0" transparent glass panes will open up two new commercial tenant spaces to the sidewalk. The storefront entries will be recessed 3'-0" in accordance with Monrovia Municipal Code Section 17.14.040(C).

Five large structural walls will be evenly spaced and integrated into the front façade design to reinforce the building. The walls measure approximately 6'-6" wide by 12'-0' tall and will be finished with a troweled stucco finish. In order to create visual interest, the revised renovation plan proposes to incorporate a large panel of light grey concrete architectural tiles within each structural wall (Arto Brick Impressions Collection 7 x 7 Corona color: Early Gray). Each tile measures 7" by 7" and incorporates a concave and convex circle design. Each panel of tile measures approximately a 46" wide by 81" tall and includes a concrete 2" trim. The neutral light grey paint and tile colors will mirror the colors of the City's library across the street. The contoured tile will also break up the façade plane and create a visual play of light and shadow during the day.

A revised bulkhead surface is proposed at the base of the building and will consist of glazed 4"x4" ceramic tile that has a blend of dark blue and brown colors (Arto Brick Monrovia Collection 4 x 4 color: Black & Blue). Given that the façade will consist of light muted grey tones, the revised bulkhead tile selection will provide sufficient contrast and serve as a nice building accent. Lastly, a beige canvas awning (Sunbrella Echo Ash #57005-0000) will intersect the entire front façade and project out approximately 5'-0" over the side walk. The color of the awning has been revised to match the new tile.



As mentioned earlier in this report, the largest tenant space will be used for administrative/professional office and will occupy the remaining floor area behind the commercial storefront, as well as the entire basement. A separate entrance for this tenant space will be located off the alley, near the northeast corner of the building. Old side doors will be removed and the wall be patched with new concrete block to match. A new landing and accessible ramp will also be installed.

The property owner is working with the City's Public Services Department to coordinate alley improvements. New decorative stamped concrete is proposed throughout the alley which will freshen up the public space. The Community Development Department also hopes to facilitate a public art project on the side of the building.

The color and material samples will be available for the Commission's review at the April 26, 2017 meeting.

RECOMMENDATION: Staff recommends approval of the proposed building renovation. If the Historic Preservation Commission concurs with the recommendation, then the following motion is appropriate.

Approve the facade remodel at 324-326 South Myrtle Avenue

Staff Report Exhibits

- A. Survey Signatures and Letters of Support
- B. Architectural Plans (Elevations)

From: < ratkin2011@gmail.com >

Date: March 2, 2017 at 1:25:01 PM PST

To: "barbara moulton@yahoo.com" <barbara moulton@yahoo.com>

Subject: Renovation of old pool half downtown Monrovia

Dear Barbara,

It was a pleasure talking with you Monday about the exterior of the old Pool Hall on Myrtle Street. I want to thank you for sharing with us your ideas for the exterior of the building. I really like the way the tiles with round patterns appeared when you presented them to us; both in actual tiles and also the photograph of a completed wall was very attractive and clean looking. You have my support and best wishes to achieve this look.

Sincerely Yours,

Richard R. Atkin 125 N. Lincoln Pl. Monrovia, CA 91016

Sent from Mail for Windows 10

wife owns Romantic Nails

From: Philip Bourdillon

bourdillon@sbcglobal.net>

Date: March 2, 2017 at 7:19:37 AM PST

To: "barbara_moulton@yahoo.com" <barbara_moulton@yahoo.com>

Subject: 326 South Myrtle

Reply-To: Philip Bourdillon < bourdillon@sbcglobal.net>

As a resident of Monrovia, I find your proposal for the renovation of the facade of 326 South Myrtle quite acceptable -- and certainly an improvement on the existing structure.

PB

From: Victoria Gross < victoria gross 075@gmail.com >

Date: February 28, 2017 at 4:01:29 PM PST

To: barbara_moulton@yahoo.com

Subject: Monrovia

Hi Barbara,

It was very nice meeting you this afternoon and thank you for showing me the sketches for the building on Myrtle. I especially loved the tile as it is so retro and perfect for the era of the building. It is so important to restore these buildings to the time they belong in and it is obvious you know how to do that.

I have a space in Kaleidoscope Antique Mall and think it is wonderful bringing new retail to the area.

Best Wishes on this endeavor.

Sincerely,

Victoria Gross

Barcon Productions Story Producer 714-292-3441

To whom it ma	4 Coucerd:
After seeing &	iamples - pictores of the
New TILE pro	posal on the dd 4th Dimensia
6/29. ON myst	Le Ave, I like the NEW test
Tile + find it	easy to Look at I am, a
long Time res	ident, REGISTERED voter - RETIRED
2 like the look	i dour downtown area -
feel This TILE	will HOT TAKE Awaky
that appeal	
	Daviel Castille
	321 W. Lines Ave it
	Monteva, Ca 91016

The Moulton Company

8705 Fenton Dr. Austin, Texas 78736

Mobile: 512-786-4991 Fax: 512-212-4351 barbara_moulton@yahoo.com 3.17

I live in Monrovia CA. Today I saw the design being proposed for the building @ 3265. Myrtle Ave. I like the paint and proposed pands of cerde tiles shown on rendering and photo.

I hope this design gets approved DI Celentino

The Moulton Company

8705 Fenton Dr. Austin, Texas 78736

Mobile: 512-786-4991 Fax: 512-212-4351 barbara_moulton@yahoo.com

3.17

I live in Monrovia CA. Today I saw the design being proposed for the building @ 3265. Myrtle Ave.

I like the point and proposed pands of circle tiles shown on rendering and photo.

I hope this design acts ammoved

I hope this design gets approved Thank you,

Sor improvement. Regida Serreder.

The Moulton Company

8705 Fenton Dr. Austin, Texas 78736

Mobile: 512-786-4991 Fax: 512-212-4351 barbara_moulton@yahoo.com

3.17

I live in Monrovia CA. Today I saw the design being proposed for the building @ 3265. Myrtle Ave.

I like the paint and proposed pands of circle tiles shown on rendering and photo.

I hope this design gets approved

Thank you,

works @ lebrary across the street

I hope that this design will get approval with the Historic Committee representing the city of Monrovia.

Sincerely,

Bryan That WORTH
450 Myrtle ST, MONROVIA CA THOWORRA COMMINICOM
Comment:

I hope that this design will get approval with the Historic Committee representing the city of Monrovia. Sincerely,

Comment: Keep MONROVIA HISTORICAL. Markthe

I hope that this design will get approval with the Historic Committee representing the city of Monrovia.

Sincerely,

adam & Chistina Dayme

Been Leve for 2 years

I hope that this design will get approval with the Historic Committee representing the city of Monrovia. Sincerely,

Comment:

Diana (Cortez

I hope that this design will get approval with the Historic Committee representing the city of Monrovia.

Sincerely,

Sisa Welle Comment:

I hope that this design will get approval with the Historic Committee representing the city of Monrovia.

Sincerely,

Comment:

SW

The tiles and panels would suit the feel of downtown and the overall presentation would reflect the airy feel of the library, which would add to the cestletics of oldtown.

I hope that this design will get approval with the Historic Committee representing the city of Monrovia. Sincerely,

Comment.

Mei New facade, Was here when I C Pennys Was here. So excited to see it back to its heyday.

Mrs. Thomas!

Mana Mc Cyfurty

I hope that this design will get approval with the Historic Committee representing the city of Monrovia.

Sincerely,

1 think the design would fit in Bentifuly with our old town feel.

I hope that this design will get approval with the Historic Committee representing the city of Monrovia.

Sincerely,

Comment,

I like how 1+'s going to look Midcentery and Fit he feel of he town!

I hope that this design will get approval with the Historic Committee representing the city of Monrovia.

Sincerely, Ser an Perran

Comment. I really like the Idea of
the new tracity of the traditional Style
the Keeping of the traditional Style
of Buldry I am happy to see
that the Uhroneous trins will
be foing away
this is a nice honest open opproach
this is a nice honest open opproach
there is a nice honest open opproach
and the Roole from orcadia

I hope that this design will get approval with the Historic Committee representing the city of Monrovia. Sincerely,

Comment:

Design looks just!

I hope that this design will get approval with the Historic Committee representing the city of Monrovia.

Sincerely,

omment.

Pork great. Love it

Chef @ Craft Hill

I hope that this design will get approval with the Historic Committee representing the city of Monrovia.

Sincerely, Malfett Tim moffett

> Comments: I think the canvas awning will tie the 50's look to the 1880 look street scape. That is the key factor to making this all work and still be true historically, as much as one could. The neutral colors will mirror across the Street Library.

I hope that this design will get approval with the Historic Committee representing the city of Monrovia.

Sincerely,

Comment:

Margie Spit

Like large windows & the tile Selection.

She said graduated from Monrowea HS 55 years agor longtime issident

I hope that this design will get approval with the Historic Committee representing the city of Monrovia.

Sincerely,

Comment:

I really like the idea of retail and offices! The design patterns are very beautiful and look clean and unique.

Carly Lyman

I hope that this design will get approval with the Historic Committee representing the city of Monrovia.

Sincerely,

Comment: I like the colors and the theme

Of & the new & Design!

- Max Lee

Grand mother owns toy shop Uncle owns peshing tackle shop

I hope that this design will get approval with the Historic Committee representing the city of Monrovia.

Sincerely,

Comment: | like tile pattern.

horle a

Parsons

I hope that this design will get approval with the Historic Committee representing the city of Monrovia.

Sincerely,

Comment.

Micole Birkholz

Monrovia deserves retail that will thrive \$\forall vphold Monrovian values.

I hope that this design will get approval with the Historic Committee representing the city of Monrovia.

Sincerely,

Comment:

William Birkholz

Monrovia could use a good retail shop here and preserve that old time feel that Monrovia has.

I hope that this design will get approval with the Historic Committee representing the city of Monrovia.

Comments:

Signature of:

Charles Mills work Wfrontier Date: 3.28.17

I live/work in Monrovia, CA. Today I saw a presentation for the exterior finishes proposed for building being renovated at 326 S. Myrtle Ave. I liked the overall design for the exterior including the rustic bluish tile for below the store front windows and the grey concrete circle tiles going in panels on the vertical support walls.

I hope that this design will get approval with the Historic Committee representing the city of Monrovia.

Comments:

MM/MM Signature of: Michael J. Nelson

I live work in Monrovia, CA. Today I saw a presentation for the exterior finishes proposed for building being renovated at 326 S. Myrtle Ave. I liked the overall design for the exterior including the rustic bluish tile for below the store front windows and the grey concrete circle tiles going in panels on the vertical support walls.

I hope that this design will get approval with the Historic Committee representing the city of Monrovia.

Comments:

Signature/of:

BARRY POWER

I live/work in Monrovia, CA. Today I saw a presentation for the exterior finishes proposed for building being renovated at 326 S. Myrtle Ave. I liked the overall design for the exterior including the rustic bluish tile for below the store front windows and the grey concrete circle tiles going in panels on the vertical support walls.

I hope that this design will get approval with the Historic Committee representing the city of Monrovia.

Comments:

Signature of:

Rikomero

Margarita Romero

I live/work in Monrovia, CA. Today I saw a presentation for the exterior finishes proposed for building being renovated at 326 S. Myrtle Ave. I liked the overall design for the exterior including the rustic bluish tile for below the store front windows and the grey concrete circle tiles going in panels on the vertical support walls.

I hope that this design will get approval with the Historic Committee representing the city of Monrovia.

Janne Spring

Comments:

Signature of:

James Spring Joanne Spring

I hope that this design will get approval with the Historic Committee representing the city of Monrovia.

I really like the idea of sekvening st

Signature of:

I hope that this design will get approval with the Historic Committee representing the city of Monrovia.

I have lived an Colorado right off Myrtle and would love to see this fullding

Signature

design looks great tome.

Karina Akhmedova

Date: 3 - 28 - 17

I live work in Monrovia, CA. Today I saw a presentation for the exterior finishes proposed for building being renovated at 326 S. Myrtle Ave. I liked the overall design for the exterior including the rustic bluish tile for below the store front windows and the grey concrete circle tiles going in panels on the vertical support walls.

I hope that this design will get approval with the Historic Committee representing the city of Monrovia.

Comments:

Signature of:

I hope that this design will get approval with the Historic Committee representing the city of Monrovia.

Comments:

Signature of:

GENA Kumplé

Date: 3.28.17

I live/work in Monrovia, CA. Today I saw a presentation for the exterior finishes proposed for building being renovated at 326 S. Myrtle Ave. I liked the overall design for the exterior including the rustic bluish tile for below the store front windows and the grey concrete circle tiles going in panels on the vertical support walls.

I hope that this design will get approval with the Historic Committee representing the city of Monrovia.

Comments:

Signature of:

Kristen Smith

Shop owner

(ballet outfuts)

I live/work in Monrovia, CA. Today I saw a presentation for the exterior finishes proposed for building being renovated at 326 S. Myrtle Ave. I liked the overall design for the exterior including the rustic bluish tile for below the store front windows and the grey concrete circle tiles going in panels on the vertical support walls.

I hope that this design will get approval with the Historic Committee representing the city of Monrovia.

Comments:

Signature of:

Wivian Love

I hope that this design will get approval with the Historic Committee representing the city of Monrovia.

Comments:

Signature of:

Marie Serna

I hope that this design will get approval with the Historic Committee representing the city of Monrovia.

Comments:

Signature of:

Brandan Moriarty

I hope that this design will get approval with the Historic Committee representing the city of Monrovia.

Comments:

Signature of:

-4

I hope that this design will get approval with the Historic Committee representing the city of Monrovia.

Comments:

Signature of:

Date: 3-30-17

I live/work in Monrovia, CA. Today I saw a presentation for the exterior finishes proposed for building being renovated at 326 S. Myrtle Ave. I liked the overall design for the exterior including the rustic bluish tile for below the store front windows and the grey concrete circle tiles going in panels on the vertical support walls.

I hope that this design will get approval with the Historic Committee representing the city of Monrovia.

Comments:

Signature of:

aspall h

anthur Bullard





