



HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION STAFF REPORT

APPLICATION: HL-142/MA-132

AGENDA ITEM: PH-1

PREPARED BY: Teresa Santilena
Assistant Planner

MEETING DATE: April 26, 2017

TITLE: Historic Landmark HL-142/Mills Act Contract MA-132
518 East Colorado Boulevard
Monrovia, CA 91016

APPLICANT: John R. Hull, Jr. and Marylee W. Hull
518 East Colorado Boulevard
Monrovia, CA 91016

REQUEST: Historic landmark designation and approval of a Mills Act Contract

ENVIRONMENTAL DETERMINATION: Categorical Exemption (Class 1)

BACKGROUND: Pursuant to the Historic Preservation Ordinance, the property owner of 518 East Colorado Boulevard has filed an application for consideration of historic landmark designation and approval of a Mills Act Contract.

ANALYSIS: The subject property is located on the southeast corner of East Colorado Boulevard and Gladys Avenue. The property is improved with a 2,178 square foot Craftsman single family home (518 East Colorado) that was built in 1908. A 925 square foot second unit (612 Gladys Avenue), which was built 1922, and a two-car garage at the rear of the property were also built in the Craftsman style.



The two-story home features a side gabled roof with a wide eave overhangs, exposed beams, and decorative knee braces. The roof also has exposed rafter tails, and the bargeboards have decorative teardrop cut outs on the ends. The home is clad in contrasting wood siding materials, with clapboard siding on the first floor and shingle siding on the second floor. A partial-width, projecting front porch is located on the front (north) elevation. The shed roof of

the porch is supported by large battered river rock piers. The porch is enclosed by a low river rock wall with concrete caps. Decorative river rock elements are also featured on the fireplace and chimney that emerges near the ridgeline, and a garden wall to the east of the structure, which is considered to be a contributing feature. Window types include casement and double-hung, and many of the windows have original wood-framed screens. Diamond multi-paned lights are featured on many of the windows, both casement and the upper sashes of double-hung windows. Each window that incorporates this diamond shape, multi-pane detailing, was made with a unique pane size and shape. The three east facing windows have narrow and elongated diamond panes and the west facing windows have a shorter, wider diamond pattern. Lastly, the window surrounds on the first floor are wide. On the second floor, they are very narrow. The house is set back from the public right-of-way.

A second unit fronting Gladys Avenue (612 Gladys Avenue) was built in 1922 in the Craftsman style, emulating many features of the primary residence, including clapboard siding, triangular knee braces, and exposed rafter tails. The roof of the second unit also features lattice vents. The casement windows have four divided lights at the top of the windows. There is anecdotal evidence that the second unit was built from a Sears Kit.

Building permit records on file for the primary residence show permits for a bathroom remodel in 1968. During that remodel, one original window was replaced with a louvered window. A new fence was installed in 2004. The Applicant submitted the history on the home which revealed that the house did not have a notable architect or builder, nor were any previous residents significant in Monrovia history.

Criteria and Guidelines

The Commission must determine the applicable designation criteria for landmark status for the house at 518 East Colorado Boulevard. As specified by the Historic Preservation Ordinance, a property must include one or more of the applicable designation criteria. The following criterion is presented for the Commission's consideration.

Criteria Number 4 – *It embodies one or more distinctive characteristics of style, type, period, design, materials, detail, or craftsmanship.*

The property is significant under this criterion as it exemplifies characteristics of Craftsman architecture with its large overhanging eaves, exposed beams and decorative cut rafter tails, decorative knee braces, clapboard and shingle siding, wide tapered river rock porch supports, and original wood trimmed windows and doors with decorative diamond pattern. Additionally, the use of river rock on the porch, chimney and garden wall is unique to the home, and has been maintained in excellent condition.

The building is in excellent condition and retains integrity in its design, materials and workmanship. Staff's determination is that 518 East Colorado Boulevard meets Criterion Number 4.

Mills Act Contract

The applicant is also requesting approval of a Mills Act Contract which will provide tax savings for the homeowner. The City will lose a portion of the property tax collected on the property to assure its preservation and enhancement.

Conditions

The home has been well maintained and the building is well restored from public view. The set standards and conditions will be applied (Exhibit A), including placing a historic plaque on the property and seismically retrofitting the building within ten years. Staff is also recommending that the exterior kitchen door and louvered bathroom window be replaced with period appropriate materials consistent with the existing design and style of the existing exterior doors and windows on the home.

Furthermore, the owner has submitted a 10 year plan for the property that includes replacing the roof with roofing of similar color and material, painting, and conducting repairs as needed. Additionally, there is an original window on the rear (south) facing second story gable that may need replacing. The fenestration is awkward; the current window extends down to the roofline and interferes with the flashing, creating a potential for leaks. The repair work would reframe the window and provide new starter board to prevent potential water damage. If an alternative window is proposed, the replacement window would require approval by the Historic Preservation to ensure that it is appropriate.



DPR Form

Staff is processing this application as a City of Monrovia Historic Landmark, and a status code of 5S3 has been assigned (appears to be individually eligible for local listing or designation through survey evaluation). If the Historic Preservation Commission determines that the building is eligible for listing for local designation and the City Council concurs, then the code will be changed to 5S1 (individual property that is listed or designated locally). The DPR form is attached for the review, comment and approval of the Commission.

RECOMMENDATION: Staff recommends that the Historic Preservation Commission forward a Nomination Statement to the City Council recommending that the house at 518 East Colorado Boulevard be designated as a historic landmark. Approval of a Mills Act Contract with the property owner subject to the attached conditions is also recommended.

If the Historic Preservation Commission concurs with this recommendation and determines that the property meets at least one of the seven criteria for historic landmark designation, and the information provided on the DPR is accurate, then following the public hearing, the following motion is appropriate:

Designate the property at 518 East Colorado Boulevard as Historic Landmark Number 142, and approve entering into a Mills Act Contract with the conditions of approval, and so recommend to the City Council.

STANDARDS AND CONDITIONS
518 East Colorado Boulevard
Mills Act Contract MA-132

During the term of this agreement, the Historic property shall be subject to the following conditions:

1. All structures on the property shall be kept in excellent condition including exterior walls, windows and roofing.
2. A Certificate of Appropriateness shall be required for all exterior alterations and/or additions to any structure on the property. The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Historic Preservation shall be applied to the property with the exception that standard condition #9 shall allow for additions, exterior alterations or related new construction to match the original building upon approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness (Attachment A).
3. *View Corridor Maintained.* The view corridor enabling the general public to see the building from the public right-of-way shall not be further obscured. The view corridor, including landscaping, hardscape and fencing, shall be maintained.
4. *Landmark Plaque.* The owner(s) shall place a Historic Preservation Commission approved historic plaque on the site within two (2) years of the City Council designation of the historic landmark. The plaque shall be displayed at all times and shall be visible from the right-of-way.
5. *Electrical Safety Inspection.* Within two (2) years of the date of City Council approval, an electrical safety inspection report shall be submitted on the electrical contractor's letterhead indicating that the existing service panel meets minimum code and poses no hazardous conditions, GFCI outlets are provided as specified by code, and proper grounding of the panel exists. This condition shall be waived if the building records confirm the upgrading of the service panel or written electrical inspection completed within the last five (5) years is provided.
6. *Seismic Retrofit.* Documentation by either a building permit or building inspector's report must be submitted verifying completion of a seismic retrofit. If the house has not been seismically retrofitted, it shall be retrofitted within ten (10) years of the date of the City Council approval. Seismic retrofit shall be at minimum the bolting of the house to an approved foundation.
7. *Backdoor Replacement.* The exterior kitchen door shall be replaced with an architecturally appropriate door within four (4) years.
8. *Window Replacement.* The louvered bathroom window shall be replaced with an architecturally appropriate window within four (4) years.
9. The property owner(s) shall submit to the Planning Division a progress report every two (2) years for the first ten (10) years on the anniversary date of the Contract, listing a response to the conditions of approval as listed on this document. Report shall also include interior and exterior maintenance projects completed since your last required update report. After the first ten (10) years, a progress report shall be required every five (5) years.

Other Listings
Review Code

Reviewer

Date

Page 1 of 2 *Resource Name or #: HL-142/MA-132

P1 Other Identifier: 518 East Colorado Boulevard

*P2 Location: Not for Publication Unrestricted

a. County: Los Angeles

c. Address: 518 East Colorado Boulevard City: Monrovia Zip: 91016

e. Other Locational Data: APN # 8517-012-001

P3a Description: (Describe resource and its major elements. Include design, materials, condition, alterations, size, setting, and boundaries)

The wood framed, two-story Craftsman residence was built in 1908 and capped by a side-gabled roof system with large gabled dormers on both the front (north) and rear (south) elevations. The roof has wide overhanging eaves, triangular knee braces, exposed rafters tails. The bargeboards have decorative teardrop cut outs on the ends. The home is clad in contrasting wood siding materials, with clapboard siding on the first floor and shingle siding on the second floor. A partial-width, projecting front porch is located on the front (north) elevation. The shed roof of the porch is supported by large battered river rock piers. The porch is enclosed by a low river rock wall with concrete caps. Decorative river rock elements are also featured on the fireplace and chimney that emerges near the ridgeline, and a garden wall to the east of the structure. Window types include casement and double-hung, and many of the windows have original wood-framed screens. Diamond multi-paned lights are featured on many of the windows, both casement and the upper sashes of double hung windows. The window surrounds on the first floor are wide. On the second floor, they are very narrow. The house is set back from the public right-of-way.

A second residential unit fronting Gladys Avenue (612 Gladys Avenue) was built in 1922 in the Craftsman style, emulating many features of the primary residence, including clapboard siding, triangular knee braces, and exposed rafter tails. The roof also features lattice vents. The casement windows have four divided lights at the top of the windows. There is anecdotal evidence that the second unit was built from a Sears Kit.

P3b Resource Attributes: (List attributes and codes) HP3. Multi-Family Property

*P4 Resources Present: Building Structure Object Site District Element of District Other

P5a Photograph

P5b Description of Photo: (view, date)

Facing southwest, March 2017

P6 Date Constructed: 1908

Source: County Assessor

P7 Owner and Address:

John R. Hull, Jr. and Marylee W. Hull
518 East Colorado Boulevard
Monrovia, CA 91016

P8 Recorded by:

City of Monrovia

P9 Date Recorded: April 2017

P10 Survey Type: Individual



P11 Report Citation: None

Attachments: NONE Location Map Sketch Map Continuation Sheet Building, Structure, and Object Record
 Archaeological Record District Record Linear Feature Record Milling Station Record Rock Art Record
 Artifact Record Photograph Record Other (List):

Page 2 of 2 *Resource Name or #: HL-142-MA-132

- B1 **Historic Name:** N/A
- B2 **Common Name:** N/A
- B3 **Original Use** Single-family residential
- B4 **Present Use** Multi-family residential
- Architectural**
- B5 **Style** Craftsman

B6 **Construction History** (Construction date, alterations, and date of alterations)

- 1907 – Main dwelling constructed
- 1922 – 2nd residential unit constructed
- 1968 – bathroom remodel within main dwelling

B7 **Moved:** No **Date Moved** N/A **Original Location** N/A

B8 **Related Features:**

- River rock garden wall located on the east side of the main dwelling
- River rock fireplace in the living room
- 2nd residential unit
- Detached two-car garage

B9a **Architect:** Earl J. Brink **b. Builder:** Daniel R. Stewart (Single Family Residence in 1908);
Residential W.E. Barnard (2nd unit in 1922)

B10 **Significance:** **Theme:** Development **Area:** Monrovia

Period of Significance: 1907 **Property Type** HP3 – Multiple Family Residential

Discuss importance in terms of historical or architectural context as well as integrity.

The property is locally significant due to its adept use of Craftsman bungalow styling and features in its overall design. Therefore, the dwelling appears eligible for designation as a City of Monrovia Landmark under Criterion No. 4.

Additional Resource Attributes:

B11

B12 **References:**

- Monrovia City Directories
- LA County Assessor
- Monrovia Building Permits
- Sanborn Maps

B13 **Remarks**

B14 **Evaluator/ Date** City of Monrovia
 Updated February 2017

