



HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION STAFF REPORT

APPLICATION: HL-130/MA-123

AGENDA ITEM: PH-1

PREPARED BY: Ili Lobaco
Associate Planner

MEETING DATE: April 23, 2014

SUBJECT: Historic Landmark HL-130/Mills Act MA-123
227 North Ivy Avenue

APPLICANT: Carlos Parrague and Shannon Chang
400 Prospect Avenue
Monrovia, CA 91016

REQUEST: Historic landmark designation and approval of a Mills Act Contract

ENVIRONMENTAL DETERMINATION: Categorical Exemption (Class 1)

BACKGROUND: Pursuant to the Historic Preservation Ordinance, the property owners of 227 North Ivy Avenue have filed an application for consideration of historic landmark designation and approval of a Mills Act Contract.



DISCUSSION: The two-story, single family home at 227 North Ivy Avenue was built in 1913. The house is 2,100 square feet in area, has three bedrooms and three bathrooms. A new, detached, two-car garage is located at the rear in the northwest corner of the lot.

The owners have done extensive restoration to the home within the last year. The original porch had previously been enclosed with aluminum slider windows. The rear deck and patio below had also been enclosed with non-period windows.

The new owners opened up the front enclosed porch to expose the original rafters, porch pillars, posts and railings. Non-period windows in the rear were replaced with custom made wood double-hung windows. The interior woodwork was stripped of all paint to expose face grain Douglas fir on the inlaid paneled doors, crown molding, wainscoting, built-ins and cabinets. The original oak floor was repaired and refinished as needed.

A new two-car garage was built in the northwest corner of the parcel that matches the exterior materials of the house. The garage has the same shingle siding, decorative rafter tails and individual pane windows.

Criteria and Guidelines

The Commission must determine the applicable designation criteria for landmark status for the home at 227 North Ivy Avenue. As specified by the Historic Preservation Ordinance, a property must include one or more of the applicable designation criteria. The following criterion is presented for the Commission's consideration.

Criteria Number 4 – *It embodies one or more distinctive characteristics of style, type, period, design, materials, detail, or craftsmanship.*

The property is significant under this criterion as it exemplifies characteristics of a California Craftsman. The two-story home is sheathed in shingle siding with wide, wood trim surrounds around all the windows and doors. The full width front porch has a gabled roof on the southern front (east) facing portion and a flat roof on the northern front facing portion. The gabled area has a unique design that the owner is not certain if it is original or was replaced at a later time. The porch is held by three pillars that have either two or three wood posts that support the porch roof. The porch and roof rafters have a unique design whereby a pair of rafter tails are adjacent to each other and are tiered in an upside-down pattern. Two thirds of the porch extends out beyond the roof overhang to a patio area surrounded by original porch railings and balusters. This porch projection is original as it is shown on the 1927 Sanborn Maps



The front door has six, individual pane, beveled glass windows in the upper third of the door. The front tripartite window has a fixed window in the center that has eight individual pane glass windows. This center window is flanked by two original double hung windows.

The owners submitted a list of the previous owners but no other information was provided about them to verify any significance needed to meet Criteria Number 1 (persons significant in local, regional, state or national history). See attached information submitted.

Staff's determination is that 227 North Ivy Avenue meets Criteria Number 4.

Mills Act Contract

The applicants are also requesting approval of a Mills Act Contract which will provide tax savings for the homeowners. The City will lose a portion of the property tax collected on the property to assure its preservation and enhancement.

Conditions

The house is well restored from public view, so the set standards and conditions will be applied to the house (attached Exhibit C). These include placing a historic plaque on the property and electrical safety inspection within two years. A seismic retrofit will be required within ten years. Because of the uncertainty of whether or not the gable insert over the front porch is original, the Commission has the option to add a condition to the Standards and Conditions requiring that the insert be replaced with an architecturally compatible design.

DPR Form

The property is not part of the current Historic Resources Survey and it is not on the Potential Landmark list. Since Staff is processing this application as a City of Monrovia Historic

Landmark, a status code of 5S3 has been assigned (appears to be individually eligible for local listing or designation through survey evaluation). If the Historic Preservation Commission determines that the house is eligible for listing for local designation and the City Council concurs, then the code will be changed to 5S1 (individual property that is listed or designated locally).

The DPR form is attached for the review, comment and approval of the Commission.

RECOMMENDATION: Staff recommends that the Historic Preservation Commission forward a Nomination Statement to the City Council recommending that the house at 227 North Ivy Avenue be designated as a historic landmark. Approval of a Mills Act Contract with the property owner subject to the attached conditions is also recommended.

If the Historic Preservation Commission concurs with this recommendation and determines that the property meets at least one of the seven criteria for historic landmark designation, and the information provided on the DPR is accurate then, following the public hearing, the following motion is appropriate:

Designate the property at 227 North Ivy Avenue as Historic Landmark Number 130, and approve entering into a Mills Act Contract with the conditions of approval, and so recommend to the City Council.

STANDARDS AND CONDITIONS
227 North Ivy Avenue
Mills Act Contract MA-123

During the term of this agreement, the Historic property shall be subject to the following conditions:

1. All structures on the property shall be kept in excellent condition including exterior walls, windows and roofing.
2. A Certificate of Appropriateness shall be required for all exterior alterations and/or additions to any structure on the property. The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Historic Preservation shall be applied to the property with the exception that standard condition #9 shall allow for additions, exterior alterations or related new construction to match the original house upon approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness (Attachment A).
3. *View Corridor Maintained.* The view corridor enabling the general public to see the house from the public right-of-way shall not be further obscured. The view corridor, including landscaping, hardscape and fencing, shall be maintained.
4. *Landmark Plaque.* The owner(s) shall place a Historic Preservation Commission approved historic plaque on the site within two (2) years of the City Council designation of the historic landmark.
5. *Electrical Safety Inspection.* Within two years of the date of City Council approval, an electrical safety inspection report shall be submitted on the electrical contractor's letter head indicating that the existing service panel meets minimum code and poses no hazardous conditions, GFCI outlets are provided as specified by code, and proper grounding of the panel exists. This condition shall be waived if the building records confirm the upgrading of the service panel or written electrical inspection completed within the last five (5) years is provided.
6. *Seismic Retrofit.* Documentation by either a building permit or building inspector's report must be submitted verifying completion of a seismic retrofit. If the house has not been seismically retrofitted, it shall be retrofitted within ten (10) years of the date of the City Council approval. Seismic retrofit shall be at minimum the bolting of the house to an approved foundation.
7. Exterior Improvements may require a Certificate of Appropriateness.
8. The decorative treatment in the front gable shall be removed within two (2) years.
9. The property owner(s) shall submit to the Planning Division a progress report every two (2) years (for the first ten (10) years of the Contract) listing a response to the conditions of approval (as listed on this document). After the first ten years, a progress report shall be required every five (5) years.

EXHIBIT C

Page 1 of 2 *Resource Name or #: HL-130/MA-123

P1 Other Identifier: 227 North Ivy Avenue

*P2 Location: Not for Publication Unrestricted

a. County: Los Angeles

c. Address: 227 North Ivy Avenue City: Monrovia Zip: 91016

e. Other Locational Data: APN # 8519-028-024

P3a Description: (Describe resource and its major elements. Include design, materials, condition, alterations, size, setting, and boundaries)

The two-story home is sheathed in shingle siding with wood trim surrounds around all the windows and doors. The full width front porch has a gabled roof on the southern front facing portion and flat roof on the northern front facing portion. The porch is held by three pillars that have either two or three wood posts that support the porch roof. The porch and roof rafters have a unique design with a pair of rafter tails are adjacent to each other and are tiered in an upside-down pattern. Two thirds of the porch extends out beyond the roof overhang to a patio area surrounded by original porch railings and balusters.

The front door has six, individual pane, beveled glass windows in the upper third of the door. The front tripartite window has a fixed window in the center that has eight individual pane glass windows. This center window is flanked by two original double hung windows.

P3b Resource Attributes: (List attributes and codes) HP2. Single-family

*P4 Resources Present: Building Structure Object Site District Element of District Other

P5a Photograph



P5b Description of Photo: (view, date)

Front view (east elevation) March 2014

P6 Date Constructed: 1912

Source: County Assessor

P7 Owner and Address:

Carlos Parrague and Shannon Chang
400 Prospect Avenue, Monrovia, CA

P8 Recorded by:

City of Monrovia

P9 Date Recorded: April 2014

P10 Survey Type: Individual

P11 Report Citation:

Attachments: NONE Location Map Sketch Map Continuation Sheet Building, Structure, and Object Record
 Archaeological Record District Record Linear Feature Record Milling Station Record Rock Art Record
 Artifact Record Photograph Record Other (List):

Page 2 of 2 *Resource Name or #: HL-130/MA-123

B1 Historic Name: N/A

B2 Common Name: N/A

B3 Original Use Single-family Residence

B4 Present Use Single-family Residence

B5 Architectural Style Craftsman

B6 Construction History (Construction date, alterations, and date of alterations)

1913 – House built
 1921 – Garage altered (no permits found for initial construction of garage)
 2013 – House interior and exterior restored; two-car, detached garage built; rear 1st story deck built; rear patio with deck above is enclosed to create additional living area.

B7 Moved: No **Date Moved** N/A **Original Location** N/A

B8 Related Features:
 None

B9a Architect: Unknown **b. Builder:** C. B. Steddum

B10 Significance: **Theme:** Architecture **Area:** Monrovia

Period of Significance: 1912 **Property Type** HP2 - Single Family Property
 The property does not exhibit sufficient historical or architectural significance necessary for National Register or California Register designation as an individual resource. However, it is locally significant due to its incorporation of several unique and distinguishing features in its overall design and represents a good example of a Craftsman Bungalow in Monrovia. The house has been restored and maintains a high level of integrity in design, materials and workmanship.

B11 Additional Resource Attributes:

B12 References:
 Picturesque Monrovia by Charles F. Davis;
 Monrovia's Heritage by MOHPF; Monrovia's
 Heritage Volumes #1 and #2 by Monrovia Historical
 Society; Monrovia Centennial Review by Peter
 Ostrye; History of Monrovia by John Wiley; Monrovia
 City Directories 1912-1968; Title Search; LA County
 Assessor; Monrovia City Building Permits

B13 Remarks

B14 Evaluator /Date City of Monrovia / March 2014

